## Actuarial Committee

## Meeting Agenda

| Date | Time | Location | Staff Contact |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| June 16, 2017 | $9: 30$ AM | WCIRB California | David M. Bellusci |
|  |  | 1221 Broadway, Suite 900 |  |
| 1221 Broadway, Suite $900 \cdot$ Oakland, CA |  |  |  |

Released: June 9, 2017

To Members of the Actuarial Committee, WCIRB Members and All Interested Parties:

## I. Approval of Minutes

Meetings held on March 21, 2017 and April 3, 2017
II. Working Group Meeting Summaries

Claims Working Group Meeting held on March 30, 2017
Medical Analytics Working Group Meeting held on April 12, 2017
III. Unfinished Business
A. AC99-05-02: Annual Report on Paid Costs
B. AC16-06-05: Update on Medical Severity Trends by Component
C. AC16-12-03: Adjustment for Wage Level Differences in Classification Ratemaking
D. AC17-03-03: Study of Claim Settlement Rate Adjustments to Loss Development

## IV. New Business

A. AC17-06-01: 3/31/2017 Experience - Review of Methodologies
B. AC17-06-02: 1/1/2018 Regulatory Filing - Experience Rating Plan Values

## V. Matters Arising at Time of Meeting

VI. Next Meeting Date: August 2, 2017
VII. Adjournment

## Antitrust Notice

As members of the Workers' Compensation Insurance Rating Bureau of California, you are bound, when involved in meetings or other activities of the WCIRB California, to limit your actions (and discussions other than social ones) to matters relating to the business of the WCIRB California. Matters that do not relate directly to WCIRB California business should be avoided. Members should particularly avoid discussions or conduct that could be construed as intended to affect competition (or access to markets). Thus, as members, you should not discuss or pursue the business interests of individual insurers or others, including, in particular, the plans of individual members involving, or the possibility or desirability of (a) raising, lowering, or stabilizing prices (premiums or commissions); (b) doing business or refusing to do business with particular, or classes of, insurers, reinsurers, agents, brokers, or insureds, or in particular locales; or (c) potential actions that would affect the availability of products or service either generally or in specific markets or locales.

## Notice

The information in this Agenda was developed by the Workers' Compensation Insurance Rating Bureau of California (WCIRB) for the purpose of assisting the WCIRB Actuarial Committee. The WCIRB cannot make any guarantees if this information is used for any other purpose and the WCIRB shall not be liable for any damages, of any kind, whether direct, indirect, incidental, punitive or consequential, arising from the use of or reliance upon this information for any other purpose.
© 2017 Workers' Compensation Insurance Rating Bureau of California. All rights reserved.
No part of this work may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including, without limitation, photocopying and recording, or by any information storage or retrieval system without the prior written permission of the Workers' Compensation Insurance Rating Bureau of California (WCIRB), unless such copying is expressly permitted in this copyright notice or by federal copyright law. No copyright is claimed in the text of statutes and regulations quoted within this work. Each WCIRB member company, including any registered third party entities, (Company) is authorized to reproduce any part of this work solely for the following purposes in connection with the transaction of workers' compensation insurance: (1) as necessary in connection with Company's required filings with the California Department of Insurance; (2) to incorporate portions of this work, as necessary, into Company manuals distributed at no charge only to Company employees; and (3) to the extent reasonably necessary for the training of Company personnel. Each Company and all agents and brokers licensed to transact workers' compensation insurance in the state of California are authorized to physically reproduce any part of this work for issuance to a prospective or current policyholder upon request at no charge solely for the purpose of transacting workers' compensation insurance and for no other purpose. This reproduction right does not include the right to make any part of this work available on any website or any form of social media.
Workers' Compensation Insurance Rating Bureau of California, WCIRB, WCIRB California, WCIRB Connect, WCIRB Inquiry, X-Mod Direct, eSCAD and the WCIRB California logo (WCIRB Marks) are registered trademarks or service marks of the WCIRB. WCIRB Marks may not be displayed or used in any manner without the WCIRB's prior written permission. Any permitted copying of this work must maintain any and all trademarks and/or service marks on all copies.
To seek permission to use any of the WCIRB Marks or any copyrighted material, please contact the WCIRB at customerservice@wcirb.com.

## Claims Working Group

## Meeting Summary

To: Participants of the Claims Working Group<br>Date: April 6, 2017

## RE: Summary of March 30, 2017 Meeting

## Discussion Topics

At the meeting, the following topics were discussed.

1. First Quarter 2016 Review of Diagnostics

The meeting materials included the WCIRB's diagnostic exhibits that are reviewed by the Actuarial Committee and the Claims Working Group on a semi-annual basis. Among the diagnostics discussed by the Working Group were the following:
a. Indemnity claim settlement ratios continued to increase in the third quarter of calendar year 2016. A Working Group member noted that part of the increase in claim settlement is likely due to independent medical review (IMR) continuing to speed-up the resolution of medical treatment disputes. Another member suggested that a decrease in spinal surgeries following Senate Bill No. 863 (SB 863) could also be contributing to the acceleration. Finally, it was noted that reduced lien activity from the pre-SB 863 period and potentially greater willingness of lien claimants to settle liens may also be a factor in the acceleration.
b. The latest year of data showed average outstanding medical loss per open indemnity claim decreases for many accident years. Several Working Group members suggested that these recent decreases in average case reserves could be attributable to latent recognition of some of the medical cost reductions resulting from SB 863 that had materialized in paid medical loss patterns several years earlier.
c. The number of expedited hearings remained steady in the third and fourth quarters of 2016 after a sharp rise in early 2016. Working Group members noted that the "dual track" of filing for both expedited hearings and independent medical review on medical treatment disputes continues to be used. Also, many expedited hearings are from arising out of employment / course of employment (AOE/COE) questions and there is a growing tendency for defense requested expedited hearings on restricting treatment to be within medical provider networks.
d. Liens increased sharply in the fourth quarter after dropping in the third quarter. The Working Group agreed that this was not unexpected given the effect of the change in the statute of limitations to 18 months and the likelihood that many lien claimants accelerated their lien filings to make the filing prior to the January 1, 2017 effective date of Senate Bill No. 1160 and Assembly Bill No. 1244. Several members noted that there remain significant questions

## Meeting Summary

Date: April 6, 2017
as to eventual effectiveness of the new legislation and lien filing counts should continue to be monitored closely in 2017.
e. Allocated loss adjustment expense (ALAE) trends show signs of moderation and there has been a significant downturn in paid ALAE development. Working Group members suggested this is likely due to similar factors driving the acceleration in claims settlement such as IMR, increased efforts to settle liens and reduced spinal surgeries. It was also suggested that some of this ALAE cost reduction could be attributable to resolution of the certain open SB 863 questions.
2. ALAE Study

Staff notified the Working Group members that the WCIRB's study of rising ALAE was released on January 5, 2017. Staff summarized several of the major findings from the report. It was noted that the report findings supported the significance of a number of the issues raised by the Working Group that helped give rise to the study (e.g., deposition costs, pre-lien disputes).
3. Discussion of Medicare Set-Asides

At the meeting, the Working Group reviewed the comparison of medical development patterns of claims closed by compromise and release to those closed by as stipulated award in which the future medical remained open. It was generally agreed that any further WCIRB research on Medicare set-asides be deferred pending the results of an upcoming CWCI study of the issue. The Working Group also suggested that staff consider whether to collect data on the use of MediCal Special Needs Trusts.
4. Impact of Medical Fraud Enforcement on California Workers' Compensation Costs Staff presented the Working Group with updated information on the amount of medical costs generated by providers that have been indicted for fraud. Staff advised the Working Group that they would continue to monitor these costs.
5. Summary of Current and Pending Legislative, Regulatory, and Judicial Actions as of March 17, 2017
The Working Group reviewed the legislation passed in 2016 and the legislation pending for 2017 included in the meeting materials. Specifically, a Working Group member noted that Assembly Bill No. 44 doesn't include a definition of an act of terrorism or workplace violence which could lead to litigation if the bill is passed. A Working Group member also mentioned Assembly Bill No. 206 related to private residence employees and the potential impact of removing the 52-hour requirement before private residence employees are defined as employees under the Labor Code. Staff advised that workers' compensation insurance for private residence employees is exempt from reporting requirements and the WCIRB therefore does not have data on these costs.

The Working Group also reviewed the regulatory update included in the meeting materials. The Working Group specifically discussed the recent changes to allow for separate billing for records review when the review is above and beyond what is required for a normal evaluation and greater than 30 minutes in duration. The Working Group did not believe this would be a major cost factor but suggested that staff monitor the cost arising from these new codes.

## Meeting Summary

Date: April 6, 2017

The Working Group also discussed the pending drug formulary. A member noted that, in addition to the potential impacts of the pending drug formulary, there may be a significant drop in pharmaceutical costs due to a recent change in Medicare methodology for setting upper limits on Medi-Cal schedule pricing for pharmaceuticals, which is used in California. These changes became effective in April 2016. Finally, a Working Group member noted that the Interpreter and Home Healthcare Fee Schedules required by SB 863 are still pending and may have an impact on costs once they are implemented.

The Working Group reviewed the judicial updates included in the meeting materials. The Working Group discussed the published decision by the Third District Court of Appeals on March 29, 2017 holding that independent medical review (IMR) is constitutional and clarifying that the workers' compensation judge has no ability to rule on a challenge of a utilization review determination other than with respect to timeliness. A Working Group member also mentioned the Fourth District Court of Appeals unpublished decision in Parrent v. WCAB (Pac Bell). In that case, the Court denied review, but issued a decision which held that the IMR process is required irrespective of whether the treatment is provided by a medical provider network (MPN) physician. A writ of review in the case is pending with the California Supreme Court.

## Medical Analytics Working Group

## Meeting Summary

To: Participants of the Medical Analytics Working Group<br>From: Linda Radler<br>Date: April 24, 2017

## RE: Summary of April 12, 2017 Meeting

## Insurer Meeting Participants Were Reminded of the Antitrust Notice

As members of the Workers' Compensation Insurance Rating Bureau of California, you are bound, when involved in meetings or other activities of the WCIRB California, to limit your actions (and discussions other than social ones) to matters relating to the business of the WCIRB California. Matters that do not relate directly to WCIRB California business should be avoided. Members should particularly avoid discussions or conduct that could be construed as intended to affect competition (or access to markets). Thus, as members, you should not discuss or pursue the business interests of individual insurers or others, including, in particular, the plans of individual members involving, or the possibility or desirability of (a) raising, lowering, or stabilizing prices (premiums or commissions); (b) doing business or refusing to do business with particular, or classes of, insurers, reinsurers, agents, brokers, or insureds, or in particular locales; or (c) potential actions that would affect the availability of products or service either generally or in specific markets or locales.

## Discussion Topics

At the meeting, the following topics were discussed.

1. Potential WCIRB Medical Analytics Research Topics

The potential WCIRB Medical Analytics research topic about the cost and care for long-term opioid users was discussed. The Working Group members want to understand what treatment plan changes are occurring associated with declining opioid prescription fills. A Working Group member suggested looking at both chronic users and recent opioid users. The Working Group proposed defining chronic opioid users as those that have a 50 MME (morphine mg equivalent) per day use beyond 90 days. Suggested areas of study included comparison of treatment patterns for more mature claims with more recent claims, for different levels of Permanent Disability Rating, return-to-work rates, psych treatment, transition to maintenance pain drugs such as Gabapentin or Lyrica, differences by age of injured worker, and shifts in treatment modalities such as acupuncture or cognitive behavior therapy. The Working Group discussed using differential changes in case reserves as an overall measure of cost impact.

Other potential research topics raised included further monitoring of cumulative injury claims, benchmark reports by California regions and benchmarks to establish baselines for medical treatment provided in the first 30 days after injury which will have no retrospective utilization review for injuries on or after January 1, 2018 in accordance with Senate Bill No. 1160.

## Meeting Summary

Date: April 24, 2017
2. Discussion of Upcoming Legislation-Research Implications

Staff provided the Working Group with an overview of the current status and timeline for Assembly Bill No. 1124, which authorizes the implementation of a drug formulary. Staff discussed the development of the formulary and summarized the proposed formulary structure and ancillary rules that apply to drugs dispensed for outpatient use on or after July 1, 2017, regardless of the date of injury. Staff noted directives from Title 8, California Code of Regulations, Section 9792.27.3 MTUS Drug Formulary Transition, siting the formulary should be phased in for injured workers who are receiving ongoing drug treatment as to not cause harm by an abrupt change to the course of treatment.

Staff noted that the Special fill and Perioperative fill provisions are exceptions to the physician drug dispensing rule that requires prospective review for all drugs that are dispensed by physicians as written in the proposed regulatory text in Title 8, California Code of Regulations, Section 9792.27.8 Physician-Dispensed Drugs.

Staff reviewed the first economic impact figures released by the Division of Workers' Compensation showing an estimated $\$ 23$ million savings in the first year after implementation of the drug formulary. The Working Group was informed of the various steps of the WCIRB cost analysis process that will begin once the final formulary is available. Staff shared with the Working Group several issues that may impact the analysis including changes to Medi-Cal payment rates, which impact the Pharmacy Fee Schedule and future prescribing pattern uncertainty after implementation of the formulary. The Working Group was reminded that the data for the release of the final formulary is currently set for July 1, 2017, but delays associated with the regulatory process may occur.

Staff informed the Working Group that declining pharmaceutical payments have been observed in recent quarters. A Working Group member from the California Workers' Compensation Institute (CWCI) explained that because of significant Medi-Cal payment rate changes implemented as of April 2016, upon which the Workers' Compensation Pharmacy Fee Schedule is based, the CWCI estimates a $19 \%$ potential drug savings and this study will not be released for a few months after they further refine their analysis with 2016 data.
3. 2016 Senate Bill No. 863 Retrospective Report - Copy Service Fee Schedule Results and Other Medical Components through June 2016
Staff presented the Working Group with an analysis of the first 12 months of copy service fee data. Staff reminded the Working Group that the Copy Service Fee Schedule went into effect July 1, 2015. Staff informed the Working Group that the data showed a wide variety in adoption rates across insurers. Staff informed the Working Group that $\$ 11$ million was paid for copy services in the first year since the Copy Service Fee Schedule was adopted.

Staff reviewed the November 2016 Cost Monitoring Report with the Working Group. A Working Group member asked about the increase in medical-legal costs. Staff noted that the increase in medical-legal costs was driven by an increase in higher complexity Medical Legal codes. The Working Group discussed whether or not increasing cumulative injury filings was a contributor to the increase in medical-legal costs. Staff agreed to investigate this issue.

## Meeting Summary

Date: April 24, 2017
4. 4. Impact of Medical Fraud Enforcement in California Workers' Compensation Staff presented the Working Group with an updated analysis of costs associated with providers indicted for workers' compensation fraud. Staff noted that some of the reduction in spinal surgeries was associated with these providers. A Working Group member asked whether indictments were associated with the decrease of opioid prescriptions. Staff agreed to investigate this issue.
5. Insurer Medical Benchmark Report Enhancement - Medical Trend by Accident Year Staff presented the updates to the benchmark report to the Working Group showing medical trend data by accident year and noted this report will be part of the next quarterly and future benchmark reports. Staff also presented some sample benchmark reports with various graphic representations. The Working Group reviewed the format of the report and provided feedback. Staff asked the Working Group members to provide feedback on the medical trend data by accident year format.
6. Impact of the Affordable Care Act (ACA) on Workers' Compensation Staff informed the Working Group that the WCIRB Impact of ACA on Workers' Compensation study is planned for later in 2017. The Working Group was informed about a recent study by Glenn Shor, Ph.D (http://laborcenter.berkeley.edu/which-california-industries-would-be-most-affected-by-aca-repeal-and-cuts-to-medi-cal/).

The Working Group was informed that the next meeting would likely be scheduled for late July or early August.

Actuarial Committee
Meeting Agenda for June 16, 2017

## Item AC99-05-02

## Annual Report on Paid Costs

Section 11759.1 of the California Insurance Code requires the WCIRB to summarize various insurer premium, loss, and expense information from each calendar year and submit a report to the Governor and Legislature by June of the following year. A draft summary of the WCIRB's report for calendar year 2016 will be presented at the meeting.

Actuarial Committee
Meeting Agenda for June 16, 2017

## Item AC16-06-05 <br> Update on Medical Severity Trends by Component

At least annually, the Committee reviews a summary of changes in paid per transaction and paid transactions per claim in six-month calendar period intervals by medical component. An update to that analysis with medical transaction information through December 31, 2016 will be presented at the meeting.

## Item AC16-12-03 Adjustment for Wage Level Differences in Classification Ratemaking

At the December 6, 2016 meeting, the Committee reviewed a study of the impact of average wage level changes by industry that showed the impacts varied significantly by industry. At that meeting, the Committee adopted enhancements to the classification relativities computation methodology to reflect these differences in the payroll and losses underlying each classification's selected loss to payroll ratio. Specifically, the enhancements included an adjustment applied to the payroll reported for each classification for each policy year for that classification's projected relative wage level changes through the policy year in which the classification relativities would be in effect. A similar adjustment is also to be applied for changes in wage levels by classification that impact indemnity benefits. These enhancements were also reviewed by the Classification and Rating Committee at the March 14, 2017 meeting.

The 2018 classification relativities have been computed based on a methodology which included the new enhancements adopted by the Actuarial Committee. These relativities were reviewed and accepted by the Classification and Rating Committee at the June 1, 2017 meeting for inclusion in the January 1, 2018 Regulatory Filing. Exhibit 1 shows the impact of the new enhancements on the 2018 classification relativities. The overall impact was modest for most classifications.
III-C-2
WCIRB California®

## Item AC17-03-03 <br> Study of Claim Settlement Rate Adjustments to Loss Development

At the March 21, 2017 meeting, the Committee reviewed staff's initial analysis of the claim settlement rate adjustment methodology that addressed various issues discussed by the Committee at the August 3, 2016 meeting. During the discussion, the Committee requested staff provide follow-up analysis in several areas. Staff's follow-up analysis is summarized below.

Impact of Changes in Claim Settlement Rates by Injury Type
At the March 21, 2017 meeting, the Committee noted that recent changes in claim settlement rates have differed significantly by injury type. However, it was also noted that a preliminary analysis of an approach that adjusts separately by type of injury did not significantly improve the methodology. Staff agreed to continue to develop the alternative claim settlement rate-adjusted loss development methodologies by injury type and determine if a more refined settlement method separated by injury type provides a significant improvement over the current method.

In that aggregate financial data is reported to the WCIRB for all indemnity injury types combined, unit statistical report (USR) data was used to conduct the study since USR data is reported to the WCIRB at the claim level and includes information such as claim status and injury type. A similar increasing trend in recent claim settlement rates that has been observed in the aggregate financial data was also observed in the summary of permanent disability claims based on USR data, as shown in Exhibit 1. Conversely, as also shown in Exhibit 1, recent temporary-only and medical-only claim settlement rates have been generally consistent. As a result, staff explored a partial claim settlement rate adjustment method which applies a claim settlement rate adjustment to permanent disability claims only and recombines them with reported (unadjusted) losses on temporary-only and medical-only claims.

The claim settlement rate adjustment method applied to permanent disability claims is consistent with the current method applied to all indemnity claims. The assumptions applied to the aggregate data under the current claim settlement method were validated using USR permanent disability claims. The first assumption in the method reviewed by staff was whether to develop the indemnity claim counts to ultimate using the latest year reporting pattern. For the adjustment applied to permanent disability claims, staff selected 3-year weighted average age-to-age factors due to the additional volatility inherent in permanent disability claim reporting patterns, which is consistent with the assumptions used to project ultimate permanent disability claim counts in other studies.

The current claim settlement adjustment methodology also assumes there is a log-linear relationship between the indemnity claim settlement rate and the average paid per closed indemnity claim. The adjusted average paid per closed indemnity claim is therefore based on a log-linear interpolation between indemnity claim settlement rates and closed claim severities at two maturities for that accident year and using the "current" indemnity claim settlement rate. This assumption was validated for the analysis of permanent disability claims by plotting the ultimate permanent disability claim settlement rate against the log of the average paid indemnity or medical per closed permanent disability claim for select accident years along with the approximate line fit through those data points. The results of this analysis were reasonable and consistent with the analysis reviewed by the Committee for all indemnity injury types combined at the March 21, 2017 meeting. As a result, the adjustment made to partial payments on closed and open claims is consistent with the current claim settlement method.

While adjusting for the settlement rates based on injury type, the partial claim settlement rate adjustment method did not directly address changes in the proportion of claims transitioning between temporary-only and permanent disability. Staff assumed the impact of these changes to not be material inasmuch as
relative proportions of projected ultimate temporary-only and permanent disability claims have been generally consistent over the last several years.

In order to compute the final adjusted age-to-age factors, the adjusted permanent disability indemnity payments were added to the reported (unadjusted) indemnity payments on temporary-only claims while the adjusted permanent disability medical payments were added to the reported (unadjusted) medical payments on temporary-only and medical-only claims. Exhibits 2.1 and 2.2 compare for indemnity and medical, respectively, the current claim settlement adjustment method, the current claim settlement adjustment method applied to each injury type (permanent disability, temporary-only and medical-only) separately, and the partial claim settlement rate adjustment method (adjusted permanent disability and unadjusted temporary-only and medical-only).

The claim settlement adjustment method adjusting each injury type and the partial claim settlement adjustment method return generally similar results and both produce results comparable to the current claim settlement adjustment method. Staff examined potential reasons for this result. Table 1 compares the distribution of claim counts by injury type at first report level and sixth report level. Permanent disability claims account for approximately $33 \%$ of indemnity claims while temporary-only claims account for approximately $67 \%$ at first report level and while both are approximately $50 \%$ at sixth report level. With respect to all claims, permanent disability claims account for approximately $12 \%$ of claims at first report level and approximately $17 \%$ at sixth report level.

| Table 1- Distribution of Claim Counts by Injury Type |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Data as of Policy Year 2014 1st |  |  |  |  |
| Method | Indemnity at 1st | Indemnity at 6th | All Claims at 1st | All Claims at 6th |
| Permanent | $33 \%$ | $51 \%$ | $12 \%$ | $17 \%$ |
| Temporary | $67 \%$ | $49 \%$ | $24 \%$ | $16 \%$ |
| Medical-Only | - | - | $64 \%$ | $66 \%$ |

When comparing the partial claim settlement adjustment method to the current claim settlement adjustment method, the results may be similar in that while a more significant adjustment is made to the permanent disability claims, this has an overall smaller impact on the results since the number of permanent disability claims are relatively small compared to other injury types. Conversely, a less significant adjustment is applied to all indemnity claims in the current approach, but more claims and losses are adjusted. As a result, staff does not recommend any refinement to the current approach to address differences in claim settlement rate changes by injury type.

## Impact of Changing Claim Settlement Rates on Tail Development

The current adjustment for changes in claim settlement rates only adjusts the period in which the settlement rates are changing and only for distortions in paid loss development created by payments on the additional or fewer claims settling during this period. The proportion of claims settled at a point in time or, conversely, the proportion remaining open directly impacts future paid loss development. Changes in the rate claims are settled that result in significant differences between an accident year's proportion of open claims and the proportion underlying its projected development factor can distort the projected ultimate losses for that accident year.

Staff analyzed this potential issue by comparing accident year changes in claim settlement rates in a period to differences between the projected and actual development for the accident year after that period. Exhibit 3 shows accident year arithmetic changes in reported indemnity claim settlement ratios from 1989 through 2010. Changes greater than $1.0 \%$ or $1.5 \%$ in absolute value are highlighted for emphasis. This information forms the basis from which changes in development patterns will be compared. In the case of a significant decrease in indemnity claim settlement rates, future paid development is expected to be higher. In the cases of a significant increase in indemnity claim settlement
rates, future paid development is expected to be lower. Indemnity claim settlement rates generally decreased during the study period though several instances of increases were observed.

Exhibits 4.1 and 4.2 show reported paid indemnity and medical age-to-age factors, respectively. For this analysis, paid development was compared in two ways. The first method compares the projected calendar year development factor for the accident year at the time the claim settlement rate change was observed to the actual development for the accident year (Exhibits 5 and 6). This approach best approximates the actual differences between projected and actual development but can be impacted by other system changes that have occurred over time and may be unrelated to the change in claim settlement rates observed at the earlier point in time. The second method compares the development for the prior accident year to that for the accident year in which the claim settlement rate change occurred (Exhibits 7 and 8). This approach may provide a more direct analysis of how the change in the claim settlement rates affects future development but does not represent the actual development projected for the accident year at that time.

Exhibits 5.1 and 5.2 show for indemnity and medical, respectively, the differences between the projected (latest calendar year) development factor for an accident year and the actual development that emerged for that period. Differences greater than $0.5 \%$ in absolute value are highlighted for emphasis. Paid loss development generally increased during the study period and was significantly impacted by various system changes, such as the 2002 through 2004 reforms. The lower sections of Exhibits 5.1 and 5.2 show the correlation coefficient between the changes in indemnity claim settlement rates (Exhibit 3) and the differences between projected and actual paid loss development that occurred after the claim settlement rate change. For claim settlement rate changes at earlier maturities, the correlation coefficients are generally weak. However, there generally is some significant negative correlation between these measures at later maturities.

Exhibits 6.1 through 6.3 show the relationship between the claim settlement rate change and the change in paid development based on the direction of the change. Exhibit 6.1 shows these relationships for development through 84 months (the current stopping point of the claim settlement rate adjustment methodology). In most instances, the difference in the development factor is in the opposite direction of the change in claim settlement rate, which is consistent with the assumptions in the loss development adjustment. The extent to which the current adjustment addresses these differences is being researched by staff and will be presented at the meeting.

Exhibit 6.2 shows the comparison to development from 84 months to 108 months and Exhibit 6.3 shows the comparison to development from 84 months to 228 months. The direction of the change in claim settlement rate at the earlier maturities is less indicative of the direction of the difference between the projected and actual tail development for the accident year, even when the settlement rate shift was more than $1.5 \%$.

Exhibits 7.1 and 7.2 show for indemnity and medical, respectively, changes in accident year to accident year paid development. Differences greater than $0.5 \%$ in absolute value are highlighted for emphasis. The lower sections of Exhibits 7.1 and 7.2 show the correlation coefficient between the changes in indemnity claim settlement rates (Exhibit 3) and accident year paid loss development. No significant negative correlation between these measures was found.

Exhibits 8.1 through 8.3 show, for the analysis of accident year to accident year changes in paid loss development, analogous information to that shown in Exhibits 6.1 through 6.3. Significant changes in claim settlement rates did not appear to be a consistent indicator in the year-to-year changes in accident year paid loss development.

## Other Issues

At the March 21, 2017 meeting, the Committee reviewed the primary assumptions underlying the current adjustment for changes in claim settlement rates. Among the assumptions reviewed were the severities that are applied to the claims transitioning from opened to closed (or vice versa) as a result of the adjustment. The appropriateness of these severities were reviewed in part by comparing the average paid amounts applied to open and closed claims in the adjustment to actual paid severities on claims closing or remaining open within a given year based on unit statistical data "tracked" across report levels. This comparison is included as Exhibits 9.1 (for indemnity) and 9.2 (for medical). At the meeting, a Committee member suggested sensitivity testing these severities by substituting them with those derived from the "tracked" claim data.

Exhibit 10 shows projected paid age-to-age factors based on unit statistical data. Section A of Exhibit 10 shows unadjusted factors, while Section $B$ shows factors adjusted for changes in claim settlement rates based on the WCIRB's standard approach. Section C of Exhibit 10 shows factors adjusted for changes in claim settlement rates using transition claim severities based on the "tracked" claim status at the prior report level (lower bound) shown in Exhibits 9.1 and 9.2. For example, the severity for claims transitioning from open to closed at $2^{\text {nd }}$ report level would use the severity of claims open at $1^{\text {st }}$ but closed at $2^{\text {nd }}$. Section D of Exhibit 10 shows factors adjusted for changes in claim settlement rates using transition claim severities based on the "tracked" claim status at the current report level (upper bound) shown in Exhibits 9.1 and 9.2. For example, the severity for claims transitioning from closed to open at $2^{\text {nd }}$ would use the severity of claims open at both $2^{\text {nd }}$ and $3^{\text {rd }}$ report levels.

The adjusted age-to-age factors for these alternative approaches are compared to the standard approach on Exhibit 10. Other than for the very earliest age-to-age factor ( $1^{\text {st }}$ to $2^{\text {nd }}$ ), the alternative approaches produce adjusted factors consistent with the standard approach. For the $1^{\text {st }}$-to- $2^{\text {nd }}$ factor, the sensitivity analysis at the lower bound is somewhat ambiguous since there is no information available prior to the $1^{\text {st }}$ report level. The analysis at the upper bound for the $1^{\text {st }}-t o-2^{\text {nd }}$ factor can also distorted as a result of this period involving the greatest incremental change in claim settlement rates and that claims closed during this period tend to be much smaller than claims closed at later periods. Nonetheless, the factors based on the current adjustment are approximately midway between those based on the sensitivity analysis.

Ultimate Claim Settlement Rates by Injury Type

| Permanent DisabilityAccident |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Year | 1 | $\underline{2}$ | $\underline{3}$ | 4 | $\underline{5}$ | $\underline{6}$ |
| 2005 | 5.79\% | 21.97\% | 42.05\% | 57.82\% | 67.79\% | 74.35\% |
| 2006 | 6.30\% | 22.94\% | 43.12\% | 57.81\% | 67.09\% | 73.95\% |
| 2007 | 5.88\% | 23.30\% | 42.50\% | 56.57\% | 66.43\% | 74.73\% |
| 2008 | 5.93\% | 23.32\% | 42.05\% | 56.34\% | 67.95\% | 76.76\% |
| 2009 | 5.90\% | 22.87\% | 41.31\% | 56.90\% | 68.74\% | 77.09\% |
| 2010 | 7.06\% | 24.58\% | 44.54\% | 60.73\% | 71.69\% |  |
| 2011 | 7.75\% | 26.70\% | 47.45\% | 62.85\% |  |  |
| 2012 | 9.04\% | 30.05\% | 50.61\% |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 10.20\% | 31.96\% |  |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 10.83\% |  |  |  |  |  |
| Temporary-Only |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Accident | Evaluated as of (Report Level): |  |  |  |  |  |
| Year | 1 | $\underline{2}$ | $\underline{3}$ | 4 | $\underline{5}$ | $\underline{6}$ |
| 2005 | 63.30\% | 79.25\% | 86.77\% | 89.75\% | 95.04\% | 96.53\% |
| 2006 | 66.31\% | 82.97\% | 89.12\% | 94.09\% | 96.05\% | 97.03\% |
| 2007 | 67.41\% | 82.84\% | 91.04\% | 94.22\% | 95.84\% | 97.03\% |
| 2008 | 67.60\% | 83.60\% | 89.77\% | 93.04\% | 95.31\% | 96.59\% |
| 2009 | 67.53\% | 81.50\% | 87.84\% | 92.01\% | 94.28\% | 95.77\% |
| 2010 | 65.29\% | 79.00\% | 86.36\% | 90.74\% | 93.43\% |  |
| 2011 | 63.82\% | 78.12\% | 85.68\% | 90.28\% |  |  |
| 2012 | 63.09\% | 77.99\% | 86.02\% |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 61.71\% | 77.87\% |  |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 63.42\% |  |  |  |  |  |
| Medical-Only |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Accident | Evaluated as of (Report Level): |  |  |  |  |  |
| Year | 1 | $\underline{2}$ | $\underline{3}$ | 4 | $\underline{5}$ | $\underline{6}$ |
| 2005 | 81.82\% | 87.12\% | 88.51\% | 89.62\% | 96.55\% | 98.22\% |
| 2006 | 85.24\% | 90.31\% | 92.17\% | 97.04\% | 98.27\% | 98.88\% |
| 2007 | 86.22\% | 91.61\% | 96.52\% | 97.73\% | 98.38\% | 99.09\% |
| 2008 | 87.47\% | 95.37\% | 96.84\% | 97.76\% | 98.64\% | 99.00\% |
| 2009 | 90.05\% | 94.97\% | 96.39\% | 97.97\% | 98.52\% | 98.73\% |
| 2010 | 89.59\% | 94.85\% | 97.23\% | 97.99\% | 98.30\% |  |
| 2011 | 89.08\% | 95.64\% | 97.33\% | 97.90\% |  |  |
| 2012 | 90.36\% | 95.97\% | 97.31\% |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 90.31\% | 95.97\% |  |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 90.47\% |  |  |  |  |  |

# Indemnity Development Factors by Claim Settlement Rate Adjustment Method Based on Unit Statistical Reported Data 

|  |  | Indemnity Development Evaluated as of (Report Level): |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Selected | $\underline{\text { Method }^{1}}$ | $\underline{1-2}$ | $\underline{2-3}$ | $\underline{3-4}$ | $\underline{4-5}$ | $\underline{5-6}$ | $\underline{\text { Cumulative }}$ |
| 3-Year Avg | Combined | 1.940 | 1.375 | 1.182 | 1.109 | 1.068 | 3.738 |
| 3-Year Avg | Injury Type | 1.935 | 1.371 | 1.182 | 1.108 | 1.066 | 3.704 |
| 3-Year Avg | Partial Adj. by IT | 1.937 | 1.371 | 1.182 | 1.108 | 1.065 | 3.704 |


|  |  | Percent Change to Combined Claim Settlement Adj. Method |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Selected | $\underline{\text { Method }}$ | $\underline{1-2}$ | $\underline{2-3}$ | $\underline{3-4}$ | $\underline{4-5}$ | $\underline{5-6}$ |
| 3-Year Avg | Injury Type | $-0.28 \%$ | $-0.25 \%$ | $\underline{-0.06 \%}$ | $\underline{-0.15 \%}$ | $\underline{-0.18 \%}$ | $\underline{-0.90 \%}$ |
| 3-Year Avg | Partial Adj. by IT | $-0.20 \%$ | $-0.30 \%$ | $-0.01 \%$ | $-0.16 \%$ | $-0.24 \%$ | $-0.89 \%$ |


| Selected | Method | Indemnity Development Evaluated as of (Report Level) |  |  |  |  | Cumulative |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | 1-2 | 2-3 | 3-4 | 4-5 | 5-6 |  |
| Latest Yr | Combined | 1.911 | 1.360 | 1.175 | 1.107 | 1.065 | 3.600 |
| Latest Yr | Injury Type | 1.911 | 1.360 | 1.176 | 1.107 | 1.066 | 3.605 |
| Latest Yr | Partial Adj. by IT | 1.914 | 1.360 | 1.177 | 1.106 | 1.064 | 3.606 |


| Selected | Method | Percent Change to Combined Claim Settlement Adj. Method |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | 1-2 | 2-3 | 3-4 | 4-5 | 5-6 | Cumulative |
| Latest Yr | Injury Type | -0.04\% | -0.01\% | 0.12\% | 0.03\% | 0.03\% | 0.13\% |
| Latest Yr | Partial Adj. by IT | 0.16\% | -0.02\% | 0.20\% | -0.05\% | -0.14\% | 0.15\% |

[^0]
# Medical Development Factors by Claim Settlement Rate Adjustment Method Based on Unit Statistical Reported Data 

| Selected | Method ${ }^{1}$ | Medical Development Evaluated as of (Report Level): |  |  |  |  | Cumulative |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | 1-2 | 2-3 | 3-4 | 4-5 | 5-6 |  |
| 3-Year Avg | Combined | 1.676 | 1.340 | 1.196 | 1.125 | 1.087 | 3.284 |
| 3-Year Avg | Injury Type | 1.675 | 1.335 | 1.190 | 1.121 | 1.083 | 3.234 |
| 3-Year Avg | Partial Adj. by IT | 1.677 | 1.335 | 1.192 | 1.121 | 1.083 | 3.238 |


| Selected | Method | Percent Change to Combined Claim Settlement Adj. Method |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | 1-2 | 2-3 | 3-4 | 4-5 | 5-6 | Cumulative |
| 3-Year Avg | Injury Type | -0.05\% | -0.38\% | -0.43\% | -0.31\% | -0.36\% | -1.53\% |
| 3-Year Avg | Partial Adj. by IT | 0.03\% | -0.36\% | -0.33\% | -0.32\% | -0.41\% | -1.39\% |


| Selected | Method | Medical Development Evaluated as of (Report Level): |  |  |  |  | Cumulative |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | 1-2 | 2-3 | 3-4 | 4-5 | 5-6 |  |
| Latest Yr | Combined | 1.656 | 1.325 | 1.179 | 1.115 | 1.076 | 3.105 |
| Latest Yr | Injury Type | 1.652 | 1.322 | 1.178 | 1.113 | 1.074 | 3.077 |
| Latest Yr | Partial Adj. by IT | 1.655 | 1.322 | 1.178 | 1.113 | 1.072 | 3.077 |


|  |  | Percent Change to Combined Claim Settlement Adj. Method |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Selected | $\underline{\text { Method }}$ | $\underline{1-2}$ | $\underline{2-3}$ | $\underline{3-4}$ | $\underline{4-5}$ | $\underline{5-6}$ | $\underline{\text { Cumulative }}$ |
| Latest Yr | Injury Type | $-0.24 \%$ | $-0.22 \%$ | $-0.12 \%$ | $-0.11 \%$ | $-0.22 \%$ | $-0.91 \%$ |
| Latest Yr | Partial Adj. by IT | $-0.09 \%$ | $-0.23 \%$ | $-0.07 \%$ | $-0.16 \%$ | $-0.35 \%$ | $-0.89 \%$ |

[^1]
## Change in Reported Indemnity Claim Settlement Ratio ${ }^{1}$

| $\underline{\mathrm{AY}}$ | $\underline{12}$ | $\underline{24}$ | $\underline{36}$ | $\underline{48}$ | $\underline{60}$ | $\underline{72}$ |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| 1989 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1990 | $-3.4 \%$ | $-3.8 \%$ | $-2.7 \%$ | $-1.8 \%$ | $-0.7 \%$ | $-0.4 \%$ |
| 1991 | $-8.4 \%$ | $-4.7 \%$ | $-2.7 \%$ | $-1.1 \%$ | $-1.2 \%$ | $-0.2 \%$ |
| 1992 | $2.1 \%$ | $4.2 \%$ | $3.8 \%$ | $2.1 \%$ | $1.8 \%$ | $0.6 \%$ |
| 1993 | $4.0 \%$ | $6.8 \%$ | $4.0 \%$ | $2.7 \%$ | $0.4 \%$ | $0.0 \%$ |
| 1994 | $2.4 \%$ | $-0.1 \%$ | $0.8 \%$ | $-1.2 \%$ | $-0.3 \%$ | $-0.3 \%$ |
| 1995 | $-1.3 \%$ | $-0.5 \%$ | $-2.6 \%$ | $-0.6 \%$ | $-0.9 \%$ | $-1.6 \%$ |
| 1996 | $2.0 \%$ | $-2.4 \%$ | $-0.6 \%$ | $-1.3 \%$ | $-2.5 \%$ | $-1.4 \%$ |
| 1997 | $-6.6 \%$ | $-1.9 \%$ | $-0.8 \%$ | $-1.6 \%$ | $0.0 \%$ | $-1.0 \%$ |
| 1998 | $-0.3 \%$ | $-1.1 \%$ | $-3.4 \%$ | $-1.5 \%$ | $-1.6 \%$ | $-1.0 \%$ |
| 1999 | $-2.3 \%$ | $-3.7 \%$ | $-0.6 \%$ | $-1.9 \%$ | $-1.7 \%$ | $-1.0 \%$ |
| 2000 | $-1.5 \%$ | $-0.6 \%$ | $-3.4 \%$ | $-2.8 \%$ | $-1.9 \%$ | $-1.1 \%$ |
| 2001 | $-2.0 \%$ | $-4.2 \%$ | $-4.6 \%$ | $-3.0 \%$ | $-1.7 \%$ | $-1.0 \%$ |
| 2002 | $-0.6 \%$ | $-1.0 \%$ | $-0.3 \%$ | $0.5 \%$ | $2.4 \%$ | $0.4 \%$ |
| 2003 | $-0.3 \%$ | $-1.2 \%$ | $0.7 \%$ | $2.4 \%$ | $0.3 \%$ | $0.3 \%$ |
| 2004 | $1.6 \%$ | $3.9 \%$ | $4.2 \%$ | $2.2 \%$ | $1.4 \%$ | $0.5 \%$ |
| 2005 | $1.7 \%$ | $3.4 \%$ | $2.5 \%$ | $1.7 \%$ | $0.5 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ |
| 2006 | $0.8 \%$ | $1.0 \%$ | $1.0 \%$ | $0.0 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ | $0.2 \%$ |
| 2007 | $0.8 \%$ | $-0.5 \%$ | $-1.0 \%$ | $-1.1 \%$ | $-1.2 \%$ | $-1.0 \%$ |
| 2008 | $0.3 \%$ | $-1.7 \%$ | $-1.7 \%$ | $-1.4 \%$ | $-1.0 \%$ | $0.4 \%$ |
| 2009 | $-0.8 \%$ | $-1.8 \%$ | $-1.8 \%$ | $-1.3 \%$ | $-0.1 \%$ | $-0.4 \%$ |
| 2010 | $0.1 \%$ | $0.5 \%$ | $0.6 \%$ | $1.6 \%$ | $1.4 \%$ | $1.3 \%$ |


| Number of observations of claim settlement rate change: |  |  |  |  |  |  | All |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Downward | 11 | 15 | 13 | 14 | 13 | 12 | 78 |
| Upward | 10 | 6 | 8 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 48 |

${ }^{1}$ For example, the value for 2010 at 12 months is equal to the arithemetic difference between the reported indemnity claim settlement rate for 2010 at 12 months and the reported indemnity claim settlement rate for 2009 at 12 months.

Red - Arithmetic change in claim settlement rates by less than -1.0\% (lighter color) or less than 1.5\% (darker color).

Blue - Arithmetic change in claim settlement rates by more than $1.0 \%$ (lighter color) or more than 1.5\% (darker color).

Source: WCIRB aggregate financial data for December 31 evaluations.

|  |
| :---: |
|  |  |

Paid Indemnity Loss Development Factors

|  |
| :---: |
|  |
|  |
|  <br>  |
|  |


|  |
| :---: |
|  |  |


त्तِ|


$\underset{\sim}{\text { ond }}$


Paid Medical Loss Development Factors





Difference in Projected Calendar Year Indemnity Paid Development
Compared to Actual ${ }^{1}$

| AY | 12-84 | 24-84 | 36-84 | 48-84 | 60-84 | 72-84 | 84-108 | 84-228 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1990 | -0.7\% | -4.3\% | -2.4\% | -0.4\% | -0.2\% | -0.1\% | -0.8\% | -2.8\% |
| 1991 | -13.2\% | -11.7\% | -3.7\% | -1.8\% | -0.8\% | -0.4\% | -0.6\% | -2.0\% |
| 1992 | -7.8\% | -4.8\% | -4.9\% | -1.9\% | -0.6\% | -0.4\% | 0.0\% | -1.7\% |
| 1993 | 0.0\% | -1.8\% | -2.2\% | -1.9\% | -0.6\% | -0.1\% | 0.7\% | 1.1\% |
| 1994 | -2.2\% | -6.3\% | -5.2\% | -2.4\% | -1.1\% | -0.2\% | 1.1\% | 3.7\% |
| 1995 | 3.3\% | -4.2\% | -3.4\% | -0.7\% | 0.6\% | 0.5\% | 1.1\% | 3.2\% |
| 1996 | -2.9\% | -2.5\% | -1.3\% | 1.3\% | 1.2\% | 0.7\% | 1.4\% | 4.9\% |
| 1997 | 4.8\% | 0.0\% | 2.0\% | 2.8\% | 2.2\% | 1.3\% | 2.0\% | 5.5\% |
| 1998 | 4.8\% | 6.3\% | 6.2\% | 4.4\% | 3.2\% | 1.5\% | 2.5\% | 8.0\% |
| 1999 | 16.3\% | 13.5\% | 9.4\% | 6.4\% | 3.5\% | 1.5\% | 2.4\% |  |
| 2000 | 12.8\% | 12.7\% | 9.3\% | 4.8\% | 2.7\% | 1.0\% | 1.8\% |  |
| 2001 | 11.4\% | 10.3\% | 5.9\% | 1.6\% | 0.3\% | 0.2\% | 0.5\% |  |
| 2002 | 3.0\% | 1.7\% | -0.4\% | -1.1\% | -0.5\% | -0.1\% | 0.2\% |  |
| 2003 | -18.2\% | -12.8\% | -7.6\% | -3.6\% | -2.0\% | -0.8\% | -0.2\% |  |
| 2004 | -34.4\% | -24.1\% | -11.1\% | -4.9\% | -1.9\% | -0.5\% | 1.4\% |  |
| 2005 | -21.9\% | -16.7\% | -6.6\% | -2.4\% | -0.4\% | 0.4\% | 2.6\% |  |
| 2006 | 7.9\% | 3.0\% | 1.8\% | 3.5\% | 2.7\% | 1.5\% | 2.1\% |  |
| 2007 | 8.9\% | 7.5\% | 5.0\% | 4.2\% | 3.0\% | 1.5\% | 1.9\% |  |
| 2008 | 13.0\% | 12.2\% | 9.5\% | 6.4\% | 3.2\% | 1.3\% | 1.0\% |  |
| 2009 | 21.8\% | 16.1\% | 11.2\% | 6.7\% | 3.5\% | 1.7\% |  |  |
| 2010 | 12.8\% | 9.7\% | 6.3\% | 3.3\% | 2.3\% | 1.0\% |  |  |


| Number of observations of difference in development factor: |  |  |  |  |  |  | All |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Downward | 8 | 10 | 11 | 10 | 9 | 8 | 56 |
| Upward | 13 | 11 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 70 |

Correlation between claim settlement ratio change at age $X$ to development difference at $X$-to- 84 :
$\begin{array}{llllll}-0.1334 & -0.3773 & -0.5782 & -0.6163 & -0.4528 & -0.3529\end{array}$
Correlation between claim settlement ratio change at age $X$ to development difference at 84-to-108:

| 0.2291 | 0.1823 | 0.0514 | -0.1662 | -0.2570 | -0.3629 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

Correlation between claim settlement ratio change at age $X$ to development difference at 84-to-228:

$$
\begin{array}{cccccc}
0.1859 & -0.0444 & -0.2299 & -0.3339 & -0.4564 & -0.6674
\end{array}
$$

${ }^{1}$ For example, the value of $12.8 \%$ for 2010 at 12 -to- 84 months is equal to the difference in the projected loss development factor at 12-to-84 months as of 12/31/2010 to the actual loss development factor at 12-to-84 months that emerged for accident year 2010.

Yellow Difference in development factors by less than -0.5\%.

Green Difference in development factors by more than $0.5 \%$.

Source: WCIRB aggregate financial data for December 31 evaluations.

Difference in Projected Calendar Year Medical Paid Development Compared to Actual ${ }^{1}$

| AY | 12-84 | 24-84 | 36-84 | 48-84 | 60-84 | 72-84 | 84-108 | 84-228 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1989 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1990 | 9.7\% | 0.6\% | -0.6\% | -0.1\% | 0.3\% | 0.3\% | 0.0\% | -6.0\% |
| 1991 | -11.2\% | -4.1\% | -0.8\% | 0.3\% | 0.5\% | 0.3\% | -0.6\% | -3.2\% |
| 1992 | -12.9\% | -2.9\% | 0.3\% | 0.7\% | 0.5\% | 0.0\% | 0.3\% | -0.6\% |
| 1993 | -5.4\% | -0.7\% | 1.3\% | 1.8\% | 1.5\% | 1.0\% | 1.8\% | 5.9\% |
| 1994 | 10.0\% | 5.8\% | 4.1\% | 3.8\% | 2.5\% | 1.2\% | 3.0\% | 10.9\% |
| 1995 | 16.8\% | 11.8\% | 7.6\% | 6.3\% | 4.5\% | 2.4\% | 4.4\% | 16.0\% |
| 1996 | 18.5\% | 15.7\% | 13.0\% | 8.9\% | 5.6\% | 2.7\% | 5.2\% | 17.4\% |
| 1997 | 24.8\% | 20.0\% | 17.0\% | 11.7\% | 7.3\% | 3.6\% | 5.4\% | 17.3\% |
| 1998 | 29.6\% | 25.7\% | 19.8\% | 14.0\% | 8.8\% | 3.7\% | 5.2\% | 19.3\% |
| 1999 | 33.6\% | 26.3\% | 17.9\% | 11.5\% | 6.4\% | 2.4\% | 4.5\% |  |
| 2000 | 30.3\% | 21.0\% | 12.4\% | 6.6\% | 3.8\% | 1.7\% | 3.8\% |  |
| 2001 | 18.5\% | 11.2\% | 4.1\% | 1.4\% | 1.0\% | 0.6\% | 2.2\% |  |
| 2002 | -4.0\% | -5.5\% | -4.6\% | -1.4\% | -0.8\% | -0.1\% | 1.2\% |  |
| 2003 | -26.3\% | -17.9\% | -8.4\% | -4.3\% | -2.5\% | -0.8\% | 0.3\% |  |
| 2004 | -17.1\% | -6.5\% | -1.6\% | 0.3\% | 0.7\% | 0.4\% | 0.5\% |  |
| 2005 | 9.2\% | 11.5\% | 9.2\% | 5.5\% | 2.8\% | 1.3\% | 1.9\% |  |
| 2006 | 19.4\% | 14.9\% | 10.4\% | 5.9\% | 3.3\% | 1.1\% | 1.4\% |  |
| 2007 | 19.9\% | 16.2\% | 10.6\% | 6.9\% | 4.1\% | 1.7\% | 2.1\% |  |
| 2008 | 7.1\% | 11.3\% | 9.6\% | 6.8\% | 4.5\% | 1.7\% | 0.3\% |  |
| 2009 | 13.2\% | 9.3\% | 6.8\% | 4.1\% | 2.2\% | 1.0\% |  |  |
| 2010 | 10.2\% | 7.1\% | 3.6\% | 0.8\% | -0.3\% | -0.4\% |  |  |


| Number of observations of difference in development factor: |  |  |  |  |  |  | All |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Downward | 6 | 6 | 5 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 26 |
| Upward | 15 | 15 | 16 | 18 | 18 | 17 | 99 |

Correlation between claim settlement ratio change at age $X$ to development difference at $X$-to-84:

$$
\begin{array}{llllll}
-0.1575 & -0.2598 & -0.3347 & -0.5180 & -0.5997 & -0.7320
\end{array}
$$

Correlation between claim settlement ratio change at age $X$ to development difference at 84-to-108:

$$
\begin{array}{llllll}
-0.0197 & -0.1674 & -0.3001 & -0.4462 & -0.5054 & -0.8038
\end{array}
$$

Correlation between claim settlement ratio change at age $X$ to development difference at 84-to-228:

$$
\begin{array}{cccccc}
0.2080 & -0.0014 & -0.1828 & -0.2680 & -0.4320 & -0.7493
\end{array}
$$

${ }^{1}$ For example, the value of $12.8 \%$ for 2010 at 12 -to- 84 months is equal to the difference in the projected loss development factor at 12-to-84 months as of 12/31/2010 to the actual loss development factor at 12-to-84 months that emerged for accident year 2010.

Yellow Difference in development factors by less than $-0.5 \%$.

Green Difference in development factors by more than $0.5 \%$.

Source: WCIRB aggregate financial data for December 31 evaluations.
Summary of Change in Claim Settlement Rate Compared to Difference in Paid Loss Development Factors
Periods where Settlement Rate Change $\mathbf{>} \mathbf{1 . 0 \%}$ in Absolute Value

| Indemnity Paid |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Claim Settlement Period | 12 | 24 | 36 | 48 | 60 | 72 | All | 12 | 24 | 36 | 48 | 60 | 72 | All |
| Loss Development Period | 12-84 | 24-84 | 36-84 | 48-84 | 60-84 | 72-84 | All | 12-84 | 24-84 | 36-84 | 48-84 | 60-84 | 72-84 | All |
| Settlement Down/ Development Up | 5 | 5 | 6 | 9 | 6 | 4 | 35 | 6 | 8 | 7 | 10 | 7 | 5 | 43 |
| Settlement Down/ Development Down | 2 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 12 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 5 |
| Settlement Up/ Development Up | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 3 | 1 | 3 | 4 | 1 | 0 | 12 |
| Settlement Up/ Development Down | 5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 0 | 21 | 3 | 3 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 9 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Settlem./Devel. Oposite Direction | 10 | 9 | 10 | 14 | 9 | 4 | 56 | 9 | 11 | 8 | 11 | 8 | 5 | 52 |
| Settlem./Devel. Same Direction | 2 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 16 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 1 | 0 | 17 |
| Settlem./Devel. Oposite Direction | 83\% | 69\% | 71\% | 82\% | 82\% | 80\% | 78\% | 69\% | 79\% | 62\% | 73\% | 89\% | 100\% | 75\% |
| Settlem./Devel. Same Direction | 17\% | 31\% | 29\% | 18\% | 18\% | 20\% | 22\% | 31\% | 21\% | 38\% | 27\% | 11\% | 0\% | 25\% |


Summary of Change in Claim Settlement Rate Compared to Difference in Paid Loss Development at 84-to-108 Months
Periods where Settlement Rate Change $\boldsymbol{>} \mathbf{1 . 0 \%}$ in Absolute Value

| Claim Settlement Period | 12 | 24 | 36 | 48 | 60 | 72 | All | 12 | 24 | 36 | 48 | 60 | 72 | All |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Loss Development Period | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | All | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | All |
| Settlement Down/ Development Up | 4 | 5 | 5 | 8 | 6 | 4 | 32 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 8 | 6 | 5 | 34 |
| Settlement Down/ Development Down | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 9 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 5 |
| Settlement Up/ Development Up | 5 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 1 | 0 | 16 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 12 |
| Settlement Up/ Development Down | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Settlem./Devel. Oposite Direction | 4 | 5 | 5 | 8 | 6 | 4 | 32 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 8 | 6 | 5 | 34 |
| Settlem./Devel. Same Direction | 7 | 5 | 6 | 5 | 2 | 0 | 25 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 0 | 17 |
| Settlem./Devel. Oposite Direction | 36\% | 50\% | 45\% | 62\% | 75\% | 100\% | 56\% | 50\% | 63\% | 56\% | 73\% | 75\% | 100\% | 67\% |
| Settlem./Devel. Same Direction | 64\% | 50\% | 55\% | 38\% | 25\% | 0\% | 44\% | 50\% | 38\% | 44\% | 27\% | 25\% | 0\% | 33\% |

Periods where Settlement Rate Change $\mathbf{>} \mathbf{1 . 5 \%}$ in Absolute Value

| Claim Settlement Period | 12 | 24 | 36 | 48 | 60 | 72 | All | 12 | 24 | 36 | 48 | 60 | 72 | All |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Development Period | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | All | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | All |
| Settlement Down/ Development Up | 2 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 1 | 18 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 1 | 21 |
| Settlement Down/ Development Down | 2 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 7 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 3 |
| Settlement Up/ Development Up | 5 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 14 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 11 |
| Settlement Up/ Development Down | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Settlem./Devel. Oposite Direction | 2 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 1 | 18 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 1 | 21 |
| Settlem./Devel. Same Direction | 7 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 21 | 5 | 3 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 14 |
| Settlem./Devel. Oposite Direction | 22\% | 44\% | 44\% | 43\% | 100\% | 100\% | 46\% | 38\% | 57\% | 57\% | 67\% | 83\% | 100\% | 60\% |
| Settlem./Devel. Same Direction | 78\% | 56\% | 56\% | 57\% | 0\% | 0\% | 54\% | 63\% | 43\% | 43\% | 33\% | 17\% | 0\% | 40\% |

Summary of Change in Claim Settlement Rate Compared to Difference in Paid Loss Development at 84-to-228 Months
Periods where Settlement Rate Change $\boldsymbol{>} \mathbf{1 . 0 \%}$ in Absolute Value

| Claim Settlement Period | 12 | 24 | 36 | 48 | 60 | 72 | All | 12 | 24 | 36 | 48 | 60 | 72 | All |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Loss Development Period | 84-228 | 84-228 | 84-228 | 84-228 | 84-228 | 84-228 | All | 84-228 | 84-228 | 84-228 | 84-228 | 84-228 | 84-228 | All |
| Settlement Down/ Development Up | 2 | 3 | 2 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 15 | 2 | 3 | 2 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 15 |
| Settlement Down/ Development Down | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 9 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 9 |
| Settlement Up/ Development Up | 3 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 6 | 3 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 6 |
| Settlement Up/ Development Down | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 5 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 5 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Settlem./Devel. Oposite Direction | 3 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 3 | 2 | 20 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 3 | 2 | 20 |
| Settlem./Devel. Same Direction | 5 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 1 | 0 | 15 | 5 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 1 | 0 | 15 |
| Settlem./Devel. Oposite Direction | 38\% | 57\% | 50\% | 63\% | 75\% | 100\% | 57\% | 38\% | 57\% | 50\% | 63\% | 75\% | 100\% | 57\% |
| Settlem./Devel. Same Direction | 63\% | 43\% | 50\% | 38\% | 25\% | 0\% | 43\% | 63\% | 43\% | 50\% | 38\% | 25\% | 0\% | 43\% |

Periods where Settlement Rate Change > 1.5\% in Absolute Value


Change in Accident Year Indemnity Paid Development

| AY | $\underline{12-84}$ | $\underline{24-84}$ | $\underline{36-84}$ | $\underline{48-84}$ | $\underline{60-84}$ | $\underline{72-84}$ | $\underline{84-108}$ | $\underline{84-228}$ |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| 1989 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1990 | $-7.6 \%$ | $-10.9 \%$ | $-4.5 \%$ | $-1.6 \%$ | $-1.1 \%$ | $-0.3 \%$ | $-0.5 \%$ | $-0.5 \%$ |
| 1991 | $-2.5 \%$ | $-0.9 \%$ | $0.8 \%$ | $-0.4 \%$ | $0.0 \%$ | $-0.2 \%$ | $-0.1 \%$ | $0.5 \%$ |
| 1992 | $-2.7 \%$ | $0.5 \%$ | $-1.3 \%$ | $0.0 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ | $0.9 \%$ |
| 1993 | $-0.3 \%$ | $-2.2 \%$ | $-0.8 \%$ | $-0.6 \%$ | $-0.3 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ | $0.8 \%$ | $0.9 \%$ |
| 1994 | $2.9 \%$ | $-1.4 \%$ | $-1.6 \%$ | $-0.2 \%$ | $0.2 \%$ | $0.2 \%$ | $0.5 \%$ | $2.4 \%$ |
| 1995 | $6.0 \%$ | $-1.7 \%$ | $-0.6 \%$ | $0.5 \%$ | $0.8 \%$ | $0.7 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ | $0.4 \%$ |
| 1996 | $1.0 \%$ | $1.5 \%$ | $1.6 \%$ | $1.6 \%$ | $0.4 \%$ | $-0.2 \%$ | $0.9 \%$ | $1.5 \%$ |
| 1997 | $4.4 \%$ | $-0.4 \%$ | $1.4 \%$ | $1.0 \%$ | $0.9 \%$ | $0.5 \%$ | $-0.3 \%$ | $0.0 \%$ |
| 1998 | $2.7 \%$ | $4.2 \%$ | $2.3 \%$ | $0.9 \%$ | $0.6 \%$ | $0.2 \%$ | $0.4 \%$ | $1.5 \%$ |
| 1999 | $7.3 \%$ | $4.7 \%$ | $2.7 \%$ | $1.7 \%$ | $0.5 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ | $-0.3 \%$ |  |
| 2000 | $3.2 \%$ | $3.0 \%$ | $1.8 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ | $-0.4 \%$ | $-0.3 \%$ | $-0.2 \%$ |  |
| 2001 | $3.6 \%$ | $2.6 \%$ | $-0.4 \%$ | $-1.7 \%$ | $-1.1 \%$ | $-0.1 \%$ | $-0.2 \%$ |  |
| 2002 | $-4.0 \%$ | $-5.2 \%$ | $-4.4 \%$ | $-2.1 \%$ | $-0.6 \%$ | $-0.4 \%$ | $-0.7 \%$ |  |
| 2003 | $-14.0 \%$ | $-8.4 \%$ | $-3.7 \%$ | $-0.6 \%$ | $-0.6 \%$ | $-0.3 \%$ | $0.5 \%$ |  |
| 2004 | $-23.5 \%$ | $-11.5 \%$ | $-1.4 \%$ | $-0.4 \%$ | $0.7 \%$ | $0.6 \%$ | $2.0 \%$ |  |
| 2005 | $-4.9 \%$ | $1.3 \%$ | $2.0 \%$ | $2.1 \%$ | $1.6 \%$ | $1.0 \%$ | $1.3 \%$ |  |
| 2006 | $9.4 \%$ | $4.4 \%$ | $2.6 \%$ | $3.1 \%$ | $1.8 \%$ | $0.8 \%$ | $-0.5 \%$ |  |
| 2007 | $3.7 \%$ | $2.3 \%$ | $1.8 \%$ | $0.4 \%$ | $0.0 \%$ | $-0.2 \%$ | $-0.5 \%$ |  |
| 2008 | $5.1 \%$ | $4.3 \%$ | $2.3 \%$ | $0.3 \%$ | $-0.5 \%$ | $-0.6 \%$ |  |  |
| 2009 | $8.8 \%$ | $3.8 \%$ | $1.3 \%$ | $0.6 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ |  |  |
| 2010 | $2.8 \%$ | $0.0 \%$ | $-0.8 \%$ | $-0.9 \%$ | $-0.1 \%$ | $-0.1 \%$ |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |


| Number of o |  | e in |  |  |  |  | All |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Downward | 8 | 10 | 10 | 10 | 10 | 10 | 58 |
| Upward | 13 | 11 | 11 | 11 | 11 | 11 | 68 |

Correlation between claim settlement ratio change at age $X$ to development change at $X$-to-84:

$$
\begin{array}{llllll}
-0.1111 & -0.1539 & -0.1855 & -0.0683 & 0.0824 & -0.0491
\end{array}
$$

Correlation between claim settlement ratio change at age $X$ to development change at 84-to-108:
0.4854
$0.5379 \quad 0.5535$
0.5266
0.1551
0.2588

Correlation between claim settlement ratio change at age $X$ to development change at 84-to-228: $\begin{array}{llllll}0.6295 & 0.2446 & 0.2710 & 0.0754 & -0.1675 & 0.0177\end{array}$
${ }^{1}$ For example, the value for accdient year 2010 at 12-84 months is equal to the ratio of the actual development factor at 12-to-84 months for 2010 to the the actual development factor at 12-to-84 months for 2009 minus 1.0.

Yellow Change in development factors by less than $-0.5 \%$.
Blue Change in development factors by more than $0.5 \%$.
Source: WCIRB aggregate financial data for December 31 evaluations.

Change in Accident Year Medical Paid Development

| $\underline{\text { AY }}$ | $\underline{12-84}$ | $\underline{24-84}$ | $\underline{36-84}$ | $\underline{48-84}$ | $\underline{60-84}$ | $\underline{72-84}$ | $\underline{84-108}$ | $\underline{84-228}$ |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1989 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1990 | $6.9 \%$ | $-2.0 \%$ | $-0.6 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ | $0.4 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ | $0.0 \%$ | $-0.3 \%$ |
| 1991 | $-8.0 \%$ | $-0.8 \%$ | $1.3 \%$ | $1.4 \%$ | $0.6 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ | $0.2 \%$ | $1.2 \%$ |
| 1992 | $-10.8 \%$ | $-0.5 \%$ | $0.7 \%$ | $0.2 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ | $0.0 \%$ | $0.2 \%$ | $3.2 \%$ |
| 1993 | $-6.1 \%$ | $-1.4 \%$ | $-0.7 \%$ | $0.2 \%$ | $0.5 \%$ | $0.6 \%$ | $1.3 \%$ | $2.7 \%$ |
| 1994 | $8.8 \%$ | $4.6 \%$ | $2.2 \%$ | $1.5 \%$ | $1.0 \%$ | $0.4 \%$ | $1.3 \%$ | $2.0 \%$ |
| 1995 | $11.4 \%$ | $6.7 \%$ | $5.2 \%$ | $3.6 \%$ | $2.2 \%$ | $1.3 \%$ | $1.4 \%$ | $2.6 \%$ |
| 1996 | $8.3 \%$ | $5.7 \%$ | $4.8 \%$ | $3.1 \%$ | $1.6 \%$ | $0.4 \%$ | $1.0 \%$ | $0.5 \%$ |
| 1997 | $10.1 \%$ | $5.8 \%$ | $4.1 \%$ | $2.5 \%$ | $1.8 \%$ | $0.9 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ | $-0.1 \%$ |
| 1998 | $11.2 \%$ | $7.8 \%$ | $4.4 \%$ | $2.5 \%$ | $1.3 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ | $-0.2 \%$ | $1.2 \%$ |
| 1999 | $12.5 \%$ | $6.4 \%$ | $2.5 \%$ | $0.3 \%$ | $-1.0 \%$ | $-0.7 \%$ | $-0.7 \%$ |  |
| 2000 | $11.2 \%$ | $3.3 \%$ | $-0.5 \%$ | $-1.7 \%$ | $-1.2 \%$ | $-0.3 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ |  |
| 2001 | $6.9 \%$ | $0.3 \%$ | $-2.6 \%$ | $-1.8 \%$ | $-0.2 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ | $0.3 \%$ |  |
| 2002 | $-6.2 \%$ | $-7.7 \%$ | $-4.0 \%$ | $-0.4 \%$ | $-0.7 \%$ | $-0.3 \%$ | $-0.3 \%$ |  |
| 2003 | $-15.9 \%$ | $-6.3 \%$ | $0.6 \%$ | $0.5 \%$ | $0.5 \%$ | $0.3 \%$ | $0.9 \%$ |  |
| 2004 | $-4.4 \%$ | $7.8 \%$ | $5.6 \%$ | $3.9 \%$ | $2.9 \%$ | $1.2 \%$ | $0.6 \%$ |  |
| 2005 | $1.5 \%$ | $3.6 \%$ | $3.6 \%$ | $1.9 \%$ | $0.6 \%$ | $0.3 \%$ | $0.8 \%$ |  |
| 2006 | $9.2 \%$ | $5.0 \%$ | $1.0 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ | $-0.1 \%$ | $-0.5 \%$ | $-0.5 \%$ |  |
| 2007 | $5.8 \%$ | $2.5 \%$ | $1.5 \%$ | $0.6 \%$ | $0.5 \%$ | $0.7 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ |  |
| 2008 | $-1.6 \%$ | $2.3 \%$ | $1.7 \%$ | $0.8 \%$ | $0.3 \%$ | $-0.3 \%$ |  |  |
| 2009 | $7.1 \%$ | $3.4 \%$ | $1.6 \%$ | $0.8 \%$ | $-0.3 \%$ | $-0.4 \%$ |  |  |
| 2010 | $3.9 \%$ | $1.0 \%$ | $-0.5 \%$ | $-1.6 \%$ | $-0.9 \%$ | $-0.2 \%$ |  |  |


| Number of |  | ang |  | act |  |  | All |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Downward | 7 | 6 | 6 | 4 | 7 | 7 | 37 |
| Upward | 14 | 15 | 15 | 17 | 14 | 13 | 88 |

Correlation between claim settlement ratio change at age $X$ to development change at $X$-to-84: $\begin{array}{llllll}-0.1331 & 0.0328 & 0.1412 & 0.1195 & -0.0316 & -0.2273\end{array}$
Correlation between claim settlement ratio change at age $X$ to development change at 84-to-108:
0.4009
0.3794
0.2883
0.3601
$0.0279-0.0221$

Correlation between claim settlement ratio change at age $X$ to development change at 84-to-228:
0.5729
0.7622
0.6126
0.7810
$0.5397 \quad 0.3995$
${ }^{1}$ For example, the value for accdient year 2010 at 12-84 months is equal to the ratio of the actual development factor at 12-to-84 months for 2010 to the the actual development factor at 12-to-84 months for 2009 minus 1.0.

```
Yellow Change in development factors by less than \(-0.5 \%\).
Blue Change in development factors by more than \(0.5 \%\).
```

Source: WCIRB aggregate financial data for December 31 evaluations.
Summary of Change in Claim Settlement Rate and Change in Paid Loss Development Factors

|  |  | Indemnity Paid |  |  |  |  | Medical Paid |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Claim Settlement Period | 12 | 24 | 36 | 48 | 60 | 72 | All | 12 | 24 | 36 | 48 | 60 | 72 | All |
| Loss Development Period | 12-84 | 24-84 | 36-84 | 48-84 | 60-84 | 72-84 | All | 12-84 | 24-84 | 36-84 | 48-84 | 60-84 | 72-84 | All |
| Settlement Down/ Development Up | 5 | 6 | 6 | 5 | 2 | 1 | 25 | 6 | 6 | 6 | 8 | 3 | 1 | 30 |
| Settlement Down/ Development Down | 2 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 0 | 11 | 1 | 3 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 12 |
| Settlement Up/ Development Up | 2 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 8 | 3 | 2 | 4 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 12 |
| Settlement Up/ Development Down | 3 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 1 | 0 | 12 | 3 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 8 |
| Settlem./Devel. Oposite Direction | 8 | 8 | 9 | 8 | 3 | 1 | 37 | 9 | 7 | 7 | 9 | 5 | 1 | 38 |
| Settlem./Devel. Same Direction | 4 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 0 | 19 | 4 | 5 | 7 | 4 | 3 | 1 | 24 |
| Settlem./Devel. Oposite Direction | 67\% | 62\% | 69\% | 73\% | 50\% | 100\% | 66\% | 69\% | 58\% | 50\% | 69\% | 63\% | 50\% | 61\% |
| Settlem./Devel. Same Direction | 33\% | 38\% | 31\% | 27\% | 50\% | 0\% | 34\% | 31\% | 42\% | 50\% | 31\% | 38\% | 50\% | 39\% |

Periods where Settlement Rate Change $\mathbf{>} \mathbf{1 . 5 \%}$ in Absolute Value

III-D-18
Summary of Change in Claim Settlement Rate and
Change in Paid Loss Development Factor at 84-to-108 Months
Periods where Settlement Rate Change $>\mathbf{1 . 0 \%}$ in Absolute Value

| Claim Settlement Period |  | 24 | 36 | 48 | 60 | 72 | All | 12 | 24 | 36 | 48 | 60 | 72 | All |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Loss Development Period | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | All | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | 84-108 | All |
| Settlement Down/ Development Up | 0 | 1 | 0 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 9 |
| Settlement Down/ Development Down | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 3 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 5 |
| Settlement Up/ Development Up | 5 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 1 | 0 | 15 | 5 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 1 | 0 | 16 |
| Settlement Up/ Development Down | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Settlem./Devel. Oposite Direction | 0 | 1 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 6 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 2 | 9 |
| Settlem./Devel. Same Direction | 5 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 0 | 18 | 6 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 2 | 1 | 21 |
| Settlem./Devel. Oposite Direction | 0\% | 25\% | 0\% | 33\% | 50\% | 100\% | 25\% | 14\% | 33\% | 25\% | 29\% | 33\% | 67\% | 30\% |
| Settlem./Devel. Same Direction | 100\% | 75\% | 100\% | 67\% | 50\% | 0\% | 75\% | 86\% | 67\% | 75\% | 71\% | 67\% | 33\% | 70\% |

Periods where Settlement Rate Change $>\mathbf{1 . 5 \%}$ in Absolute Value

III-D-19
WCIRB California®
Summary of Change in Claim Settlement Rate and
Change in Paid Loss Development Factor at 84 -to-228 Months
Periods where Settlement Rate Change $>\mathbf{1 . 0 \%}$ in Absolute Value

| Indemnity Paid |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | Medical Paid |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Claim Settlement Period | 12 | 24 | 36 | 48 | 60 | 72 | All | 12 | 24 | 36 | 48 | 60 | 72 | All |
| Loss Development Period | 84-228 | 84-228 | 84-228 | 84-228 | 84-228 | 84-228 | All | 84-228 | 84-228 | 84-228 | 84-228 | 84-228 | 84-228 | All |
| Settlement Down/ Development Up | 0 | 2 | 1 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 9 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 13 |
| Settlement Down/ Development Down | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Settlement Up/ Development Up | 4 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 11 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 10 |
| Settlement Up/ Development Down | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Settlem./Devel. Oposite Direction | 0 | 2 | 1 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 9 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 13 |
| Settlem./Devel. Same Direction | 4 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 11 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 10 |
| Settlem./Devel. Oposite Direction | 0\% | 50\% | 33\% | 60\% | 67\% | 100\% | 45\% | 40\% | 50\% | 60\% | 60\% | 67\% | 100\% | 57\% |
| Settlem./Devel. Same Direction | 100\% | 50\% | 67\% | 40\% | 33\% | 0\% | 55\% | 60\% | 50\% | 40\% | 40\% | 33\% | 0\% | 43\% |

Periods where Settlement Rate Change $\mathbf{>} \mathbf{1 . 5 \%}$ in Absolute Value

III-D-20

## Comparison of Paid Indemnity Severity on Claims in Transition

Current "Berquist-Sherman" Approach

| Paid Indemnity Severity for Closed Claims in Transition |  |  |  |  |  |  | Paid Indemnity Severity for Open Claims in Transition |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Policy |  |  | Report | evel |  |  | Policy |  |  | Report | evel |  |  |
| Year | 1 | $\underline{2}$ | 3 | 4 | 5 | $\underline{6}$ | Year | 1 | $\underline{2}$ | 3 | 4 | 5 | $\underline{6}$ |
| 2005 | 5,788 | 17,303 | 26,863 | 33,390 | 36,069 | 40,831 | 2005 | 6,903 | 13,806 | 21,008 | 26,836 | 31,210 | 36,596 |
| 2006 | 6,337 | 18,659 | 29,761 | 35,150 | 42,452 | 44,916 | 2006 | 7,277 | 14,553 | 22,302 | 28,519 | 33,145 | 38,347 |
| 2007 | 7,154 | 16,985 | 28,382 | 35,796 | 42,330 | 48,919 | 2007 | 7,639 | 15,464 | 22,843 | 29,380 | 35,780 | 41,373 |
| 2008 | 8,128 | 19,656 | 30,068 | 36,907 | 43,419 | 50,640 | 2008 | 7,916 | 16,030 | 23,666 | 30,476 | 36,643 | 42,706 |
| 2009 | 8,498 | 19,655 | 29,038 | 39,053 | 47,206 |  | 2009 | 7,603 | 15,865 | 23,600 | 30,483 | 36,303 | 43,564 |
| 2010 | 8,605 | 19,171 | 29,948 | 38,976 |  |  | 2010 | 7,615 | 15,696 | 22,957 | 29,023 | 36,278 |  |
| 2011 | 8,915 | 19,684 | 30,214 |  |  |  | 2011 | 7,813 | 15,810 | 22,949 | 30,599 |  |  |
| 2012 | 9,089 | 19,870 |  |  |  |  | 2012 | 7,580 | 15,325 | 22,987 |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 9,679 |  |  |  |  |  | 2013 | 7,605 | 15,209 |  |  |  |  |

Actual Payments on Closing and Open Claims Tracked by Claim Status Across Two Report Levels

| Paid Indemnity Severity for Claims Closing at that Report Level |  |  |  |  |  |  | Paid Indemnity Severity for Claims Remaining Open at that Report Level |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Policy | Report Level |  |  |  |  |  | Policy |  |  | Repor | evel |  |  |
| Year | 1 | $\underline{2}$ | 3 | 4 | 5 | $\underline{6}$ | Year | 1 | $\underline{2}$ | 3 | 4 | $\underline{5}$ | $\underline{6}$ |
| 2005 | 2,060 | 11,489 | 20,361 | 28,420 | 31,861 | 36,107 | 2005 | 6,903 | 15,686 | 21,603 | 26,493 | 32,448 | 38,334 |
| 2006 | 2,272 | 12,289 | 22,078 | 29,264 | 34,194 | 42,670 | 2006 | 7,277 | 16,760 | 22,991 | 29,385 | 35,387 | 41,015 |
| 2007 | 2,392 | 13,522 | 22,800 | 31,633 | 37,680 | 45,135 | 2007 | 7,639 | 17,381 | 24,953 | 31,580 | 38,465 | 44,117 |
| 2008 | 2,576 | 14,507 | 24,671 | 32,852 | 39,658 | 45,147 | 2008 | 7,916 | 18,435 | 26,004 | 33,082 | 39,401 | 45,432 |
| 2009 | 2,678 | 13,986 | 24,700 | 32,457 | 40,820 | 48,610 | 2009 | 7,603 | 18,249 | 25,842 | 32,831 | 38,565 | 43,107 |
| 2010 | 2,753 | 14,343 | 25,088 | 33,516 | 41,468 |  | 2010 | 7,615 | 18,264 | 25,234 | 31,298 | 36,085 |  |
| 2011 | 3,086 | 15,006 | 25,539 | 34,173 |  |  | 2011 | 7,813 | 18,409 | 25,443 | 31,095 |  |  |
| 2012 | 3,375 | 15,557 | 26,368 |  |  |  | 2012 | 7,580 | 18,050 | 24,112 |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 3,851 | 16,194 |  |  |  |  | 2013 | 7,605 | 17,777 |  |  |  |  |

## Comparison of "Berquist-Sherman" Approach to Actual Payments

| Percentile of "Berquist-Sherman" Closed Claim Transition Severity within Actual Closing Severity Endpoints ${ }^{1}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  | Difference between "Berquist-Sherman" Estimated Paid per Open Transition Claim and Actual Open Claim Severity |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Policy |  |  | Report |  |  |  | Policy |  |  | Report |  |  |  |
| Year | 1 | $\underline{2}$ | 3 | 4 | $\underline{5}$ | $\underline{6}$ | Year | 1 | $\underline{2}$ | 3 | 4 | $\underline{5}$ | $\underline{6}$ |
| 2005 | 40\% | 66\% | 81\% | 144\% | 99\% | 73\% | 2005 | 0\% | -12\% | -3\% | 1\% | -4\% | -5\% |
| 2006 | 41\% | 65\% | 107\% | 119\% | 97\% | 63\% | 2006 | 0\% | -13\% | -3\% | -3\% | -6\% | -7\% |
| 2007 | 43\% | 37\% | 63\% | 69\% | 62\% | 72\% | 2007 | 0\% | -11\% | -8\% | -7\% | -7\% | -6\% |
| 2008 | 47\% | 51\% | 66\% | 60\% | 69\% | 83\% | 2008 | 0\% | -13\% | -9\% | -8\% | -7\% | -6\% |
| 2009 | 51\% | 53\% | 56\% | 79\% | 82\% |  | 2009 | 0\% | -13\% | -9\% | -7\% | -6\% | 1\% |
| 2010 | 50\% | 45\% | 58\% | 69\% |  |  | 2010 | 0\% | -14\% | -9\% | -7\% | 1\% |  |
| 2011 | 49\% | 44\% | 54\% |  |  |  | 2011 | 0\% | -14\% | -10\% | -2\% |  |  |
| 2012 | 47\% | 40\% |  |  |  |  | 2012 | 0\% | -15\% | -5\% |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 47\% |  |  |  |  |  | 2013 | 0\% | -14\% |  |  |  |  |

${ }^{1}$ For example, for Report Level 1 this is equal to the estimated "Berquist-Sherman" paid per closed claim in transition for Report Level 1 as a percentile between the actual paid per closing claim severity for Report Levels 1 and 2.
Source: WCIRB unit statistical data

## Comparison of Paid Medical Severity on Claims in Transition

Current "Berquist-Sherman" Approach

| Paid Medical Severity for Closed Claims in Transition |  |  |  |  |  |  | Paid Medical Severity for Open Claims in Transition |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Policy |  |  | Report | evel |  |  | Policy |  |  | Report | evel |  |  |
| Year | 1 | $\underline{2}$ | 3 | 4 | 5 | $\underline{6}$ | Year | 1 | $\underline{2}$ | 3 | 4 | 5 | $\underline{6}$ |
| 2005 | 6,185 | 16,232 | 26,438 | 36,468 | 42,962 | 54,667 | 2005 | 8,740 | 17,481 | 24,495 | 33,816 | 42,821 | 53,506 |
| 2006 | 6,890 | 18,619 | 30,568 | 41,578 | 51,717 | 60,401 | 2006 | 9,356 | 18,712 | 27,601 | 37,421 | 48,050 | 59,019 |
| 2007 | 8,099 | 18,294 | 32,450 | 44,304 | 55,802 | 73,005 | 2007 | 10,355 | 19,787 | 30,509 | 41,150 | 53,172 | 66,317 |
| 2008 | 9,333 | 21,511 | 35,386 | 46,269 | 60,017 | 70,286 | 2008 | 10,880 | 20,345 | 30,581 | 41,616 | 53,116 | 64,477 |
| 2009 | 10,073 | 22,540 | 34,713 | 51,329 | 66,033 |  | 2009 | 10,820 | 20,724 | 31,521 | 43,807 | 54,620 | 65,544 |
| 2010 | 9,959 | 21,902 | 36,224 | 50,225 |  |  | 2010 | 10,548 | 20,265 | 30,734 | 40,998 | 51,247 |  |
| 2011 | 9,744 | 21,607 | 34,844 |  |  |  | 2011 | 9,885 | 18,855 | 28,415 | 37,887 |  |  |
| 2012 | 9,588 | 21,068 |  |  |  |  | 2012 | 9,534 | 18,122 | 27,183 |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 9,827 |  |  |  |  |  | 2013 | 8,937 | 17,873 |  |  |  |  |

Actual Payments on Closing and Open Claims Tracked by Claim Status Across Two Report Levels

| Paid Medical Severity for Claims Closing at that Report Level |  |  |  |  |  |  | Paid Medical Severity for Claims Remaining Open at that Report Level |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Policy |  |  | Report | evel |  |  | Policy |  |  | Repo | evel |  |  |
| Year | 1 | $\underline{2}$ | 3 | 4 | 5 | $\underline{6}$ | Year | 1 | $\underline{2}$ | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |
| 2005 | 2,403 | 11,141 | 19,780 | 30,200 | 36,378 | 46,215 | 2005 | 8,740 | 18,012 | 27,094 | 36,294 | 47,764 | 58,555 |
| 2006 | 2,619 | 12,320 | 22,582 | 33,362 | 40,365 | 50,978 | 2006 | 9,356 | 20,521 | 30,174 | 40,607 | 51,587 | 63,825 |
| 2007 | 2,854 | 14,392 | 23,889 | 35,700 | 46,422 | 59,653 | 2007 | 10,355 | 21,970 | 33,261 | 44,365 | 57,983 | 71,314 |
| 2008 | 3,219 | 15,564 | 26,399 | 37,929 | 50,481 | 62,169 | 2008 | 10,880 | 23,095 | 33,550 | 45,575 | 57,221 | 69,399 |
| 2009 | 3,420 | 15,743 | 27,941 | 39,070 | 53,303 | 67,205 | 2009 | 10,820 | 23,431 | 34,848 | 47,645 | 59,087 | 67,086 |
| 2010 | 3,411 | 15,785 | 28,394 | 39,729 | 53,078 |  | 2010 | 10,548 | 23,202 | 33,569 | 43,798 | 53,377 |  |
| 2011 | 3,390 | 16,299 | 27,354 | 38,670 |  |  | 2011 | 9,885 | 21,798 | 30,985 | 39,996 |  |  |
| 2012 | 3,707 | 15,952 | 27,609 |  |  |  | 2012 | 9,534 | 20,596 | 29,042 |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 4,028 | 15,922 |  |  |  |  | 2013 | 8,937 | 19,057 |  |  |  |  |

## Comparison of "Berquist-Sherman" Approach to Actual Payments

| Percentile of "Berquist-Sherman" Closed Claim Transition Severity within Actual Closing Severity Endpoints ${ }^{1}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  | Difference between "Berquist-Sherman" Estimated Paid per Open Transition Claim and Actual Open Claim Severity |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Policy |  |  | Report |  |  |  | Policy |  |  | Report |  |  |  |
| Year | 1 | $\underline{2}$ | $\underline{3}$ | 4 | 5 | $\underline{6}$ | Year | 1 | $\underline{2}$ | 3 | 4 | $\underline{5}$ | $\underline{6}$ |
| 2005 | 43\% | 59\% | 64\% | 101\% | 67\% | 68\% | 2005 | 0\% | -3\% | -10\% | -7\% | -10\% | -9\% |
| 2006 | 44\% | 61\% | 74\% | 117\% | 107\% | 87\% | 2006 | 0\% | -9\% | -9\% | -8\% | -7\% | -8\% |
| 2007 | 45\% | 41\% | 72\% | 80\% | 71\% | 97\% | 2007 | 0\% | -10\% | -8\% | -7\% | -8\% | -7\% |
| 2008 | 50\% | 55\% | 78\% | 66\% | 82\% | 96\% | 2008 | 0\% | -12\% | -9\% | -9\% | -7\% | -7\% |
| 2009 | 54\% | 56\% | 61\% | 86\% | 92\% |  | 2009 | 0\% | -12\% | -10\% | -8\% | -8\% | -2\% |
| 2010 | 53\% | 49\% | 69\% | 79\% |  |  | 2010 | 0\% | -13\% | -8\% | -6\% | -4\% |  |
| 2011 | 49\% | 48\% | 66\% |  |  |  | 2011 | 0\% | -14\% | -8\% | -5\% |  |  |
| 2012 | 48\% | 44\% |  |  |  |  | 2012 | 0\% | -12\% | -6\% |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 49\% |  |  |  |  |  | 2013 | 0\% | -6\% |  |  |  |  |

${ }^{1}$ For example, for Report Level 1 this is equal to the estimated "Berquist-Sherman" paid per closed claim in transition for Report Level 1 as a percentile between the actual paid per closing claim severity for Report Levels 1 and 2.
Source: WCIRB unit statistical data
Comparison of Paid Loss Development Factors Adjusted for Changes in Claim Settlement Rates

| A. Unadjusted Paid Loss Development Factors |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Ind | 1-2 | 2-3 | 3-4 | 4-5 | 5-6 | 6-7 | Med | 1-2 | 2-3 | 3-4 | 4-5 | 5-6 | 6-7 |
| 3-Yr Avg | 1.936 | 1.374 | 1.190 | 1.114 | 1.073 | 1.052 | 3-Yr Avg | 1.799 | 1.375 | 1.210 | 1.133 | 1.091 | 1.068 |
| Latest Yr | 1.912 | 1.361 | 1.185 | 1.111 | 1.070 | 1.048 | Latest Yr | 1.766 | 1.353 | 1.198 | 1.126 | 1.081 | 1.059 |
| B. Adjusted Paid Loss Development Factors - Standard "Berquist-Sherman" Approach |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Ind | 1-2 | 2-3 | 3-4 | 4-5 | 5-6 | 6-7 | Med | 1-2 | 2-3 | 3-4 | 4-5 | 5-6 | 6-7 |
| 3-Yr Avg | 1.932 | 1.374 | 1.179 | 1.107 | 1.068 | 1.051 | 3-Yr Avg | 1.803 | 1.377 | 1.204 | 1.129 | 1.089 | 1.068 |
| Latest Yr | 1.901 | 1.358 | 1.174 | 1.105 | 1.065 | 1.047 | Latest Yr | 1.762 | 1.351 | 1.189 | 1.121 | 1.077 | 1.059 |
| C. Adjusted Paid Loss Development Factors - Using "Tracked" Severities from Prior Report Level ("Lower Bound", |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Ind | 1-2 | 2-3 | 3-4 | 4-5 | 5-6 | 6-7 | Med | 1-2 | 2-3 | 3-4 | 4-5 | 5-6 | 6-7 |
| 3-Yr Avg | 1.983 | 1.364 | 1.177 | 1.108 | 1.069 | 1.051 | 3-Yr Avg | 1.844 | 1.367 | 1.201 | 1.130 | 1.090 | 1.068 |
| Latest Yr | 1.933 | 1.355 | 1.174 | 1.106 | 1.067 | 1.047 | Latest Yr | 1.787 | 1.349 | 1.191 | 1.123 | 1.079 | 1.059 |
| Difference from Standard Approach: Ind |  |  |  |  |  |  | Difference from Standard Approach: Med |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3-Yr Avg | 0.051 | -0.010 | -0.002 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 3-Yr Avg | 0.042 | -0.010 | -0.003 | 0.001 | 0.001 | 0.000 |
| Latest Yr | 0.031 | -0.002 | 0.000 | 0.001 | 0.001 | 0.000 | Latest Yr | 0.025 | -0.002 | 0.001 | 0.002 | 0.002 | 0.000 |
| D. Adjusted Paid Loss Development Factors - Using "Tracked" Severities from Current Report Level ("Upper Bound"' |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Ind | 1-2 | 2-3 | 3-4 | 4-5 | 5-6 | 6-7 | Med | 1-2 | 2-3 | 3-4 | 4-5 | 5-6 | 6-7 |
| $3-\mathrm{Yr}$ Avg | 1.893 | 1.366 | 1.176 | 1.107 | 1.068 | 1.051 | 3-Yr Avg | 1.771 | 1.369 | 1.201 | 1.129 | 1.089 | 1.068 |
| Latest Yr | 1.867 | 1.355 | 1.171 | 1.105 | 1.066 | 1.047 | Latest Yr | 1.736 | 1.349 | 1.188 | 1.121 | 1.078 | 1.059 |
| Difference from Standard Approach: Ind |  |  |  |  |  |  | Difference from Standard Approach: <br> Med |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3-Yr Avg | -0.040 | -0.008 | -0.004 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 3-Yr Avg | -0.032 | -0.007 | -0.003 | 0.000 | 0.001 | 0.001 |
| Latest Yr | -0.034 | -0.003 | -0.002 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | Latest Yr | -0.026 | -0.002 | -0.002 | 0.000 | 0.001 | 0.001 |

Source: WCIRB unit statistical data

## Item AC17-06-01 <br> 3/31/2017 Experience - Review of Methodologies

Staff has prepared a preliminary analysis of statewide experience through March 31, 2017, which is included in Exhibits 1 through 8. This information reflects insurers writing approximately $100 \%$ of the market based on 2016 premium levels. The methodologies used are consistent with those reflected in the July 1, 2017 Pure Premium Rate Filing. Wage and loss levels were projected to January 1, 2019—the approximate midpoint of experience on policies incepting in 2018, and premiums were adjusted to the industry average filed pure premium rate level as of January 1, 2017.

As shown on Exhibit 8, the projected policy year 2018 loss to the industry average filed pure premium ratio based on March 31, 2017 experience is 0.612 . (The projected loss to pure premium ratio for policies incepting between July 1, 2017 and December 31, 2017 reflected in the July 1, 2017 Pure Premium Rate Filing based on December 31, 2016 experience was 0.626.)

Additional supplemental information is included in Exhibits 9 through 12.

## California Workers' Compensation

Accident Year Experience as of March 31, 2017

| Year | Earned <br> Premium | Paid <br> Indemnity | Indemnity Reserves | Paid Medica\|** | Medical Reserves | IBNR* | Total Incurred** | Loss <br> Ratio* |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1985 | 2,872,481,605 | 1,278,086,814 | 3,973,966 | 983,695,290 | 22,590,616 | 18,757,607 | 2,307,104,293 | 0.803 |
| 1986 | 3,506,609,097 | 1,381,255,968 | 5,855,419 | 1,132,304,843 | 33,162,777 | 58,336,912 | 2,610,915,919 | 0.745 |
| 1987 | 4,374,085,383 | 1,503,615,032 | 7,389,640 | 1,324,579,234 | 47,310,060 | 31,206,246 | 2,914,100,212 | 0.666 |
| 1988 | 5,173,049,472 | 1,700,316,904 | 8,491,392 | 1,528,416,565 | 49,497,510 | 43,062,900 | 3,329,785,271 | 0.644 |
| 1989 | 5,673,263,669 | 1,935,621,248 | 9,709,066 | 1,782,475,078 | 63,571,168 | 47,317,409 | 3,838,693,969 | 0.677 |
| 1990 | 5,696,824,266 | 2,253,115,703 | 9,144,370 | 2,027,514,368 | 65,081,616 | 69,052,958 | 4,423,909,015 | 0.777 |
| 1991 | 5,862,703,027 | 2,468,418,579 | 18,847,415 | 2,178,911,391 | 73,333,928 | 70,054,368 | 4,809,565,681 | 0.820 |
| 1992 | 5,681,120,590 | 1,969,779,860 | 15,549,585 | 1,739,252,337 | 72,684,361 | 64,808,037 | 3,862,074,180 | 0.680 |
| 1993 | 5,927,913,318 | 1,687,395,822 | 16,113,643 | 1,488,256,229 | 93,246,185 | 57,091,670 | 3,342,103,549 | 0.564 |
| 1994 | 5,022,834,307 | 1,619,312,677 | 24,437,027 | 1,445,867,530 | 107,814,387 | 58,160,117 | 3,255,591,738 | 0.648 |
| 1995 | 3,778,723,013 | 1,752,104,606 | 33,321,094 | 1,587,585,848 | 129,240,460 | 66,801,810 | 3,569,053,818 | 0.945 |
| 1996 | 3,736,857,547 | 1,936,093,457 | 40,505,660 | 1,677,585,544 | 143,879,964 | 76,386,816 | 3,874,451,441 | 1.037 |
| 1997 | 3,916,944,392 | 2,294,576,056 | 53,045,283 | 1,971,212,023 | 169,885,537 | 128,850,421 | 4,617,569,320 | 1.179 |
| 1998 | 4,322,051,270 | 2,744,695,739 | 65,516,534 | 2,579,359,552 | 273,299,109 | 214,899,520 | 5,877,770,454 | 1.360 |
| 1999 | 4,537,629,086 | 3,022,817,836 | 65,448,727 | 2,955,848,956 | 251,398,708 | 307,144,297 | 6,602,658,524 | 1.455 |
| 2000 | 5,905,419,052 | 3,381,857,450 | 89,074,389 | 3,479,838,371 | 299,768,794 | 455,373,701 | 7,705,912,705 | 1.305 |
| 2001 | 10,094,684,192 | 4,767,381,964 | 145,959,054 | 5,207,402,713 | 513,687,104 | 696,603,578 | 11,331,034,413 | 1.122 |
| 2002 | 13,405,893,679 | 4,695,678,561 | 131,409,054 | 5,322,948,517 | 462,507,234 | 985,177,269 | 11,597,720,635 | 0.865 |
| 2003 | 19,429,675,115 | 4,444,259,720 | 197,002,822 | 4,881,477,491 | 481,968,301 | 1,369,566,995 | 11,374,275,329 | 0.585 |
| 2004 | 23,042,003,895 | 3,128,618,791 | 170,864,847 | 3,901,119,536 | 426,537,443 | 1,431,155,130 | 9,058,295,747 | 0.393 |
| 2005 | 21,161,242,185 | 2,429,378,628 | 148,257,892 | 3,461,899,116 | 405,533,688 | 1,204,267,168 | 7,649,336,492 | 0.361 |
| 2006 | 16,806,092,339 | 2,476,158,361 | 168,865,662 | 3,511,652,189 | 430,273,043 | 857,816,211 | 7,444,765,466 | 0.443 |
| 2007 | 13,098,765,969 | 2,611,963,896 | 196,173,410 | 3,772,629,122 | 496,995,759 | 867,438,726 | 7,945,200,913 | 0.607 |
| 2008 | 10,741,749,860 | 2,661,438,578 | 223,223,941 | 3,789,690,639 | 519,515,594 | 741,658,577 | 7,935,527,329 | 0.739 |
| 2009 | 8,884,979,606 | 2,502,900,292 | 227,447,655 | 3,562,336,829 | 520,094,932 | 735,410,617 | 7,548,190,325 | 0.850 |
| 2010 | 9,410,881,863 | 2,494,739,633 | 244,693,433 | 3,594,595,159 | 520,250,067 | 865,819,927 | 7,720,098,219 | 0.820 |
| 2011 | 10,146,399,300 | 2,387,257,710 | 296,056,683 | 3,161,147,508 | 614,297,692 | 1,100,963,146 | 7,559,722,739 | 0.745 |
| 2012 | 11,718,339,306 | 2,326,647,816 | 369,494,465 | 2,944,847,369 | 682,345,669 | 2,016,263,545 | 8,339,598,864 | 0.712 |
| 2013 | 14,186,071,217 | 2,220,568,455 | 447,673,589 | 2,646,223,681 | 798,865,851 | 2,751,094,576 | 8,864,426,152 | 0.625 |
| 2014 | 16,011,983,809 | 1,975,527,180 | 651,593,331 | 2,249,317,696 | 973,269,234 | 3,833,539,391 | 9,683,246,832 | 0.605 |
| 2015 | 17,023,510,170 | 1,430,001,391 | 901,832,318 | 1,704,000,834 | 1,285,616,138 | 5,103,497,194 | 10,424,947,875 | 0.612 |
| 2016 | 17,919,524,650 | 614,514,432 | 855,414,472 | 942,888,533 | 1,429,410,127 | 6,629,021,352 | 10,471,248,916 | 0.584 |
| 2017* | 4,366,206,665 | 17,027,188 | 102,133,992 | 33,154,979 | 227,186,644 | 2,031,605,349 | 2,411,108,152 | 0.552 |

[^2]Source: WCIRB quarterly experience calls

IV-A-2
WCIRB California®
Incurred Indemnity Loss Development Factors

|  | Age-to-Age (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Accident Year | $\underline{27 / 15}$ | 39/27 | 51/39 | 63/51 | 75/63 | 87/75 | 99/87 | 111/99 | 123/111 | 135/123 | 147/135 | 159/147 | 171/159 | 183/171 | 195/183 |
| 1992 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.001 |
| 1993 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.000 | 1.002 |
| 1994 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.002 | 0.999 | 0.999 |
| 1995 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.002 | 1.003 | 1.001 | 1.002 |
| 1996 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.002 | 1.002 | 1.000 | 0.999 | 1.002 |
| 1997 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.005 | 1.003 | 1.002 | 1.003 | 1.002 | 1.001 |
| 1998 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.004 | 1.002 | 1.002 | 1.004 | 1.004 | 1.000 | 1.003 |
| 1999 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.003 | 1.007 | 1.004 | 1.002 | 1.004 | 1.003 | 1.002 | 1.002 |
| 2000 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.009 | 1.007 | 1.005 | 1.004 | 1.004 | 1.003 | 1.002 | 1.003 | 1.002 |
| 2001 |  |  |  |  |  | 1.018 | 1.014 | 1.007 | 1.008 | 1.007 | 1.005 | 1.005 | 1.003 | 1.001 | 1.002 |
| 2002 |  |  |  |  | 1.027 | 1.019 | 1.010 | 1.011 | 1.009 | 1.006 | 1.005 | 1.002 | 1.001 | 1.003 |  |
| 2003 |  |  |  | 1.047 | 1.030 | 1.018 | 1.020 | 1.016 | 1.012 | 1.008 | 1.008 | 1.002 | 1.003 |  |  |
| 2004 |  |  | 1.063 | 1.042 | 1.037 | 1.026 | 1.025 | 1.015 | 1.015 | 1.007 | 1.006 | 1.003 |  |  |  |
| 2005 |  | 1.168 | 1.085 | 1.063 | 1.049 | 1.039 | 1.022 | 1.016 | 1.010 | 1.005 | 1.006 |  |  |  |  |
| 2006 | 1.519 | 1.188 | 1.100 | 1.072 | 1.051 | 1.031 | 1.020 | 1.012 | 1.008 | 1.007 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2007 | 1.562 | 1.216 | 1.104 | 1.066 | 1.045 | 1.030 | 1.022 | 1.012 | 1.009 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2008 | 1.618 | 1.245 | 1.116 | 1.063 | 1.043 | 1.025 | 1.018 | 1.011 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2009 | 1.670 | 1.233 | 1.124 | 1.067 | 1.043 | 1.021 | 1.016 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2010 | 1.665 | 1.250 | 1.112 | 1.062 | 1.037 | 1.023 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2011 | 1.657 | 1.225 | 1.109 | 1.053 | 1.032 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2012 | 1.662 | 1.218 | 1.094 | 1.059 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 1.604 | 1.202 | 1.092 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 1.626 | 1.224 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 1.631 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Selected (a) | 1.631 | 1.224 | 1.092 | 1.059 | 1.032 | 1.023 | 1.016 | 1.011 | 1.009 | 1.006 | 1.007 | 1.002 | 1.002 | 1.002 | 1.002 |
| Cumulative | 2.602 | 1.595 | 1.303 | 1.194 | 1.127 | 1.092 | 1.068 | 1.051 | 1.039 | 1.030 | 1.024 | 1.017 | 1.014 | 1.012 | 1.010 |

(a) Selections are latest year for the 15-to-27 month through 99-to-111 month factors and three-year average for the subsequent age-to-age factors.


| Incurred Medical Loss Development Factors |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Age-to-Age (in months) (b) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Accident Year | $\underline{27 / 15}$ | 39/27 | 51/39 | 63/51 | 75/63 | 87/75 | 99/87 | 111/99 | 123/111 | 135/123 | 147/135 | 159/147 | 171/159 | 183/171 | 195/183 |
| 1992 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.012 |
| 1993 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.019 | 1.013 |
| 1994 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.006 | 1.008 | 1.021 |
| 1995 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.020 | 1.027 | 1.016 | 1.005 |
| 1996 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.017 | 1.020 | 1.015 | 1.013 | 1.012 |
| 1997 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.024 | 1.023 | 1.018 | 1.009 | 1.010 | 1.005 |
| 1998 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.035 | 1.021 | 1.020 | 1.010 | 1.010 | 1.013 | 1.007 |
| 1999 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.035 | 1.028 | 1.018 | 1.017 | 1.014 | 1.009 | 1.012 | 1.003 |
| 2000 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.041 | 1.022 | 1.019 | 1.022 | 1.016 | 1.017 | 1.012 | 1.005 | 0.998 |
| 2001 |  |  |  |  |  | 1.045 | 1.039 | 1.035 | 1.030 | 1.020 | 1.018 | 1.018 | 1.006 | 0.997 | 0.999 |
| 2002 |  |  |  |  | 1.056 | 1.038 | 1.034 | 1.028 | 1.027 | 1.020 | 1.013 | 1.007 | 0.998 | 0.999 |  |
| 2003 |  |  |  | 1.060 | 1.051 | 1.043 | 1.040 | 1.036 | 1.025 | 1.019 | 1.009 | 1.001 | 0.999 |  |  |
| 2004 |  |  | 1.094 | 1.078 | 1.056 | 1.062 | 1.038 | 1.032 | 1.026 | 1.008 | 1.004 | 0.999 |  |  |  |
| 2005 |  | 1.141 | 1.077 | 1.080 | 1.074 | 1.057 | 1.040 | 1.027 | 1.018 | 1.005 | 1.003 |  |  |  |  |
| 2006 | 1.333 | 1.164 | 1.095 | 1.076 | 1.061 | 1.049 | 1.037 | 1.018 | 1.007 | 1.003 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2007 | 1.357 | 1.171 | 1.114 | 1.078 | 1.069 | 1.041 | 1.029 | 1.016 | 1.005 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2008 | 1.378 | 1.189 | 1.116 | 1.087 | 1.058 | 1.035 | 1.020 | 1.009 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2009 | 1.431 | 1.182 | 1.133 | 1.080 | 1.049 | 1.025 | 1.014 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2010 | 1.431 | 1.212 | 1.117 | 1.068 | 1.036 | 1.022 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2011 | 1.452 | 1.185 | 1.103 | 1.060 | 1.025 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2012 | 1.391 | 1.153 | 1.079 | 1.051 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 1.353 | 1.120 | 1.076 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 1.326 | 1.135 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 1.315 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Selected (a) | 1.315 | 1.135 | 1.076 | 1.051 | 1.025 | 1.022 | 1.014 | 1.009 | 1.010 | 1.005 | 1.005 | 1.002 | 1.001 | 1.000 | 1.000 |
| Cumulative | 1.896 | 1.442 | 1.270 | 1.181 | 1.123 | 1.096 | 1.072 | 1.058 | 1.048 | 1.038 | 1.032 | 1.027 | 1.024 | 1.023 | 1.023 |

$\begin{array}{llllllllllllllll}\text { Selected (a) } & 1.315 & 1.135 & 1.076 & 1.051 & 1.025 & 1.022 & 1.014 & 1.009 & 1.010 & 1.005 & 1.005 & 1.002 & 1.001 & 1.000 & 1.000 \\ \text { Cumulative } & 1.896 & 1.442 & 1.270 & 1.181 & 1.123 & 1.096 & 1.072 & 1.058 & 1.048 & 1.038 & 1.032 & 1.027 & 1.024 & 1.023 & 1.023\end{array}$
(a) Selections are latest year for the 15-to-27 month through 99-to-111 month factors and three-year average for the subsequent age-to-age factors. (b) Incurred medical loss development factors include the paid cost of medical cost containment programs for accident years 2011 and prior.
Incurred Medical Loss Development Factors (Continued)


| Paid Indemnity Loss Development Factors |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Age-to-Age (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Accident Year | 27/15 | 39/27 | 51/39 | 63/51 | 75/63 | 87/75 | 99/87 | 111/99 | 123/111 | 135/123 | 147/135 | 159/147 | 171/159 | 183/171 | 195/183 |
| 1992 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.003 |
| 1993 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.004 | 1.004 |
| 1994 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.006 | 1.005 | 1.003 |
| 1995 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.008 | 1.007 | 1.006 | 1.004 |
| 1996 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.011 | 1.009 | 1.007 | 1.004 | 1.005 |
| 1997 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.015 | 1.011 | 1.007 | 1.007 | 1.006 | 1.005 |
| 1998 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.018 | 1.016 | 1.009 | 1.009 | 1.008 | 1.007 | 1.006 |
| 1999 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.021 | 1.018 | 1.014 | 1.010 | 1.009 | 1.008 | 1.006 | 1.006 |
| 2000 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.030 | 1.022 | 1.015 | 1.012 | 1.010 | 1.009 | 1.007 | 1.007 | 1.004 |
| 2001 |  |  |  |  |  | 1.045 | 1.030 | 1.022 | 1.016 | 1.014 | 1.011 | 1.011 | 1.008 | 1.007 | 1.006 |
| 2002 |  |  |  |  | 1.065 | 1.043 | 1.028 | 1.019 | 1.018 | 1.014 | 1.012 | 1.009 | 1.007 | 1.006 |  |
| 2003 |  |  |  | 1.109 | 1.064 | 1.039 | 1.029 | 1.025 | 1.022 | 1.020 | 1.015 | 1.010 | 1.009 |  |  |
| 2004 |  |  | 1.191 | 1.102 | 1.067 | 1.045 | 1.041 | 1.034 | 1.026 | 1.018 | 1.014 | 1.011 |  |  |  |
| 2005 |  | 1.410 | 1.200 | 1.104 | 1.073 | 1.057 | 1.048 | 1.037 | 1.025 | 1.019 | 1.014 |  |  |  |  |
| 2006 | 2.211 | 1.423 | 1.197 | 1.121 | 1.085 | 1.062 | 1.045 | 1.032 | 1.026 | 1.017 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2007 | 2.243 | 1.436 | 1.211 | 1.127 | 1.085 | 1.061 | 1.042 | 1.032 | 1.025 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2008 | 2.279 | 1.468 | 1.234 | 1.132 | 1.083 | 1.054 | 1.040 | 1.025 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2009 | 2.369 | 1.499 | 1.238 | 1.135 | 1.084 | 1.056 | 1.039 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2010 | 2.399 | 1.505 | 1.240 | 1.129 | 1.081 | 1.053 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2011 | 2.433 | 1.481 | 1.227 | 1.129 | 1.076 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2012 | 2.424 | 1.477 | 1.220 | 1.122 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 2.385 | 1.491 | 1.215 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 2.456 | 1.502 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 2.471 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Selected (a) | 2.471 | 1.502 | 1.215 | 1.122 | 1.076 | 1.053 | 1.039 | 1.025 | 1.025 | 1.018 | 1.014 | 1.010 | 1.008 | 1.007 | 1.005 |
| Cumulative Unadjusted f |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Impact of SB 863 | 6.904 | 2.794 | 1.860 | 1.531 | 1.364 | 1.268 | 1.204 | 1.159 | 1.131 | 1.103 | 1.083 | 1.068 | 1.057 | 1.049 | 1.042 |
| Cumulative Adjusted for Impact of SB 863 (b) | 7.351 | 2.975 | 1.981 | 1.562 | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |

(a) Selections are latest year for the 15-to-27 month through 99-to-111 month factors and three-year average for the subsequent age-to-age factors. (b) The 39-to-ultimate factor for accident year 2014 and the 51-to-ultimate factor for accident year 2013 have been adjusted by $6.5 \%$ and $2.0 \%$,
respectively, for the impacts of SB 863 on indemnity loss development. (See Impact of Senate Bill No. 863 on Loss Development Patterns , WCIRB, August 13, 2013.)


[^3]
## Actuarial Committee

Meeting Agenda for June 16, 2017

| Paid Medical Loss Development Factors |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Unadjusted (a) Accident Year | Age-to-Age (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 27/15 | 39/27 | 51/39 | 63/51 | 75/63 | 87/75 | 99/87 | 111/99 | 123/111 | 135/123 | 147/135 | 159/147 | 171/159 | 183/171 | 195/183 |
| 1992 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.017 |
| 1993 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.013 | 1.012 |
| 1994 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.015 | 1.016 | 1.012 |
| 1995 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.023 | 1.019 | 1.018 | 1.017 |
| 1996 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.025 | 1.023 | 1.022 | 1.014 | 1.014 |
| 1997 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.028 | 1.025 | 1.020 | 1.019 | 1.014 | 1.014 |
| 1998 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.033 | 1.032 | 1.027 | 1.021 | 1.017 | 1.019 | 1.018 |
| 1999 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.031 | 1.035 | 1.030 | 1.025 | 1.020 | 1.016 | 1.018 | 1.018 |
| 2000 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.039 | 1.037 | 1.030 | 1.026 | 1.022 | 1.020 | 1.021 | 1.016 | 1.012 |
| 2001 |  |  |  |  |  | 1.054 | 1.046 | 1.037 | 1.033 | 1.026 | 1.022 | 1.026 | 1.019 | 1.016 | 1.012 |
| 2002 |  |  |  |  | 1.068 | 1.053 | 1.043 | 1.032 | 1.027 | 1.024 | 1.026 | 1.018 | 1.015 | 1.011 |  |
| 2003 |  |  |  | 1.100 | 1.070 | 1.055 | 1.045 | 1.033 | 1.029 | 1.033 | 1.025 | 1.018 | 1.015 |  |  |
| 2004 |  |  | 1.165 | 1.121 | 1.086 | 1.066 | 1.047 | 1.039 | 1.041 | 1.031 | 1.022 | 1.017 |  |  |  |
| 2005 |  | 1.292 | 1.193 | 1.123 | 1.091 | 1.063 | 1.053 | 1.051 | 1.037 | 1.029 | 1.020 |  |  |  |  |
| 2006 | 1.773 | 1.342 | 1.195 | 1.126 | 1.085 | 1.064 | 1.057 | 1.041 | 1.032 | 1.023 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2007 | 1.851 | 1.352 | 1.203 | 1.120 | 1.092 | 1.079 | 1.051 | 1.038 | 1.028 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2008 | 1.826 | 1.359 | 1.208 | 1.134 | 1.098 | 1.067 | 1.047 | 1.033 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2009 | 1.876 | 1.385 | 1.221 | 1.150 | 1.095 | 1.062 | 1.042 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2010 | 1.926 | 1.402 | 1.237 | 1.133 | 1.087 | 1.060 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2011 | 1.957 | 1.401 | 1.217 | 1.131 | 1.082 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2012 | 1.983 | 1.398 | 1.214 | 1.127 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 1.939 | 1.391 | 1.205 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 1.938 | 1.387 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 1.957 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Adjusted (b) |  |  |  |  |  |  | Age | Age (in | nths) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Accident Year | 27/15 | 39/27 | 51/39 | 63/51 | 75/63 | 87/75 | 99/87 | 111/99 | 123/111 | 135/123 | 147/135 | 159/147 | 171/159 | 183/171 | 195/183 |
| 1999 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.019 |
| 2000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.017 | 1.013 |
| 2001 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.020 | 1.018 | 1.013 |
| 2002 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.019 | 1.016 | 1.012 |  |
| 2003 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.027 | 1.019 | 1.016 |  |  |
| 2004 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.033 | 1.024 | 1.019 |  |  |  |
| 2005 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.039 | 1.031 | 1.022 |  |  |  |  |
| 2006 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.043 | 1.035 | 1.025 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2007 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.054 | 1.041 | 1.030 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 1.071 | 1.051 | 1.035 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 1.100 | 1.066 | 1.045 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 1.141 | 1.093 | 1.064 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2011 |  |  | 1.228 | 1.139 | 1.086 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2012 |  | 1.413 | 1.223 | 1.131 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 1.957 | 1.400 | 1.208 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 1.949 | 1.389 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 1.957 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Selected (c) | 1.957 | 1.389 | 1.208 | 1.131 | 1.086 | 1.064 | 1.045 | 1.035 | 1.035 | 1.030 | 1.024 | 1.019 | 1.017 | 1.016 | 1.015 |
| Cumulative | 6.379 | 3.259 | 2.347 | 1.943 | 1.718 | 1.582 | 1.486 | 1.422 | 1.374 | 1.328 | 1.290 | 1.259 | 1.236 | 1.215 | 1.196 |

[^4]IV-A-10
WCIRB California®

| Accident Year |
| :---: |
| 1981 |
| 1982 |
| 1983 |
| 1984 |
| 1985 |
| 1986 |
| 1987 |
| 1988 |
| 1989 |
| 1990 |
| 1991 |
| 1992 |
| 1993 |
| 1994 |
| 1995 |
| 1996 |
| 1997 |

# Paid Indemnity Loss Development Factors <br> With Separate Adjustments on Open and Closed Claims for Changes in Claim Settlement Rates 

## A. Total Reported Indemnity Claim Counts

| Accident Year | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | 39 | 51 | 63 | $\underline{75}$ |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 118,144 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 112,428 | 112,740 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 115,543 | 116,134 | 116,466 |
| 2011 |  |  | 115,877 | 117,092 | 117,782 | 118,150 |
| 2012 |  | 119,843 | 122,845 | 124,144 | 124,921 |  |
| 2013 | 116,550 | 128,262 | 131,489 | 132,794 |  |  |
| 2014 | 121,326 | 134,394 | 137,527 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 126,704 | 140,302 |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 129,131 |  |  |  |  |  |

## B. Development of Total Reported Indemnity Claim Counts

| Accident Year | Age-to-Age Development (in months): |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15-27 | 27-39 | 39-51 | 51-63 | 63-75 | 75-Ultimate |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 1.003 |  |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 1.005 | 1.003 |  |
| 2011 |  |  | 1.010 | 1.006 | 1.003 |  |
| 2012 |  | 1.025 | 1.011 | 1.006 |  |  |
| 2013 | 1.100 | 1.025 | 1.010 |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 1.108 | 1.023 |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 1.107 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Latest Year | 1.107 | 1.023 | 1.010 | 1.006 | 1.003 |  |
| Cumulative | 1.163 | 1.050 | 1.026 | 1.016 | 1.010 | 1.006 |
| Acc. Year | $\underline{2016}$ | $\underline{2015}$ | $\underline{2014}$ | $\underline{2013}$ | $\underline{2012}$ | $\underline{2011}$ |
| Ult. Claim Counts | 150,132 | 147,311 | 141,108 | 134,912 | 126,124 | 118,917 |

## C. Closed Indemnity Claim Counts

| Accident Year | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | 39 | 51 | 63 | $\underline{75}$ |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 101,531 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 90,535 | 96,584 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 86,390 | 95,260 | 101,568 |
| 2011 |  |  | 75,627 | 88,983 | 98,136 | 104,174 |
| 2012 |  | 62,104 | 81,994 | 96,094 | 105,545 |  |
| 2013 | 38,950 | 67,874 | 89,572 | 105,005 |  |  |
| 2014 | 41,091 | 72,635 | 95,523 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 43,814 | 78,256 |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 47,216 |  |  |  |  |  |

Source: Accident year experience of insurers with available claim count data

Paid Indemnity Loss Development Factors With Separate Adjustments on Open and Closed Claims for Changes in Claim Settlement Rates
D. Ultimate Indemnity Claim Settlement Ratio (a)

| Accident Year | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | $\underline{39}$ | $\underline{51}$ | $\underline{63}$ | $\underline{75}$ |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 85.3\% |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 79.7\% | 85.0\% |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 73.7\% | 81.3\% | 86.6\% |
| 2011 |  |  | 63.6\% | 74.8\% | 82.5\% | 87.6\% |
| 2012 |  | 49.2\% | 65.0\% | 76.2\% | 83.7\% |  |
| 2013 | 28.9\% | 50.3\% | 66.4\% | 77.8\% |  |  |
| 2014 | 29.1\% | 51.5\% | 67.7\% |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 29.7\% | 53.1\% |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 31.4\% |  |  |  |  |  |

E. Adjusted Closed Indemnity Claim Counts at Equal Percentiles of Ultimate Claim Counts (b)

| Accident Year | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | 39 | 51 | $\underline{63}$ | $\underline{75}$ |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 104,226 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 95,108 | 99,562 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 91,236 | 98,095 | 102,689 |
| 2011 |  |  | 80,501 | 92,555 | 99,513 | 104,174 |
| 2012 |  | 67,001 | 85,380 | 98,165 | 105,545 |  |
| 2013 | 42,429 | 71,670 | 91,329 | 105,005 |  |  |
| 2014 | 44,378 | 74,961 | 95,523 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 46,329 | 78,256 |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 47,216 |  |  |  |  |  |

F. Average Paid Indemnity per Closed Claim

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| $\underline{\text { Year }}$ | $\underline{15}$ | $\underline{27}$ | $\underline{39}$ | $\underline{51}$ | $\underline{63}$ | $\underline{75}$ |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 15,950 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 12,556 | 15,825 |
| 2010 |  |  | 9,471 | 12,907 | 15,821 |  |
| 2011 |  | 5,922 | 10,054 | 13,298 | 15,597 | 17,247 |
| 2012 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 2,718 | 6,340 | 10,498 | 13,647 |  |  |
| 2014 | 3,012 | 7,390 | 11,147 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 3,259 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 |  |  |  |  |  |  |

(a) Ratio of closed indemnity claim counts (Item C) to the estimated ultimate indemnity claim counts (Item B) for that accident year.
(b) The claim counts for the latest evaluation of each accident year are equal to the reported number of closed indemnity claims. All prior evaluations shown are the product of the latest ultimate indemnity claim settlement ratio (Item D) and the ultimate indemnity claim counts (Item B) for that accident year.

Source: Accident year experience of insurers with available claim count data

# Paid Indemnity Loss Development Factors With Separate Adjustments on Open and Closed Claims for Changes in Claim Settlement Rates 

## G. Adjusted Average Paid Indemnity per Closed Claim (c)

| Accident Year | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | $\underline{39}$ | 51 | 63 | $\underline{75}$ |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 16,811 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 16,310 | 17,900 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 13,943 | 16,094 | 17,644 |
| 2011 |  |  | 10,604 | 13,880 | 15,934 | 17,316 |
| 2012 |  | 6,746 | 10,753 | 13,771 | 15,597 |  |
| 2013 | 2,928 | 6,925 | 10,816 | 13,647 |  |  |
| 2014 | 2,987 | 7,078 | 11,147 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 3,216 | 7,390 |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 3,259 |  |  |  |  |  |

## H. Adjusted Paid Indemnity on Closed Claims (in \$000) (d)

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | :---: |
| Year | $\underline{15}$ | $\underline{27}$ | $\underline{39}$ | $\underline{51}$ | $\underline{63}$ | $\underline{75}$ |  |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | $1,752,103$ |  |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | $1,272,120$ | $1,578,744$ |  |
| 2010 |  |  | 853,632 | $1,284,636$ | $1,585,676$ | $1,811,893,871$ |  |
| 2011 |  | 452,015 | 918,067 | $1,351,865$ | $1,646,166$ |  |  |
| 2012 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 124,244 | 496,304 | 987,859 | $1,432,983$ |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 132,569 | 530,563 | $1,064,821$ |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 149,013 | 578,297 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 153,872 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

## I. Paid Indemnity on Open Claims (in \$000)

| Accident Year | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | $\underline{39}$ | 51 | 63 | $\underline{75}$ |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 682,930 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 759,011 | 654,527 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 834,297 | 716,745 | 588,940 |
| 2011 |  |  | 850,428 | 773,336 | 639,826 | 526,053 |
| 2012 |  | 760,449 | 840,851 | 750,231 | 628,559 |  |
| 2013 | 402,274 | 774,875 | 855,512 | 748,285 |  |  |
| 2014 | 418,425 | 815,983 | 892,485 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 445,728 | 849,352 |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 459,791 |  |  |  |  |  |

(c) Adjusted based on ultimate indemnity claim settlement ratios (Item D) and assuming a log-linear relationship between maturities.
(d) Each amount is the product of the adjusted closed indemnity claim counts (Item E) and the adjusted average paid indemnity per closed claim (Item G), and divided by \$1,000.

Source: Accident year experience of insurers with available claim count data

## Paid Indemnity Loss Development Factors With Separate Adjustments on Open and Closed Claims for Changes in Claim Settlement Rates

J. Average Paid Indemnity per Open Claim for Indemnity Claims in Transition (e)

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Year | $\underline{15}$ | $\underline{27}$ | $\underline{39}$ | $\underline{51}$ | $\underline{63}$ | $\underline{75}$ |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 41,108 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 34,669 | 40,513 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 28,618 | 34,337 | 39,531 |
| 2011 |  |  | 21,129 | 27,512 | 32,568 | 37,640 |
| 2012 |  |  | 13,170 | 20,583 | 26,746 | 32,440 |
| 2013 | 5,184 | 12,832 | 20,410 | 26,927 |  |  |
| 2014 | 5,215 | 13,212 | 21,248 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 5,377 | 13,689 |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 5,613 |  |  |  |  |  |

K. Changes in Paid Indemnity on Open Claims Resulting from the Impact of Changes in Claim Settlement Rates (in \$000) (f)

| Accident Year | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | 39 | 51 | $\underline{63}$ | $\underline{75}$ |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | -110,787 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | -158,542 | -120,648 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | -138,682 | -97,345 | -44,315 |
| 2011 |  |  | -102,981 | -98,273 | -44,846 |  |
| 2012 |  | -64,496 | -69,695 | -55,391 |  |  |
| 2013 | -18,035 | -48,709 | -35,860 |  |  |  |
| 2014 | -17,142 | -30,732 |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 | -13,524 |  |  |  |  |  |

L. Adjusted Paid Indemnity on Open Claims (in \$000) (g)

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Year | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | 39 | 51 | 63 | 75 |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 572,144 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 600,469 | 533,880 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 695,614 | 619,400 | 544,625 |
| 2011 |  |  | 747,447 | 675,063 | 594,980 | 526,053 |
| 2012 |  | 695,953 | 771,156 | 694,840 | 628,559 |  |
| 2013 | 384,239 | 726,166 | 819,653 | 748,285 |  |  |
| 2014 | 401,283 | 785,251 | 892,485 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 432,204 | 849,352 |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 459,791 |  |  |  |  |  |

(e) Each amount is equal to the product of [the average monthly indemnity payment per open indemnity claim] and [the number of months for the current evaluation]. For evaluations indicating claim settlement rate decreases, the average monthly indemnity payment per open indemnity claim at the prior evaluation is used. For evaluations indicating claim settlement rate increases, the average monthly indemnity payment per open indemnity claim at the same evaluation is used.
(f) Each amount is equal to [the difference between unadjusted and adjusted closed indemnity claim counts (Items C and E)] multiplied by the corresponding [average paid indemnity per open claim for indemnity claims in transition (Item J)].
(g) Each amount is the sum of [paid indemnity on open claims (Item I)] and the corresponding [incremental changes in paid indemnity on open claims resulting from the impact of changes in claim settlement rates (Item K)].

Source: Accident year experience of insurers with available claim count data

# Paid Indemnity Loss Development Factors With Separate Adjustments on Open and Closed Claims for Changes in Claim Settlement Rates 

M. Adjusted Total Paid Indemnity (in \$000) (h)

| Accident <br> Year | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | $\underline{39}$ | 51 | 63 | $\underline{75}$ |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 2,324,247 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 2,151,711 | 2,316,031 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 1,967,734 | 2,198,145 | 2,356,515 |
| 2011 |  |  | 1,601,080 | 1,959,699 | 2,180,656 | 2,329,924 |
| 2012 |  | 1,147,969 | 1,689,222 | 2,046,705 | 2,274,726 |  |
| 2013 | 508,483 | 1,222,471 | 1,807,512 | 2,181,268 |  |  |
| 2014 | 533,852 | 1,315,814 | 1,957,305 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 581,217 | 1,427,649 |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 613,663 |  |  |  |  |  |

N. Paid Indemnity Loss Development Factors Based on Adjusted Total Paid Indemnity

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Year <br> 2008 | $\underline{15-27}$ | $\underline{27-39}$ | $\underline{39-51}$ | $\underline{51-63}$ | $\underline{63-75}$ |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 1.117 | 1.076 |
| 2011 |  |  | 1.471 | 1.212 | 1.113 |
| 2012 |  |  |  | 1.072 | 1.068 |
| 2013 | 2.404 | 1.479 | 1.207 |  |  |
| 2014 | 2.465 | 1.488 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 2.456 |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Latest Year | 2.456 | 1.488 | 1.207 | 1.111 | 1.068 |
| 3-Year Average | 2.442 | 1.479 | 1.214 | 1.114 | 1.072 |

O. Paid Indemnity Loss Development Factors (i)

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Year | $\underline{15-27}$ | $\underline{27-39}$ | $\underline{39-51}$ | $\underline{51-63}$ | $\underline{63-75}$ |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 1.085 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 1.227 | 1.127 |
| 2011 |  | 1.476 | 1.218 | 1.122 | 1.081 |
| 2012 | 2.387 | 1.490 | 1.215 |  |  |
| 2013 | 2.460 | 1.501 |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 2.471 |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 |  |  |  |  |  |

(h) Each amount is the sum of the adjusted paid indemnity on closed claims (Item H) and the adjusted paid indemnity on open claims (Item L).
(i) Development factors are based on paid indemnity losses from the same insurer mix as that used in the adjustment for changes in claim settlement rates and applied in the calculation of the development factors in Item N.

Source: Accident year experience of insurers with available claim count data

## Paid Indemnity Loss Development Factors With Separate Adjustments on Open and Closed Claims for Changes in Claim Settlement Rates

P. Impact of Adjustment for Changes in Claim Settlement Rates (j)

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Year | $\underline{15-27}$ | $\underline{27-39}$ | $\underline{39-51}$ | $\underline{51-63}$ | $\underline{63-75}$ |  |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | $-0.77 \%$ |  |
| 2010 |  |  | $-0.22 \%$ | $-1.01 \%$ | $-0.81 \%$ |  |
| 2011 |  | $-0.30 \%$ | $-0.52 \%$ | $-0.91 \%$ | $-0.69 \%$ |  |
| 2012 | $0.72 \%$ | $-0.77 \%$ | $-0.65 \%$ |  |  |  |
| 2013 | $0.18 \%$ | $-0.87 \%$ |  |  |  |  |
| 2014 | $-0.60 \%$ |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Q. Paid Indemnity Loss Development Factors Adjusted for Changes in Indemnity Claim Settlement Rates (k)

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :---: |
| Year | $\underline{15-27}$ | $\underline{27-39}$ | $\underline{39-51}$ | $\underline{51-63}$ | $\underline{63-75}$ |  |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 1.076 |  |
| 2010 |  |  | 1.224 | 1.118 | 1.072 |  |
| 2011 |  | 1.473 | 1.214 | 1.112 | 1.069 |  |
| 2012 | 2.402 | 1.479 | 1.207 |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 2.460 | 1.489 |  |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 2.456 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 2.456 | 1.489 | 1.207 | 1.112 | 1.069 |  |
| Latest Year | 2.440 | 1.480 | 1.215 | 1.115 | 1.072 |  |

(j) Each factor represents the change in age-to-age development factors from Item O to those in Item N.
(k) Each factor is the product of [1.0 + the impact of adjustment for changes in claim settlement rates (Item P)] and [the paid indemnity age-to-age development factor from Exhibit 2.5.1].

Source: Accident year experience of insurers with available claim count data

## Actuarial Committee

Meeting Agenda for June 16, 2017
Unadjusted (a)


| Adjusted (b) |
| :--- |
| Accident Year |
| 1996 |
| 1997 |
| 1998 |
| 1999 |
| 2000 |
| 2001 |
| 2002 |
| 2003 |
| 2004 |
| 2005 |
| 2006 |
| 2007 |
| 2008 |
| 2009 |
| 2010 |
| 2011 |
| 2012 |
| 2013 |
| 2014 |
| 2015 |

IV-A-19
WCIRB California®

Actuarial Committee
Meeting Agenda for June 16, 2017
Selected Medical Development Factors - Paid to Age 231, Incurred from Age 231 to Ultimate (Continued)


| Accident $Y$ |
| ---: |
| 1983 |
| 1984 |
| 1985 |
| 1986 |
| 1987 |
| 1988 |
| 1989 |
| 1990 |
| 1991 |
| 1992 |
| 1993 |
| 1994 |
| 1995 |
| 1996 |
| 1997 |

## Paid Medical Loss Development Factors <br> With Separate Adjustments on Open and Closed Claims for Changes in Claim Settlement Rates

## A. Total Reported Indemnity Claim Counts

| Accident Year | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | $\underline{39}$ | 51 | $\underline{63}$ | $\underline{75}$ |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 116,431 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 111,064 | 111,376 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 114,140 | 114,734 | 115,066 |
| 2011 |  |  | 115,877 | 117,092 | 117,782 | 118,150 |
| 2012 |  | 119,843 | 122,845 | 124,144 | 124,921 |  |
| 2013 | 116,550 | 128,262 | 131,489 | 132,794 |  |  |
| 2014 | 121,326 | 134,394 | 137,527 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 126,704 | 140,302 |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 129,131 |  |  |  |  |  |

## B. Development of Total Reported Indemnity Claim Counts

| Accident Year | Age-to-Age Development (in months): |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15-27 | 27-39 | 39-51 | 51-63 | 63-75 | 75-Ultimate |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 1.003 |  |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 1.005 | 1.003 |  |
| 2011 |  |  | 1.010 | 1.006 | 1.003 |  |
| 2012 |  | 1.025 | 1.011 | 1.006 |  |  |
| 2013 | 1.100 | 1.025 | 1.010 |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 1.108 | 1.023 |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 1.107 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Latest Year | 1.107 | 1.023 | 1.010 | 1.006 | 1.003 |  |
| Cumulative | 1.162 | 1.050 | 1.026 | 1.016 | 1.010 | 1.006 |
| Acc. Year | $\underline{2016}$ | $\underline{2015}$ | $\underline{2014}$ | $\underline{2013}$ | $\underline{2012}$ | $\underline{2011}$ |
| Ult. Claim Counts | 150,114 | 147,292 | 141,090 | 134,896 | 126,109 | 118,902 |

## C. Closed Indemnity Claim Counts

| Accident Year | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | $\underline{39}$ | 51 | $\underline{63}$ | $\underline{75}$ |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 99,963 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 89,342 | 95,340 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 85,218 | 94,012 | 100,276 |
| 2011 |  |  | 75,627 | 88,983 | 98,136 | 104,174 |
| 2012 |  | 62,104 | 81,994 | 96,094 | 105,545 |  |
| 2013 | 38,950 | 67,874 | 89,572 | 105,005 |  |  |
| 2014 | 41,091 | 72,635 | 95,523 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 43,814 | 78,256 |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 47,216 |  |  |  |  |  |

Source: Accident year experience of insurers with available claim count and paid loss data

## Paid Medical Loss Development Factors With Separate Adjustments on Open and Closed Claims for Changes in Claim Settlement Rates

D. Ultimate Indemnity Claim Settlement Ratio (a)

| Accident Year | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | $\underline{39}$ | $\underline{51}$ | $\underline{63}$ | $\underline{75}$ |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 85.3\% |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 79.6\% | 84.9\% |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 73.6\% | 81.2\% | 86.6\% |
| 2011 |  |  | 63.6\% | 74.8\% | 82.5\% | 87.6\% |
| 2012 |  | 49.2\% | 65.0\% | 76.2\% | 83.7\% |  |
| 2013 | 28.9\% | 50.3\% | 66.4\% | 77.8\% |  |  |
| 2014 | 29.1\% | 51.5\% | 67.7\% |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 29.7\% | 53.1\% |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 31.5\% |  |  |  |  |  |

E. Adjusted Closed Indemnity Claim Counts at Equal Percentiles of Ultimate Claim Counts (b)

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Year | $\underline{15}$ | $\underline{27}$ | $\underline{39}$ | $\underline{51}$ | $\underline{63}$ | $\underline{75}$ |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 102,726 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 90,139 | 96,916 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 80,501 | 92,555 | 99,513 |
| 2011 |  | 67,001 | 85,380 | 98,165 | 105,545 | 104,174 |
| 2012 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 42,429 | 71,670 | 91,329 | 105,005 |  |  |
| 2014 | 44,378 | 74,961 | 95,523 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 46,329 | 78,256 |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 47,216 |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

F. Average Paid Medical per Closed Indemnity Claim

| Accident Year | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | 39 | $\underline{51}$ | $\underline{63}$ | $\underline{75}$ |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 19,149 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 18,015 | 20,826 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 15,156 | 18,745 | 21,612 |
| 2011 |  |  | 10,647 | 14,689 | 18,122 | 20,812 |
| 2012 |  | 6,569 | 11,011 | 14,672 | 17,598 |  |
| 2013 | 2,981 | 6,712 | 10,976 | 14,334 |  |  |
| 2014 | 2,998 | 6,886 | 11,010 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 3,250 | 7,317 |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 3,504 |  |  |  |  |  |

(a) Ratio of closed indemnity claim counts (Item C) to the estimated ultimate indemnity claim counts (Item B) for that accident year.
(b) The claim counts for the latest evaluation of each accident year are equal to the reported number of closed indemnity claims. All prior evaluations shown are the product of the latest ultimate indemnity claim settlement ratio (Item D) and the ultimate indemnity claim counts (Item B) for that accident year.

Source: Accident year experience of insurers with available claim count and paid loss data

# Paid Medical Loss Development Factors <br> With Separate Adjustments on Open and Closed Claims for Changes in Claim Settlement Rates 

## G. Adjusted Average Paid Medical per Closed Indemnity Claim (c)

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | ---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | ---: | :---: |
| Year | $\underline{15}$ | $\underline{27}$ | $\underline{39}$ | $\underline{51}$ | $\underline{63}$ | $\underline{75}$ |  |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 18,353 |  |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  |  | 20,146 |  |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 17,070 | 20,024 | 22,421 |  |
| 2011 |  |  |  | 11,974 | 15,944 | 18,704 |  |
| 2012 |  | 7,460 | 11,797 | 15,269 | 17,598 |  |  |
| 2013 | 3,287 | 7,315 | 11,314 | 14,334 |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 3,270 | 7,223 | 11,010 |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 3,449 | 7,317 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 3,504 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

## H. Adjusted Paid Medical (in \$000) on Closed Indemnity Claims (d)

| Accident Year | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | $\underline{39}$ | 51 | $\underline{63}$ | 75 |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 1,885,378 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 1,893,086 | 2,205,479 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 1,538,714 | 1,940,606 | 2,258,868 |
| 2011 |  |  | 963,901 | 1,475,734 | 1,861,292 | 2,168,043 |
| 2012 |  | 499,825 | 1,007,242 | 1,498,876 | 1,857,330 |  |
| 2013 | 139,447 | 524,268 | 1,033,337 | 1,505,142 |  |  |
| 2014 | 145,096 | 541,431 | 1,051,726 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 159,777 | 572,589 |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 165,464 |  |  |  |  |  |

## I. Paid Medical on Open Indemnity Claims (in \$000)

| Accident <br> Year | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15 | $\underline{\underline{27}}$ | $\underline{39}$ | 51 | $\underline{63}$ | 75 |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 1,002,964 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 1,078,558 | 976,892 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 1,140,709 | 1,020,754 | 873,963 |
| 2011 |  |  | 1,071,922 | 1,027,103 | 891,617 | 741,766 |
| 2012 |  | 906,606 | 1,004,809 | 937,687 | 805,266 |  |
| 2013 | 510,592 | 888,863 | 958,302 | 868,650 |  |  |
| 2014 | 512,845 | 880,224 | 937,502 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 522,717 | 887,340 |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 557,119 |  |  |  |  |  |

(c) Adjusted based on ultimate indemnity claim settlement ratios (Item D) and assuming a loglinear relationship between maturities.
(d) Each amount is equal to the product of [adjusted closed indemnity claim counts (Item E)] and [adjusted average paid medical per closed indemnity claim (Item G)], and divided by \$1,000.

Source: Accident year experience of insurers with available claim count and paid loss data

## Paid Medical Loss Development Factors With Separate Adjustments on Open and Closed Claims for Changes in Claim Settlement Rates

J. Average Paid Medical per Open Indemnity Claim for Indemnity Claims in Transition (e)

| Accident Year | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | 39 | 51 | 63 | 75 |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 60,904 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 49,653 | 60,919 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 39,441 | 49,259 | 59,091 |
| 2011 |  |  | 26,632 | 36,540 | 45,384 | 54,029 |
| 2012 |  | 15,702 | 24,597 | 33,429 | 41,295 |  |
| 2013 | 6,580 | 14,719 | 22,862 | 29,896 |  |  |
| 2014 | 6,392 | 14,253 | 20,587 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 6,306 | 11,351 |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 4,614 |  |  |  |  |  |

K. Changes in Paid Medical on Open Indemnity Claims Resulting from the Impact of Changes in Indemnity Claim Settlement Rates (in \$000) (f)

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | :---: |
| Year | $\underline{15}$ | $\underline{27}$ | $\underline{39}$ | $\underline{51}$ | $\underline{63}$ | $\underline{75}$ |  |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | $-168,277$ |  |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | $-194,089$ | $-143,595$ |  |
| 2010 |  |  | $-184,401$ |  |  |  |  |
| 2011 |  |  | $-129,802$ | $-130,521$ | $-62,494$ | $-69,669$ |  |
| 2012 | $-22,891$ | $-56,892$ | $-83,285$ | $-69,232$ |  |  |  |
| 2013 | $-21,010$ | $-33,151$ | $-40,168$ |  |  |  |  |
| 2014 | $-15,860$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

L. Adjusted Paid Medical on Open Indemnity Claims (in \$000) (g)

| Accident <br> Year | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | 39 | 51 | 63 | 75 |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 834,687 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 848,964 | 792,491 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 946,620 | 877,705 | 804,294 |
| 2011 |  |  | 942,120 | 896,582 | 829,123 | 741,766 |
| 2012 |  | 829,714 | 921,524 | 868,455 | 805,266 |  |
| 2013 | 487,701 | 832,989 | 918,134 | 868,650 |  |  |
| 2014 | 491,835 | 847,073 | 937,502 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 506,857 | 887,340 |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 557,119 |  |  |  |  |  |

(e) Each amount is equal to the product of [the average monthly medical payment per open indemnity claim] and [the number of months for the current evaluation]. For evaluations indicating claim settlement rate decreases, the average monthly medical payment per open indemnity claim at the prior evaluation is used. For evaluations indicating claim settlement rate increases, the average monthly medical payment per open indemnity claim at the same evaluation is used.
(f) Each amount is equal to [the difference between unadjusted and adjusted closed indemnity claim counts (Items C and E)] multiplied by [the corresponding average paid medical per open indemnity claim for indemnity claims in transition (Item J)].
(g) Each amount is the sum of [paid medical on open indemnity claims (Item I)] and the corresponding [incremental changes in paid medical on open indemnity claims resulting from the impact of changes in indemnity claim settlement rates (Item K)].

Source: Accident year experience of insurers with available claim count and paid loss data

Paid Medical Loss Development Factors
With Separate Adjustments on Open and Closed Claims for Changes in Claim Settlement Rates
M. Paid Medical on Medical-Only Claims (in \$000)

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| $\underline{\text { Year }}$ | $\underline{15}$ | $\underline{27}$ | $\underline{39}$ | $\underline{51}$ | $\underline{63}$ | $\underline{75}$ |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 236,736 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 215,365 | 218,863 |
| 2010 |  |  | 202,616 | 210,818 | 216,310 | 220,934 |
| 2011 |  |  |  | 219,401 |  |  |
| 2012 | 173,466 | 207,084 | 215,881 | 221,735 |  |  |
| 2013 | 195,050 | 229,611 | 239,258 |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 203,866 | 241,385 |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 218,710 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 |  |  |  |  |  |  |

N. Adjusted Total Paid Medical (in \$000) (h)

| Accident Year | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | $\underline{39}$ | 51 | 63 | $\underline{75}$ |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  | 2,956,801 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 2,961,572 | 3,220,665 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 2,737,282 | 3,077,467 | 3,327,852 |
| 2011 |  |  | 2,304,406 | 2,804,712 | 3,147,555 | 3,382,671 |
| 2012 |  | 1,532,155 | 2,139,584 | 2,583,641 | 2,883,529 |  |
| 2013 | 800,614 | 1,564,342 | 2,167,351 | 2,595,526 |  |  |
| 2014 | 831,981 | 1,618,115 | 2,228,486 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 870,500 | 1,701,315 |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 941,294 |  |  |  |  |  |

O. Paid Medical Loss Development Factors Based on Adjusted Total Paid Medical

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Year <br> 2009 | $\underline{15-27}$ | $\underline{27-39}$ | $\underline{39-51}$ | $\underline{51-63}$ | $\underline{63-75}$ |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 1.217 | 1.122 |
| 2011 |  |  | 1.396 | 1.208 | 1.116 |
| 2012 | 1.954 | 1.385 | 1.198 |  | 1.075 |
| 2013 | 1.945 | 1.377 |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 1.954 |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 1.954 | 1.377 | 1.198 | 1.116 | 1.075 |

(h) Each amount is the sum of [adjusted paid medical on closed indemnity claims (Item H)], [adjusted paid medical on open indemnity claims (Item L)] and [paid medical on medical-only claims (Item M)]. The effect of the paid cost of medical cost containment programs are only present for accident years 2011 and prior.

Source: Accident year experience of insurers with available claim count and paid loss data

# Paid Medical Loss Development Factors With Separate Adjustments on Open and Closed Claims for Changes in Claim Settlement Rates 

## P. Paid Medical Loss Development Factors (i)

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :---: |
| Year | $\underline{15-27}$ | $\underline{27-39}$ | $\underline{39-51}$ | $\underline{51-63}$ | $\underline{63-75}$ |  |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 1.095 |  |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 1.216 | 1.133 |  |
| 2011 |  | 1.396 | 1.210 | 1.125 | 1.087 |  |
| 2012 | 1.939 | 1.390 | 1.203 |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 1.937 | 1.384 |  |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 1.958 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Q. Impact of Adjustment for Changes in Indemnity Claim Settlement Rates (j)

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | ---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | ---: |
| Year | $\underline{15-27}$ | $\underline{27-39}$ | $\underline{39-51}$ | $\underline{51-63}$ | $\underline{63-75}$ |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | $-0.73 \%$ |
| 2010 |  |  |  |  | $-0.80 \%$ |
| 2011 |  | $0.01 \%$ | $-0.23 \%$ | $-0.72 \%$ | $-0.49 \%$ |
| 2012 | $0.77 \%$ | $-0.36 \%$ | $-0.46 \%$ |  | $-0.65 \%$ |
| 2013 | $0.39 \%$ | $-0.50 \%$ |  |  |  |
| 2014 | $-0.17 \%$ |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 |  |  |  |  |  |

R. Paid Medical Loss Development Factors Adjusted for Changes in Indemnity Claim Settlement Rates (k)

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months) |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Year | $\underline{15-27}$ | $\underline{27-39}$ | $\underline{39-51}$ | $\underline{51-63}$ | $\underline{63-75}$ |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  | 1.132 |
| 2010 |  |  |  | 1.229 | 1.131 |
| 2011 | 1.972 | 1.395 | 1.220 | 1.122 | 1.079 |
| 2012 | 1.957 | 1.382 | 1.202 |  |  |
| 2013 | 1.954 |  |  |  |  |
| 2014 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 1.954 | 1.382 | 1.202 | 1.122 | 1.079 |
|  | 1.961 | 1.397 | 1.217 | 1.128 | 1.086 |

(i) Development factors are based on paid medical losses from the same insurer mix as that used in the adjustment for changes in claim settlement rates and applied in the calculation of the development factors in Item O .
(j) Each factor represents the change in age-to-age development factors from Item P to those in Item O.
(k) Each factor is the product of [1.0 + the impact of adjustment for changes in claim settlement rates (Item Q)] and [the adjusted paid medical age-to-age development factor from Exhibit 2.6.1].

Source: Accident year experience of insurers with available claim count and paid loss data

Developed Indemnity Loss Ratios Using Selected Loss Development Factors
Adjusted for Changes in Claim Settlement Rates
Based on Experience as of March 31, 2017

(a) Based on Exhibit 1. To reflect the selected loss development methodology, reported loss ratios displayed prior to 1999 are on an incurred basis.
Subsequent reported loss ratios are on a paid basis.
(b) See Exhibits 2.5.1 and 2.5.2.

## Developed Medical Loss Ratios Using Selected Loss Development Factors Adjusted for Changes in Claim Settlement Rates with Adjustment for SB 863 Based on Experience as of March 31, 2017


(a) Based on Exhibit 1. Paid MCCP costs are excluded from accident years 2011 and subsequent. To reflect the selected loss development methodology, reported loss ratios displayed prior to 1999 are on an incurred basis. Subsequent reported loss ratios are on a paid basis.
(b) Based on experience evaluated as of December 31, 2016. Reflects an adjustment for SB 863 of $-4.2 \%$ applied to payments made before January 1, 2013, and adjustments for RBRVS of - $2.1 \%$ applied to payments made before January 1, 2014, and -1.7\% applied to payments made before January 1, 2015. No adjustments are applied to the incurred loss ratios.
(c) Based on Exhibits 2.6.1 and 2.6.2. Reflects an adjustment for SB 863 of $-4.2 \%$ applied to payments made before January 1, 2013, and adjustments for RBRVS of $-2.1 \%$ applied to payments made before January 1, 2014, and $-1.7 \%$ applied to payments made before January 1, 2015.
(d) The developed medical loss ratios shown were derived based on an adjustment for SB 863 and RBRVS. They are only for purposes of projecting future medical loss ratios and do not reflect true estimates of ultimate loss ratios for those accident years.

IV-A-28
WCIRB California®

## Indemnity Benefit Level Factors

| Accident Year | (1) <br> Annual Benefit Change Prior to Frequency Adjustments (a) |  | (3) <br> Annual Impact on Indemnity Benefits Due to Wage Inflation (b) | (4) <br> Annual Cost Impact on Indemnity (c) | (5) <br> Composite Indemnity Adjustment Factor (d) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | Frequency |  |  |  |
|  |  | Adjustments (a) |  |  |  |
| 1985 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 2.0 | 2.0 | 1.542 |
| 1986 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 1.6 | 1.6 | 1.517 |
| 1987 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 1.9 | 1.9 | 1.489 |
| 1988 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 1.5 | 1.5 | 1.467 |
| 1989 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 1.5 | 1.5 | 1.445 |
| 1990 | 2.3 | 19.9 | 1.7 | 24.7 | 1.159 |
| 1991 | 4.9 | 14.8 | 0.8 | 21.4 | 0.955 |
| 1992 | 1.8 | -8.3 | 1.6 | -5.2 | 1.006 |
| 1993 | 0.2 | -18.1 | 0.4 | -17.6 | 1.222 |
| 1994 | -5.1 | 0.2 | 0.6 | -4.3 | 1.277 |
| 1995 | 6.3 | 0.6 | 1.0 | 8.0 | 1.182 |
| 1996 | 5.3 | 0.4 | 1.2 | 7.0 | 1.105 |
| 1997 | 9.7 | 0.2 | 1.6 | 11.7 | 0.990 |
| 1998 | 6.5 | 0.0 | 1.8 | 8.4 | 0.913 |
| 1999 | 5.7 | 0.0 | 2.1 | 7.9 | 0.846 |
| 2000 | 3.9 | 0.0 | 3.1 | 7.1 | 0.789 |
| 2001 | -0.3 | 0.0 | 0.2 | -0.1 | 0.790 |
| 2002 | -0.7 | 0.0 | 0.2 | -0.5 | 0.811 (e) |
| 2003 | 7.3 | 0.0 | 1.1 | 8.5 | 0.811 (e) |
| 2004 | -6.0 | -13.7 | 1.6 | -17.6 | 1.117 (e) |
| 2005 | -31.6 | -15.3 | 1.1 | -41.5 | 1.516 |
| 2006 | 5.6 | -5.7 | 1.6 | 1.2 | 1.499 |
| 2007 | 1.6 | 0.0 | 1.6 | 3.2 | 1.452 |
| 2008 | 4.8 | 0.6 | 0.7 | 6.2 | 1.368 |
| 2009 | 0.4 | 1.4 | 0.2 | 2.0 | 1.341 |
| 2010 | 0.4 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 1.4 | 1.322 |
| 2011 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 1.6 | 1.6 | 1.301 |
| 2012 | 0.3 | 0.0 | 2.1 | 2.4 | 1.271 |
| 2013 | 2.2 | 0.2 | 0.4 | 2.8 | 1.236 |
| 2014 | 7.0 | 1.5 | 1.7 | 10.4 | 1.119 |
| 2015 | 0.3 | 0.0 | 2.3 | 2.6 | 1.091 |
| 2016 | 0.3 | 0.0 | 1.7 | 2.0 | 1.070 |
| 2017 | 0.5 | 0.0 | 2.4 | 2.9 |  |
| 2018 | 0.4 | 0.0 | 2.4 | 2.8 |  |
| 1/1/2019 | 0.2 (Annual 0.4) | 0.0 | 1.0 (Annu | 2) 1.2 |  |

(a) Based on WCIRB evaluations of the average impact of legislative changes on the cost of indemnity benefits. These annual changes in benefits reflect the WCIRB's retrospective estimates of the cost impact of recent legislation, including SB 863 as reflected in emerging post-reform costs. The annual cost impacts have been segregated between claim severity and claim frequency impacts.
(b) These impacts are based on the weekly wages of injured workers and the legislatively scheduled benefits for that year.
(c) $\{[$ Column (1) $/ 100+1.0] \times[$ Column (2) $/ 100+1.0] \times[$ Column (3) $/ 100+1.0]-1.0\} \times 100$.
(d) These factors represent the combined impact of the annual benefit changes on claim severity shown in Column (1), claim frequencies shown in Column (2) and wage inflation impact on benefits shown in Column (3), adjusted to the $1 / 1 / 2019$ level.
(e) On-level factors for accident years 2002, 2003 and 2004 adjust the portion of permanent disability claims that are estimated to not be subject to the January 1, 2005 PDRS (95\% for accident year 2002, 75\% for accident year 2003 and $40 \%$ for accident year 2004) to the January 1, 2005 PDRS level, and adjust for the corresponding utilization impacts on all 2002, 2003 and 2004 indemnity claims.

## Annual Medical Cost Level Change - Non-Legislative

| Accident Year | (1) <br> Proportion of Medical Subject to Fee Schedule (a) | (2) <br> Proportion of Medical Not Subject to Fee Schedule (a) |  | (4) <br> Change in Medical CPI (c) | (5) <br> Impact of CPI Change on Total Medical (d) | (6) <br> Annual <br> Non-Legislative Cost Impact on Total Medical (e) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1985 | 0.665 | 0.335 | 2.3\% | 6.5\% | 2.2\% | 4.5\% |
| 1986 | 0.604 | 0.396 | 0.0\% | 9.1\% | 3.0\% | 3.0\% |
| 1987 | 0.610 | 0.390 | 0.9\% | 7.4\% | 2.9\% | 3.8\% |
| 1988 | 0.649 | 0.351 | 0.8\% | 7.7\% | 3.0\% | 3.8\% |
| 1989 | 0.647 | 0.353 | 0.0\% | 8.6\% | 3.0\% | 3.0\% |
| 1990 | 0.661 | 0.339 | 0.0\% | 10.4\% | 3.7\% | 3.7\% |
| 1991 | 0.631 | 0.369 | 0.0\% | 10.6\% | 3.6\% | 3.6\% |
| 1992 | 0.628 | 0.372 | 0.0\% | 8.1\% | 3.0\% | 3.0\% |
| 1993 | 0.565 | 0.435 | 0.0\% | 7.3\% | 2.7\% | 2.7\% |
| 1994 | 0.691 | 0.309 | -3.6\% | 4.3\% | 1.3\% (i) | -2.3\% |
| 1995 | 0.681 | 0.319 | 0.0\% | 3.0\% | 0.9\% | 0.9\% |
| 1996 | 0.663 | 0.337 | 0.0\% | 3.0\% | 1.0\% | 1.0\% |
| 1997 | 0.643 | 0.357 | 0.0\% | 2.2\% | 0.7\% | 0.7\% |
| 1998 | 0.658 | 0.342 | 0.0\% | 2.2\% | 0.8\% | 0.8\% |
| 1999 | 0.728 | 0.272 | 1.6\% | 3.3\% | 0.9\% (ii) | 2.5\% |
| 2000 | 0.715 | 0.285 | 0.5\% | 4.3\% | 1.2\% | 1.7\% |
| 2001 | 0.722 | 0.278 | 1.5\% | 4.8\% | 1.4\% | 2.9\% |
| 2002 | 0.635 | 0.365 | 0.6\% | 5.1\% | 1.4\% | 2.0\% |
| 2003 | 0.786 | 0.214 | 0.0\% | 4.8\% | 1.4\% (iii) | 1.4\% |
| 2004 | 0.952 | 0.048 | 0.0\% | 5.0\% | 0.0\% (iv),(v) | 0.0\% |
| 2005 | 0.936 | 0.064 | 0.0\% | 4.8\% | 0.0\% (v) | 0.0\% |
| 2006 | 0.926 | 0.074 | 0.0\% | 4.1\% | 0.3\% | 0.3\% |
| 2007 | 0.923 | 0.077 | 1.4\% | 5.3\% | 0.4\% | 1.8\% |
| 2008 | 0.896 | 0.104 | -0.1\% | 4.2\% | 0.3\% | 0.2\% |
| 2009 | 0.894 | 0.106 | 0.0\% | 3.6\% | 0.4\% | 0.4\% |
| 2010 | 0.895 | 0.105 | 0.0\% | 2.8\% | 0.3\% | 0.3\% |
| 2011 | 0.969 | 0.031 | 0.0\% | 3.2\% | 0.3\% | 0.3\% |
| 2012 | 0.969 | 0.031 | 0.0\% | 2.7\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% |
| 2013 | 0.938 | 0.062 | 0.0\% | 2.6\% | 0.1\% | 0.1\% |
| 2014 | 0.928 | 0.072 | 0.5\% | 4.2\% | 0.3\% | 0.8\% |
| 2015 | 0.934 | 0.066 | 0.1\% | 3.1\% | 0.2\% | 0.3\% |
| 2016 | 0.934 | 0.066 | 0.1\% | 5.4\% | 0.4\% | 0.5\% |
| 2017 | 0.934 | 0.066 | 0.1\% | 2.9\% | 0.2\% | 0.3\% |
| 2018 | 0.934 | 0.066 | 0.0\% | 3.3\% | 0.2\% | 0.2\% |
| 1/1/2019 | 0.934 | 0.066 | 0.0\% (Annual 0.0\%) | 1.5\% (Annual 3.0\%) | 0.1\% | 0.1\% |

(a) From a Special Carrier Study through 1990. Based on WCIRB's Aggregate Indemnity and Medical Costs Calls for years 1991 through 2012. Based on WCIRB medical transaction data from 2013 onwards. Accident years 2011 and subsequent do not include MCCP costs.
(b) Based on the WCIRB's evaluation of the cost impact of changes in the medical fee schedules. Includes the 1/1/2014 changes to the physician fee schedule to a resource-based relative value scale (RBRVS) except for the proportion reflected in loss development (See Exhibit 2.4).
(c) Based on a component of the Consumer Price Index. Projections furnished by the California Department of Finance.
(d) Adjusted CPI on workers' compensation medical costs that are not subject to fee schedules. The current year impact is the
(e) Column (6) $=$ Column (3) + Column (5).

## Annual Medical Cost Level Change - Legislative

$\left.\begin{array}{cccc} & \begin{array}{c}(1) \\ \text { Accident } \\ \text { Year }\end{array} & \begin{array}{c}\text { Annual Legislative } \\ \text { Cost Impact on } \\ \text { Medical Severity(a) }\end{array} & \begin{array}{c}(2) \\ \text { Annual Legislative Cost Impact } \\ \text { on Medical Due to } \\ \text { Frequency Changes(b) }\end{array}\end{array} \begin{array}{c}(3) \\ \text { Annual Total } \\ \text { Legislative Cost } \\ \text { Impact on Medical(c) }\end{array}\right]$
(a) These annual cost impacts reflect the WCIRB's retrospective estimates of the cost impact of legislation based on WCIRB cost monitoring results. These factors do not include the estimated - 4.2\% impact of 1/1/2013 medical provisions in SB 863, which was reflected in loss development projections.
(b) This reflects the annual percentage impact on medical costs due to changes in the frequency of
(c) $[$ Column (1) +1.0$] \times[$ Column (2) +1.0$]-1.0$

## Total Medical Cost Level Factors

|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Annual | Annual | Total | Composite |
|  | Non-Legislative | Legislative | Annual Cost | Medical |
| Accident | Cost Impact on | Cost Impact on | Impact on | On-level |
| Year | Medical (a) | Medical(b) | Medical(c) | Factor(d) |
| 1985 | 4.5\% | 0.0\% | 4.5\% | 0.990 |
| 1986 | 3.0\% | 0.0\% | 3.0\% | 0.961 |
| 1987 | 3.8\% | 0.0\% | 3.8\% | 0.926 |
| 1988 | 3.8\% | 0.0\% | 3.8\% | 0.892 |
| 1989 | 3.0\% | 0.0\% | 3.0\% | 0.866 |
| 1990 | 3.7\% | 19.1\% | 23.5\% | 0.702 |
| 1991 | 3.6\% | 12.9\% | 16.9\% | 0.600 |
| 1992 | 3.0\% | -7.9\% | -5.2\% | 0.633 |
| 1993 | 2.7\% | -18.7\% | -16.5\% | 0.758 |
| 1994 | -2.3\% | -2.3\% | -4.6\% | 0.794 |
| 1995 | 0.9\% | 0.5\% | 1.4\% | 0.783 |
| 1996 | 1.0\% | 0.4\% | 1.4\% | 0.772 |
| 1997 | 0.7\% | 0.2\% | 0.9\% | 0.765 |
| 1998 | 0.8\% | 12.6\% | 13.5\% | 0.674 |
| 1999 | 2.5\% | 12.6\% | 15.4\% | 0.584 |
| 2000 | 1.7\% | 7.0\% | 8.8\% | 0.537 |
| 2001 | 2.9\% | 6.6\% | 9.7\% | 0.489 |
| 2002 | 2.0\% | -5.6\% | -3.7\% | 0.508 |
| 2003 | 1.4\% | -6.0\% | -4.7\% | 0.533 |
| 2004 | 0.0\% | -33.9\% | -33.9\% | 0.806 |
| 2005 | 0.0\% | -13.9\% | -13.9\% | 0.936 |
| 2006 | 0.3\% | -5.1\% | -4.8\% | 0.983 |
| 2007 | 1.8\% | 0.1\% | 1.9\% | 0.965 |
| 2008 | 0.2\% | 0.5\% | 0.7\% | 0.958 |
| 2009 | 0.4\% | 1.0\% | 1.4\% | 0.945 |
| 2010 | 0.3\% | 0.0\% | 0.3\% | 0.942 |
| 2011 | 0.3\% | -2.0\% | -1.7\% | 0.959 |
| 2012 | 0.1\% | -3.0\% | -2.9\% | 0.987 |
| 2013 | 0.1\% | -2.8\% | -2.7\% | 1.015 |
| 2014 | 0.8\% | -0.7\% | 0.1\% | 1.019 (e) |
| 2015 | 0.3\% | 0.0\% | 0.3\% | 1.017 (e) |
| 2016 | 0.5\% | 0.0\% | 0.5\% | 1.013 (e) |
| 2017 | 0.3\% | 0.0\% | 0.3\% |  |
| 2018 | 0.2\% | 0.0\% | 0.2\% |  |
| 1/1/2019 | 0.1\% | 0.0\% | 0.1\% |  |

(a) See Exhibit 4.2, Column (6).
(b) See Exhibit 4.3, Column (3).
(c) Column (3) $=[1.0+$ Column (1) $] \times[1.0+$ Column (2) $]-1.0$.
(d) These factors adjust the annual impact shown in Column (3) to the 1/1/2019 level.
(e) The on-level factors for accident years 2014, 2015, and 2016 include the estimated impact of the January 1, 2014 physician fee schedule for the service year 2017.

WCIRB California®

## Annual Wage Level Changes

$\left.\left.\begin{array}{ccc}\text { Year } & \begin{array}{c}\text { Annual Wage } \\ \text { Level Change }\end{array} & \begin{array}{c}\text { Factor to a } \\ 1985 \\ 1986\end{array} \\ \hline 1 / 1 / 2019 \text { Wage Level }\end{array}\right] \begin{array}{l}3.314 \\ 1987 \\ 1988 \\ 1989 \\ 1990\end{array}\right)$

Source: California average annual wage level changes for 1985 to 2019 derived from information published by the UCLA Anderson School of Business as of March 2017.

|  | (1) | (2a) | (2b) | (2c) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Calendar Year | Factor to a $1 / 1 / 2019$ Wage Level (a) | Ratio of Industry Average Charged Rates to Advisory Pure Premium <br> (a) Rates (b) | Factor to Industry <br> Average Filed <br> Pure Premium <br> Rate Level as of January 1, 2017 (c) | Factor to Adjust Insurer Premium to an Industry Average Filed Pure Premium Rate Level as of January 1, 2017 (d) | Adjustment to Remove Surcharge Premium (e) | Average Experience Modification (f) | Off-Balance Correction in Advisory January 1, 2017 Pure Premium Rates | Factor to Adjust for Impact of Premium Resulting from Audits (g) | Composite Premium Adjustment Factor (h) |
| 1985 | 3.314 | --- | --- | 0.998 | 0.991 | 0.984 | 1.026 | --- | 3.245 |
| 1986 | 3.165 | --- | --- | 0.911 | 0.991 | 0.983 | 1.026 | --- | 2.835 |
| 1987 | 2.997 | --- | --- | 0.801 | 0.992 | 0.983 | 1.026 | --- | 2.362 |
| 1988 | 2.871 | --- | --- | 0.717 | 0.993 | 0.963 | 1.026 | --- | 2.068 |
| 1989 | 2.753 | --- | --- | 0.705 | 0.993 | 0.945 | 1.026 | --- | 1.989 |
| 1990 | 2.622 | --- | --- | 0.688 | 0.991 | 0.942 | 1.026 | --- | 1.849 |
| 1991 | 2.563 | --- | --- | 0.637 | 0.987 | 0.939 | 1.026 | --- | 1.672 |
| 1992 | 2.448 | --- | --- | 0.611 | 0.982 | 0.940 | 1.026 | --- | 1.524 |
| 1993 | 2.419 | --- | --- | 0.603 | 0.981 | 0.949 | 1.026 | --- | 1.470 |
| 1994 | 2.376 | --- | --- | 0.691 | 0.986 | 0.948 | 1.026 | --- | 1.665 |
| 1995 | 2.309 | --- | --- | 0.935 | 0.995 | 0.958 | 1.026 | --- | 2.186 |
| 1996 | 2.233 | 1.024 | 0.994 | 0.971 | 1.000 | 0.935 | 1.026 | --- | 2.260 |
| 1997 | 2.133 | 0.989 | 0.991 | 1.002 | 1.000 | 0.949 | 1.026 | --- | 2.195 |
| 1998 | 2.027 | 0.965 | 1.033 | 1.070 | 1.000 | 0.959 | 1.026 | --- | 2.206 |
| 1999 | 1.909 | 0.972 | 1.044 | 1.074 | 1.000 | 0.954 | 1.026 | --- | 2.095 |
| 2000 | 1.751 | 1.006 | 0.946 | 0.940 | 1.000 | 0.970 | 1.026 | --- | 1.655 |
| 2001 | 1.741 | 1.029 | 0.834 | 0.810 | 1.000 | 0.969 | 1.026 | --- | 1.419 |
| 2002 | 1.732 | 1.157 | 0.746 | 0.645 | 1.000 | 0.991 | 1.026 | --- | 1.099 |
| 2003 | 1.677 | 1.267 | 0.611 | 0.482 | 1.000 | 1.005 | 1.026 | --- | 0.784 |
| 2004 | 1.602 | 1.397 | 0.621 | 0.445 | 1.000 | 0.981 | 1.026 | --- | 0.707 |
| 2005 | 1.553 | 1.470 | 0.747 | 0.508 | 1.000 | 0.982 | 1.026 | --- | 0.784 |
| 2006 | 1.485 | 1.451 | 0.963 | 0.664 | 1.000 | 0.956 | 1.026 | --- | 1.005 |
| 2007 | 1.421 | 1.494 | 1.314 | 0.880 | 1.000 | 0.931 | 1.026 | 0.985 | 1.289 |
| 2008 | 1.392 | 1.426 | 1.561 | 1.095 | 1.000 | 0.946 | 1.026 | 0.991 | 1.556 |
| 2009 | 1.385 | 1.366 | 1.539 | 1.127 | 1.000 | 0.937 | 1.026 | 1.034 | 1.679 |
| 2010 | 1.345 | 1.383 | 1.508 | 1.090 | 1.000 | 0.941 | 1.026 | 1.005 | 1.526 |
| 2011 | 1.304 | 1.401 | 1.507 | 1.076 | 1.000 | 0.982 | 1.026 | --- | 1.393 |
| 2012 | 1.253 | 1.222 | 1.242 | 1.016 | 1.000 | 1.000 | 1.026 | --- | 1.241 |
| 2013 | 1.244 | 1.138 | 1.000 | 0.879 | 1.000 | 0.983 | 1.026 | --- | 1.084 |
| 2014 | 1.204 | 1.126 | 0.921 | 0.818 | 1.000 | 0.961 | 1.026 | --- | 0.999 |
| 2015 | 1.154 | 1.108 | 0.895 | 0.808 | 1.000 | 0.952 | 1.026 | --- | 0.954 |
| 2016 | 1.118 | 1.146 | 0.964 | 0.841 | 1.000 | 0.952 | 1.026 | --- | 0.963 |

(a) See Exhibit 5.1.
(b) Based on WCIRB calendar year experience calls. The industry average charged rates reflect most rating plan adjustments but do not reflect the application of deductible credits or retrospective rating plan adjustments.
(c) Reflects (1) advisory pure premium rate level changes to bring premium to the advisory January 1, 2017 pure premium rate level and (2) an additional adjustment factor, which is the ratio of the average advisory January 1, 2017 pure premium rate ( $\$ 2.19$ ) to the industry average filed pure premium rate as of January 1, 2017 (\$2.42).
(d) (2b) $\div(2 a)$. This column adjusts premiums at the industry average charged rate level to the industry average filed pure premium rate level as of January 1, 2017.
(e) Based on unit statistical data.
(f) Based on average promulgated experience modifications. Calendar years 1996 through 2000 include adjustments for the impacts of AB 1913 and SB 1217 (1998).
(g) Based on a comparison of premium reported on a calendar year basis to premium reported on an estimated ultimate policy year basis over the course of two accident years. The factor is applied only for calendar years 2007 to 2010, during which reported premiums were impacted by recessionary economic forces.
(h) (1) $x(2 \mathrm{c}) \times(3) \times(6) \div[(4) \times(5)]$ for calendar years 2007 to 2010 . (1) $) \times(2 \mathrm{c}) \times(3) \div[(4) \times(5)]$ for all other calendar years.

2016 Accident Year Indemnity Claim Frequency Model As of PY 2014 Preliminary 1st Set \& December 2016 UCLA


Notes:
Indemnity Benefit Level variable is leading. The benefit level change for AY 2004 is related to the AY 2003 change in non-cumulative frequency.
The Indemnity Benefit Level change for Ogilvie \& Almaraz / Guzman in 2009-2010 is not leading.
The Indemnity Benefit Level variable excludes indemnity benefit utilization, and changes in the death and permanent total benefits.
The Indemnity Benefit Level variable has been revised due to on-leveling reassessments. See Actuarial Committee item AC09-03-03
For 1993 on, cumulative claims include both cumulative trauma and occupational disease claims. See March 19, 2014 Actuarial Committee Agenda Item III.
Economic variables are historical through 2015; December 2016 UCLA Anderson Forecasts for 2016 on.
Regression is over AY 1979 through AY 2015. AY 2016 through AY 2019 are projections.
The constant term, -0.020 , consists of measured offsets that recognize annual changes in real benefit levels relative to nominal
benefit levels and long-term economic growth. Without these offsets, the indemnity benefit level and economic variables would project
frequency to increase without bound
*AY 2015 is preliminary and change is based on a comparison of 2015 accidents on 2014 policies to 2014 accidents on 2013 policies.

## Projection of Indemnity Severity Trends by Accident Year Based on Experience as of March 31, 2016

|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Estimated |  | Indemnity | Ultimate |  |
| Accident | Ultimate | Annual | Adjustment | On-level | Annual |
| Year | Severity | \% Change | Factor(a) | Severity | \% Change |
|  |  |  |  | (1) $\times$ (3) |  |
| 1990 | 9,962 | --- | 1.853 | 18,464 | --- |
| 1991 | 10,894 | 9.4\% | 1.753 | 19,095 | 3.4\% |
| 1992 | 10,987 | 0.9\% | 1.695 | 18,619 | -2.5\% |
| 1993 | 11,963 | 8.9\% | 1.685 | 20,153 | 8.2\% |
| 1994 | 12,934 | 8.1\% | 1.764 | 22,822 | 13.2\% |
| 1995 | 14,500 | 12.1\% | 1.643 | 23,831 | 4.4\% |
| 1996 | 16,237 | 12.0\% | 1.542 | 25,042 | 5.1\% |
| 1997 | 19,317 | 19.0\% | 1.384 | 26,729 | 6.7\% |
| 1998 | 21,123 | 9.4\% | 1.276 | 26,960 | 0.9\% |
| 1999 | 23,199 | 9.8\% | 1.183 | 27,437 | 1.8\% |
| 2000 | 24,596 | 6.0\% | 1.104 | 27,155 | -1.0\% |
| 2001 | 27,072 | 10.1\% | 1.105 | 29,919 | 10.2\% |
| 2002 | 26,168 | -3.3\% | 1.135 | 29,691 | -0.8\% |
| 2003 | 25,725 | -1.7\% | 1.134 | 29,164 | -1.8\% |
| 2004 | 20,997 | -18.4\% | 1.348 | 28,309 | -2.9\% |
| 2005 | 18,946 | -9.8\% | 1.550 | 29,369 | 3.7\% |
| 2006 | 20,753 | 9.5\% | 1.445 | 29,984 | 2.1\% |
| 2007 | 22,486 | 8.3\% | 1.400 | 31,473 | 5.0\% |
| 2008 | 24,646 | 9.6\% | 1.326 | 32,688 | 3.9\% |
| 2009 | 25,677 | 4.2\% | 1.318 | 33,851 | 3.6\% |
| 2010 | 25,380 | -1.2\% | 1.300 | 32,997 | -2.5\% |
| 2011 | 25,028 | -1.4\% | 1.280 | 32,026 | -2.9\% |
| 2012 | 24,570 | -1.8\% | 1.250 | 30,701 | -4.1\% |
| 2013 | 24,878 | 1.3\% | 1.218 | 30,296 | -1.3\% |
| 2014 | 26,825 | 7.8\% | 1.119 | 30,024 | -0.9\% |
| 2015 | 27,887 | 4.0\% | 1.091 | 30,422 | 1.3\% |
| 2016 | 28,939 | 3.8\% | 1.070 | 30,959 | 1.8\% |
| (6) Estimated Annual Exponential Trend Based on 2005 to 2016 : |  |  |  |  | -0.1\% |
| (7) Estimated Annual Exponential Trend Based on 2011 to 2016: |  |  |  |  | -0.6\% |
| Selected Indemnity Severity Trend: |  |  |  |  | 0.0\% |

(a) These adjustment factors are based on Exhibit 4.1, excluding the impact of frequency.

Source: WCIRB experience calls

## Projection of Medical Severity Trends by Accident Year Based on Experience as of March 31, 2016

|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) <br> Annual \% Change |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Estimated |  | Medical | Ultimate |  |
| Accident | Ultimate | Annual | Adjustment | On-level |  |
| Year | Severity(a) | \% Change | Factor(b) | Severity |  |
|  |  |  |  | (1) $\times(3)$ |  |
| 1990 | 8,726 | --- | 1.015 | 8,853 | --- |
| 1991 | 9,364 | 7.3\% | 0.996 | 9,323 | 5.3\% |
| 1992 | 9,436 | 0.8\% | 0.963 | 9,085 | -2.6\% |
| 1993 | 10,450 | 10.7\% | 0.946 | 9,889 | 8.8\% |
| 1994 | 11,552 | 10.5\% | 0.995 | 11,500 | 16.3\% |
| 1995 | 13,208 | 14.3\% | 0.988 | 13,049 | 13.5\% |
| 1996 | 14,183 | 7.4\% | 0.978 | 13,871 | 6.3\% |
| 1997 | 16,870 | 18.9\% | 0.971 | 16,383 | 18.1\% |
| 1998 | 20,696 | 22.7\% | 0.857 | 17,742 | 8.3\% |
| 1999 | 23,533 | 13.7\% | 0.743 | 17,488 | -1.4\% |
| 2000 | 26,556 | 12.8\% | 0.683 | 18,147 | 3.8\% |
| 2001 | 31,580 | 18.9\% | 0.624 | 19,710 | 8.6\% |
| 2002 | 31,971 | 1.2\% | 0.649 | 20,737 | 5.2\% |
| 2003 | 30,551 | -4.4\% | 0.682 | 20,834 | 0.5\% |
| 2004 | 28,315 | -7.3\% | 0.904 | 25,595 | 22.9\% |
| 2005 | 29,237 | 3.3\% | 0.906 | 26,492 | 3.5\% |
| 2006 | 32,173 | 10.0\% | 0.904 | 29,096 | 9.8\% |
| 2007 | 35,972 | 11.8\% | 0.890 | 32,032 | 10.1\% |
| 2008 | 39,302 | 9.3\% | 0.890 | 34,989 | 9.2\% |
| 2009 | 41,472 | 5.5\% | 0.891 | 36,961 | 5.6\% |
| 2010 | 41,856 | 0.9\% | 0.894 | 37,438 | 1.3\% |
| 2011 | 38,343 (c) | --- | 0.918 | 35,210 (c) | --- |
| 2012 | 36,433 | -5.0\% | 0.956 | 34,830 | -1.1\% |
| 2013 | 34,576 | -5.1\% | 0.995 | 34,389 | -1.3\% |
| 2014 | 34,034 | -1.6\% | 1.017 | 34,616 | 0.7\% |
| 2015 | 34,511 | 1.4\% | 1.017 | 35,091 | 1.4\% |
| 2016 | 36,767 | 6.5\% | 1.013 | 37,240 | 6.1\% |
| Selected Medical Severity Trend: |  |  |  |  | 2.5\% |

(a) Estimated ultimate severities for all accident years are derived by dividing ultimate medical losses on indemnity claims by ultimate indemnity claim counts. The estimated ultimate medical severities were derived from the projected ultimate loss ratios shown in Exhibit 3.2, column (6).
(b) These adjustment factors are based on Exhibit 4.4, excluding the impact of frequency, and including the impact of SB 863 provisions applicable to outstanding medical losses.
(c) Severities for accident years 2011 and subsequent do not reflect the cost of medical cost containment programs (MCCP). Severities for accident years 2010 and prior do reflect MCCP costs.
Projection of Medical Severity Trends by Accident Year
Adjusted to Remove the Cost of Medical Cost Containment Programs (MCCP) Based on Experience as of March 31, 2016

Selected Medical Severity Trend:
(a) Estimated ultimate severities for all accident years were derived by dividing ultimate medical losses on indemnity
claims by ultimate indemnity claim counts.
(b) Adjustments to accident years 2005 through 2010 based on WCIRB's Annual Calls for Direct California Workers' Compensation Aggregate Indemnity and Medical Costs.
(c) Ultimate severities are on-leveled based on adjustment factors shown on Exhibit 4.4, excluding the impact of frequency.
Source: WCIRB experience calls

Projected On-Level Accident Year Indemnity Loss to Industry Average Filed Pure Premium Ratios Based on Experience as of March 31, 2017

|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Accident | Developed Indemnity | Composite Indemnity | Composite Premium | On-Level Indemnity to Industry Average Filed |
| Year | Loss Ratio(a) | Adjustment Factor(b) | Adjustment Factor(c) | Pure Premium Ratio |
|  |  |  |  | (1) $\times(2) \div(3)$ |
| 1985 | 0.448 | 1.542 | 3.245 | 0.213 |
| 1986 | 0.397 | 1.517 | 2.835 | 0.212 |
| 1987 | 0.346 | 1.489 | 2.362 | 0.218 |
| 1988 | 0.331 | 1.467 | 2.068 | 0.235 |
| 1989 | 0.344 | 1.445 | 1.989 | 0.250 |
| 1990 | 0.399 | 1.159 | 1.849 | 0.250 |
| 1991 | 0.426 | 0.955 | 1.672 | 0.243 |
| 1992 | 0.351 | 1.006 | 1.524 | 0.232 |
| 1993 | 0.289 | 1.222 | 1.470 | 0.240 |
| 1994 | 0.329 | 1.277 | 1.665 | 0.252 |
| 1995 | 0.475 | 1.182 | 2.186 | 0.257 |
| 1996 | 0.532 | 1.105 | 2.260 | 0.260 |
| 1997 | 0.603 | 0.990 | 2.195 | 0.272 |
| 1998 | 0.654 | 0.913 | 2.206 | 0.271 |
| 1999 | 0.689 | 0.846 | 2.095 | 0.278 |
| 2000 | 0.595 | 0.789 | 1.655 | 0.284 |
| 2001 | 0.493 | 0.790 | 1.419 | 0.275 |
| 2002 | 0.368 | 0.811 | 1.099 | 0.272 |
| 2003 | 0.242 | 0.811 | 0.784 | 0.250 |
| 2004 | 0.145 | 1.117 | 0.707 | 0.228 |
| 2005 | 0.124 | 1.516 | 0.784 | 0.239 |
| 2006 | 0.161 | 1.499 | 1.005 | 0.240 |
| 2007 | 0.222 | 1.452 | 1.289 | 0.250 |
| 2008 | 0.282 | 1.368 | 1.556 | 0.248 |
| 2009 | 0.329 | 1.341 | 1.679 | 0.263 |
| 2010 | 0.322 | 1.322 | 1.526 | 0.279 |
| 2011 | 0.301 | 1.301 | 1.393 | 0.281 |
| 2012 | 0.271 | 1.271 | 1.241 | 0.277 |
| 2013 | 0.242 | 1.236 | 1.084 | 0.276 |
| 2014 | 0.241 | 1.119 | 0.999 | 0.270 |
| 2015 | 0.244 | 1.091 | 0.954 | 0.279 |
| 2016 | 0.245 | 1.070 | 0.963 | 0.272 |
|  |  |  |  | Projections (d) |
| 2017 |  |  |  | 0.270 |
| 2018 |  |  |  | 0.265 |
| 1/1/2019 |  |  |  | 0.263 |

(a) See Exhibit 3.1.
(b) See Exhibit 4.1.
(c) See Exhibit 5.2.
(d) These on-level ratios were projected based on an estimated annual indemnity severity trend from Exhibit 6.2, the actual frequency trend for accident year 2016 from Exhibit 12, and projected frequency trends for accident years 2017, 2018, and 2019 from Exhibit 6.1; these trends were then separately applied to the 2015 and 2016 on-level ratios.

# Actuarial Committee 

On-Level Indemnity Loss to Industry Average Filed Pure Premium Ratios
Based on Experience as of March 31, 2017


* On-level indemnity to industry average filed pure premium ratios (see Exhibit 7.1)
** The $1 / 1 / 2019$ indemnity to industry average filed pure premium ratio was calculated based on separate frequency and severity trends applied to the 2015 and 2016 years.

Projected On-Level Accident Year
Medical Loss to Industry Average Filed Pure Premium Ratios Based on Experience as of March 31, 2017


IV-A-41
WCIRB California®

## On-Level Medical Loss to Industry Average Filed Pure Premium Ratios <br> Based on Experience as of March 31, 2017



[^5]Indicated Loss to Industry Average Filed Pure Premium Ratios For Policies with Effective Dates between July 1, 2017 and December 31, 2017

Based on Experience as of March 31, 2017

|  | Indemnity | Medical | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1. Projected Loss to Industry Average Filed Pure Premium Ratio (See Exhibits 7.1 and 7.3) | 0.263 | 0.349 | 0.612 |

## Actuarial Committee

Quarterly Incurred Indemnity Loss Development Factors Through March 31, 2017

| Age in | Accident Year |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Months | 1998 | 1999 | $\underline{2000}$ | $\underline{2001}$ | 2002 | $\underline{2003}$ | $\underline{2004}$ | 2005 | $\underline{2006}$ | $\underline{2007}$ | $\underline{2008}$ | $\underline{2009}$ | $\underline{2010}$ | $\underline{2011}$ | $\underline{2012}$ | $\underline{2013}$ | $\underline{2014}$ | $\underline{2015}$ | $\underline{2016}$ |
| 6/3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 2.417 | 2.724 | 2.785 | 3.031 | 3.116 | 3.052 | 3.238 | 3.344 | 3.303 | 3.209 | 3.201 |
| 9/6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.656 | 1.776 | 1.820 | 1.848 | 1.904 | 2.001 | 1.966 | 1.940 | 1.960 | 1.948 | 1.945 |
| 12/9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.448 | 1.511 | 1.510 | 1.530 | 1.564 | 1.632 | 1.587 | 1.585 | 1.570 | 1.578 | 1.578 |
| 15/12 | 1.229 | 1.260 | 1.268 | 1.250 | 1.257 | 1.238 | 1.180 | 1.149 | 1.189 | 1.234 | 1.248 | 1.293 | 1.306 | 1.306 | 1.303 | 1.301 | 1.301 | 1.313 | 1.309 |
| 18/15 | 1.172 | 1.202 | 1.188 | 1.184 | 1.206 | 1.167 | 1.101 | 1.103 | 1.140 | 1.158 | 1.182 | 1.194 | 1.197 | 1.195 | 1.206 | 1.178 | 1.190 | 1.187 |  |
| 21/18 | 1.145 | 1.140 | 1.150 | 1.148 | 1.153 | 1.127 | 1.066 | 1.096 | 1.117 | 1.128 | 1.139 | 1.153 | 1.140 | 1.146 | 1.141 | 1.141 | 1.132 | 1.137 |  |
| 24/21 | 1.126 | 1.112 | 1.121 | 1.111 | 1.117 | 1.094 | 1.045 | 1.082 | 1.098 | 1.106 | 1.106 | 1.114 | 1.119 | 1.117 | 1.111 | 1.104 | 1.114 | 1.111 |  |
| 27124 | 1.074 | 1.096 | 1.093 | 1.100 | 1.094 | 1.073 | 1.045 | 1.070 | 1.082 | 1.081 | 1.088 | 1.089 | 1.091 | 1.085 | 1.087 | 1.081 | 1.082 | 1.087 |  |
| 30/27 | 1.078 | 1.069 | 1.074 | 1.082 | 1.064 | 1.051 | 1.040 | 1.054 | 1.057 | 1.072 | 1.075 | 1.075 | 1.080 | 1.071 | 1.068 | 1.067 | 1.074 |  |  |
| 33/30 | 1.045 | 1.058 | 1.048 | 1.062 | 1.047 | 1.032 | 1.036 | 1.042 | 1.049 | 1.053 | 1.059 | 1.052 | 1.064 | 1.053 | 1.060 | 1.047 | 1.055 |  |  |
| 36/33 | 1.043 | 1.046 | 1.039 | 1.046 | 1.035 | 1.020 | 1.029 | 1.033 | 1.039 | 1.043 | 1.051 | 1.049 | 1.049 | 1.043 | 1.041 | 1.043 | 1.042 |  |  |
| 39/36 | 1.038 | 1.041 | 1.035 | 1.038 | 1.028 | 1.017 | 1.027 | 1.029 | 1.031 | 1.033 | 1.040 | 1.039 | 1.039 | 1.041 | 1.035 | 1.031 | 1.036 |  |  |
| 42/39 | 1.027 | 1.028 | 1.034 | 1.030 | 1.023 | 1.018 | 1.020 | 1.020 | 1.031 | 1.033 | 1.036 | 1.038 | 1.035 | 1.032 | 1.028 | 1.031 |  |  |  |
| 45/42 | 1.024 | 1.026 | 1.026 | 1.020 | 1.009 | 1.019 | 1.018 | 1.024 | 1.026 | 1.028 | 1.030 | 1.035 | 1.027 | 1.033 | 1.022 | 1.024 |  |  |  |
| 48/45 | 1.025 | 1.020 | 1.022 | 1.013 | 1.008 | 1.013 | 1.013 | 1.021 | 1.019 | 1.021 | 1.024 | 1.024 | 1.026 | 1.023 | 1.024 | 1.020 |  |  |  |
| 51/48 | 1.022 | 1.017 | 1.018 | 1.015 | 1.010 | 1.016 | 1.010 | 1.018 | 1.021 | 1.018 | 1.022 | 1.023 | 1.021 | 1.018 | 1.017 | 1.015 |  |  |  |
| 54/51 | 1.019 | 1.018 | 1.013 | 1.009 | 1.007 | 1.017 | 1.009 | 1.017 | 1.021 | 1.020 | 1.021 | 1.020 | 1.020 | 1.016 | 1.019 |  |  |  |  |
| 57/54 | 1.014 | 1.017 | 1.012 | 1.006 | 1.008 | 1.011 | 1.011 | 1.018 | 1.017 | 1.014 | 1.018 | 1.017 | 1.015 | 1.014 | 1.013 |  |  |  |  |
| 60/57 | 1.013 | 1.014 | 1.007 | 1.005 | 1.008 | 1.009 | 1.011 | 1.013 | 1.019 | 1.016 | 1.013 | 1.015 | 1.012 | 1.014 | 1.012 |  |  |  |  |
| 63/60 | 1.012 | 1.012 | 1.007 | 1.007 | 1.008 | 1.008 | 1.010 | 1.014 | 1.013 | 1.015 | 1.011 | 1.014 | 1.014 | 1.009 | 1.012 |  |  |  |  |
| 66/63 | 1.014 | 1.009 | 1.005 | 1.006 | 1.011 | 1.008 | 1.010 | 1.013 | 1.016 | 1.014 | 1.015 | 1.013 | 1.013 | 1.009 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 69/66 | 1.010 | 1.007 | 1.003 | 1.005 | 1.008 | 1.007 | 1.011 | 1.012 | 1.011 | 1.010 | 1.009 | 1.012 | 1.007 | 1.010 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 72/69 | 1.009 | 1.006 | 1.005 | 1.005 | 1.005 | 1.009 | 1.009 | 1.013 | 1.011 | 1.009 | 1.009 | 1.009 | 1.010 | 1.008 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 75/72 | 1.006 | 1.004 | 1.004 | 1.005 | 1.003 | 1.005 | 1.007 | 1.010 | 1.011 | 1.010 | 1.010 | 1.008 | 1.007 | 1.004 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 78/75 | 1.007 | 1.004 | 1.003 | 1.007 | 1.005 | 1.006 | 1.006 | 1.012 | 1.009 | 1.010 | 1.006 | 1.006 | 1.006 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 81/78 | 1.005 | 1.002 | 1.003 | 1.004 | 1.004 | 1.005 | 1.006 | 1.010 | 1.009 | 1.007 | 1.007 | 1.006 | 1.006 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 84/81 | 1.003 | 1.003 | 1.005 | 1.003 | 1.006 | 1.006 | 1.007 | 1.008 | 1.005 | 1.009 | 1.006 | 1.004 | 1.007 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $87 / 84$ | 1.003 | 1.003 | 1.002 | 1.003 | 1.004 | 1.002 | 1.007 | 1.010 | 1.007 | 1.004 | 1.005 | 1.006 | 1.004 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 90/87 | 1.001 | 1.003 | 1.003 | 1.003 | 1.003 | 1.004 | 1.008 | 1.008 | 1.008 | 1.008 | 1.004 | 1.005 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 93/90 | 1.001 | 1.002 | 1.004 | 1.003 | 1.002 | 1.005 | 1.006 | 1.008 | 1.006 | 1.007 | 1.006 | 1.003 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 96/93 | 1.002 | 1.003 | 1.001 | 1.004 | 1.002 | 1.006 | 1.006 | 1.003 | 1.002 | 1.003 | 1.004 | 1.004 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Source: WCIRB acident year experience calls

## Quarterly Incurred Medical Loss Development Factors *

 Through March 31, 2017| Age in | Accident Year |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Months | 1998 | 1999 | $\underline{2000}$ | $\underline{2001}$ | $\underline{2002}$ | $\underline{2003}$ | $\underline{2004}$ | $\underline{2005}$ | $\underline{2006}$ | $\underline{2007}$ | $\underline{2008}$ | $\underline{2009}$ | $\underline{2010}$ | 2011 | $\underline{2012}$ | $\underline{2013}$ | $\underline{2014}$ | $\underline{2015}$ | $\underline{2016}$ |
| 6/3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 2.584 | 2.662 | 2.782 | 2.892 | 2.992 | 2.757 | 2.853 | 2.843 | 2.921 | 2.863 | 3.019 |
| 9/6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.650 | 1.744 | 1.717 | 1.807 | 1.800 | 1.827 | 1.833 | 1.819 | 1.840 | 1.884 | 1.755 |
| 12/9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.453 | 1.443 | 1.466 | 1.454 | 1.488 | 1.521 | 1.484 | 1.500 | 1.482 | 1.451 | 1.487 |
| 15/12 | 1.144 | 1.168 | 1.201 | 1.207 | 1.203 | 1.197 | 1.132 | 1.145 | 1.138 | 1.182 | 1.167 | 1.199 | 1.206 | 1.228 | 1.211 | 1.207 | 1.199 | 1.206 | 1.215 |
| 18/15 | 1.093 | 1.116 | 1.123 | 1.144 | 1.151 | 1.126 | 1.086 | 1.087 | 1.103 | 1.106 | 1.126 | 1.135 | 1.129 | 1.141 | 1.136 | 1.117 | 1.114 | 1.094 |  |
| 21/18 | 1.078 | 1.086 | 1.101 | 1.122 | 1.116 | 1.093 | 1.055 | 1.061 | 1.073 | 1.081 | 1.090 | 1.097 | 1.101 | 1.103 | 1.085 | 1.088 | 1.077 | 1.082 |  |
| 24/21 | 1.074 | 1.072 | 1.080 | 1.083 | 1.082 | 1.060 | 1.040 | 1.052 | 1.070 | 1.074 | 1.067 | 1.074 | 1.080 | 1.080 | 1.067 | 1.064 | 1.055 | 1.059 |  |
| 27124 | 1.044 | 1.061 | 1.070 | 1.080 | 1.075 | 1.042 | 1.034 | 1.048 | 1.055 | 1.058 | 1.053 | 1.071 | 1.066 | 1.072 | 1.058 | 1.048 | 1.046 | 1.049 |  |
| 30/27 | 1.044 | 1.052 | 1.058 | 1.070 | 1.051 | 1.038 | 1.039 | 1.049 | 1.046 | 1.054 | 1.057 | 1.048 | 1.063 | 1.052 | 1.046 | 1.037 | 1.044 |  |  |
| 33/30 | 1.035 | 1.047 | 1.051 | 1.059 | 1.035 | 1.018 | 1.032 | 1.030 | 1.041 | 1.045 | 1.045 | 1.051 | 1.055 | 1.045 | 1.046 | 1.031 | 1.033 |  |  |
| 36/33 | 1.037 | 1.042 | 1.035 | 1.040 | 1.029 | 1.016 | 1.024 | 1.034 | 1.042 | 1.033 | 1.042 | 1.040 | 1.041 | 1.037 | 1.028 | 1.026 | 1.027 |  |  |
| 39/36 | 1.029 | 1.032 | 1.034 | 1.037 | 1.018 | 1.012 | 1.028 | 1.025 | 1.027 | 1.029 | 1.033 | 1.031 | 1.040 | 1.039 | 1.027 | 1.021 | 1.024 |  |  |
| 42/39 | 1.025 | 1.031 | 1.036 | 1.026 | 1.019 | 1.013 | 1.017 | 1.020 | 1.025 | 1.035 | 1.036 | 1.037 | 1.037 | 1.031 | 1.022 | 1.026 |  |  |  |
| 45/42 | 1.025 | 1.033 | 1.032 | 1.023 | 1.012 | 1.019 | 1.033 | 1.021 | 1.025 | 1.029 | 1.026 | 1.030 | 1.028 | 1.027 | 1.021 | 1.018 |  |  |  |
| 48/45 | 1.028 | 1.023 | 1.026 | 1.017 | 1.008 | 1.013 | 1.025 | 1.018 | 1.022 | 1.025 | 1.029 | 1.034 | 1.022 | 1.023 | 1.020 | 1.018 |  |  |  |
| 51/48 | 1.019 | 1.020 | 1.024 | 1.014 | 1.009 | 1.013 | 1.018 | 1.015 | 1.020 | 1.021 | 1.021 | 1.026 | 1.024 | 1.019 | 1.014 | 1.013 |  |  |  |
| 54/51 | 1.025 | 1.027 | 1.017 | 1.016 | 1.010 | 1.012 | 1.021 | 1.019 | 1.022 | 1.022 | 1.027 | 1.023 | 1.019 | 1.018 | 1.015 |  |  |  |  |
| 57/54 | 1.027 | 1.024 | 1.014 | 1.007 | 1.011 | 1.017 | 1.020 | 1.018 | 1.019 | 1.019 | 1.023 | 1.020 | 1.017 | 1.018 | 1.013 |  |  |  |  |
| 60/57 | 1.021 | 1.021 | 1.015 | 1.009 | 1.008 | 1.014 | 1.020 | 1.019 | 1.018 | 1.017 | 1.019 | 1.016 | 1.015 | 1.014 | 1.012 |  |  |  |  |
| 63/60 | 1.014 | 1.020 | 1.013 | 1.012 | 1.008 | 1.016 | 1.015 | 1.021 | 1.015 | 1.018 | 1.016 | 1.020 | 1.015 | 1.010 | 1.010 |  |  |  |  |
| 66/63 | 1.023 | 1.016 | 1.010 | 1.012 | 1.015 | 1.013 | 1.015 | 1.022 | 1.019 | 1.018 | 1.017 | 1.015 | 1.010 | 1.009 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 69/66 | 1.025 | 1.013 | 1.006 | 1.008 | 1.016 | 1.018 | 1.015 | 1.023 | 1.017 | 1.017 | 1.015 | 1.014 | 1.010 | 1.008 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 72/69 | 1.020 | 1.009 | 1.007 | 1.009 | 1.015 | 1.010 | 1.014 | 1.015 | 1.013 | 1.014 | 1.012 | 1.011 | 1.010 | 1.007 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 75/72 | 1.015 | 1.008 | 1.006 | 1.008 | 1.010 | 1.009 | 1.012 | 1.012 | 1.011 | 1.018 | 1.013 | 1.008 | 1.006 | 1.002 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 78/75 | 1.012 | 1.012 | 1.008 | 1.012 | 1.010 | 1.011 | 1.018 | 1.013 | 1.012 | 1.012 | 1.010 | 1.008 | 1.008 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 81/78 | 1.006 | 1.006 | 1.006 | 1.009 | 1.010 | 1.014 | 1.018 | 1.017 | 1.016 | 1.009 | 1.009 | 1.005 | 1.006 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 84/81 | 1.008 | 1.006 | 1.009 | 1.014 | 1.009 | 1.007 | 1.012 | 1.011 | 1.008 | 1.010 | 1.008 | 1.007 | 1.005 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $87 / 84$ | 1.005 | 1.008 | 1.008 | 1.010 | 1.009 | 1.010 | 1.012 | 1.014 | 1.012 | 1.008 | 1.007 | 1.004 | 1.003 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 90/87 | 1.002 | 1.005 | 1.008 | 1.008 | 1.009 | 1.012 | 1.009 | 1.009 | 1.013 | 1.008 | 1.006 | 1.006 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 93/90 | 1.006 | 1.007 | 1.015 | 1.009 | 1.011 | 1.010 | 1.011 | 1.012 | 1.009 | 1.009 | 1.007 | 1.002 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 96/93 | 1.007 | 1.007 | 1.010 | 1.012 | 1.008 | 1.010 | 1.011 | 1.009 | 1.005 | 1.006 | 1.005 | 1.003 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

[^6]* Incurred medical loss development factors include the paid cost of medical cost containment programs for accident years 2011 and prior.


## Actuarial Committee

## Quarterly Paid Indemnity Loss Development Factors

Through March 31, 2017

| Age in | Accident Year |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Months | 1998 | 1999 | $\underline{2000}$ | $\underline{2001}$ | $\underline{2002}$ | $\underline{2003}$ | $\underline{2004}$ | $\underline{2005}$ | $\underline{2006}$ | $\underline{2007}$ | $\underline{2008}$ | $\underline{2009}$ | $\underline{2010}$ | 2011 | $\underline{2012}$ | $\underline{2013}$ | $\underline{2014}$ | $\underline{2015}$ | $\underline{2016}$ |
| 6/3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4.376 | 4.495 | 4.553 | 4.807 | 4.911 | 4.722 | 4.854 | 5.099 | 5.076 | 5.056 | 5.087 |
| 9/6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 2.259 | 2.375 | 2.377 | 2.398 | 2.452 | 2.432 | 2.484 | 2.462 | 2.462 | 2.484 | 2.456 |
| 12/9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.812 | 1.834 | 1.810 | 1.825 | 1.861 | 1.869 | 1.877 | 1.866 | 1.879 | 1.910 | 1.882 |
| 15/12 | 1.499 | 1.536 | 1.538 | 1.552 | 1.550 | 1.516 | 1.491 | 1.456 | 1.482 | 1.488 | 1.481 | 1.507 | 1.532 | 1.539 | 1.506 | 1.539 | 1.540 | 1.559 | 1.570 |
| 18/15 | 1.380 | 1.399 | 1.395 | 1.401 | 1.403 | 1.379 | 1.331 | 1.306 | 1.306 | 1.327 | 1.332 | 1.343 | 1.355 | 1.361 | 1.361 | 1.353 | 1.364 | 1.372 |  |
| 21/18 | 1.323 | 1.298 | 1.303 | 1.303 | 1.311 | 1.297 | 1.241 | 1.217 | 1.233 | 1.235 | 1.243 | 1.259 | 1.257 | 1.261 | 1.261 | 1.263 | 1.267 | 1.264 |  |
| 24/21 | 1.259 | 1.257 | 1.256 | 1.258 | 1.260 | 1.244 | 1.183 | 1.181 | 1.195 | 1.191 | 1.194 | 1.206 | 1.209 | 1.215 | 1.213 | 1.204 | 1.216 | 1.211 |  |
| $27 / 24$ | 1.186 | 1.199 | 1.203 | 1.200 | 1.205 | 1.186 | 1.140 | 1.142 | 1.151 | 1.149 | 1.153 | 1.162 | 1.165 | 1.168 | 1.164 | 1.159 | 1.170 | 1.177 |  |
| 30/27 | 1.157 | 1.161 | 1.165 | 1.175 | 1.172 | 1.161 | 1.122 | 1.117 | 1.126 | 1.129 | 1.130 | 1.141 | 1.141 | 1.137 | 1.134 | 1.141 | 1.147 |  |  |
| 33/30 | 1.118 | 1.125 | 1.130 | 1.142 | 1.136 | 1.123 | 1.097 | 1.096 | 1.100 | 1.101 | 1.108 | 1.114 | 1.116 | 1.112 | 1.111 | 1.111 | 1.115 |  |  |
| 36/33 | 1.102 | 1.103 | 1.103 | 1.115 | 1.111 | 1.097 | 1.085 | 1.081 | 1.080 | 1.084 | 1.092 | 1.094 | 1.098 | 1.091 | 1.091 | 1.096 | 1.092 |  |  |
| 39/36 | 1.074 | 1.081 | 1.081 | 1.092 | 1.087 | 1.072 | 1.070 | 1.066 | 1.064 | 1.067 | 1.074 | 1.078 | 1.077 | 1.073 | 1.075 | 1.074 | 1.075 |  |  |
| 42/39 | 1.067 | 1.071 | 1.077 | 1.080 | 1.073 | 1.063 | 1.059 | 1.058 | 1.058 | 1.062 | 1.067 | 1.067 | 1.071 | 1.070 | 1.065 | 1.064 |  |  |  |
| 45/42 | 1.057 | 1.054 | 1.063 | 1.064 | 1.056 | 1.049 | 1.047 | 1.049 | 1.047 | 1.051 | 1.058 | 1.059 | 1.057 | 1.055 | 1.054 | 1.052 |  |  |  |
| 48/45 | 1.049 | 1.050 | 1.055 | 1.053 | 1.046 | 1.044 | 1.041 | 1.044 | 1.043 | 1.047 | 1.049 | 1.051 | 1.050 | 1.048 | 1.048 | 1.048 |  |  |  |
| 51/48 | 1.039 | 1.038 | 1.043 | 1.044 | 1.036 | 1.035 | 1.033 | 1.036 | 1.036 | 1.037 | 1.042 | 1.042 | 1.043 | 1.039 | 1.038 | 1.038 |  |  |  |
| 54/51 | 1.035 | 1.038 | 1.036 | 1.037 | 1.034 | 1.035 | 1.030 | 1.028 | 1.035 | 1.036 | 1.038 | 1.041 | 1.038 | 1.036 | 1.036 |  |  |  |  |
| 57/54 | 1.029 | 1.033 | 1.037 | 1.030 | 1.028 | 1.026 | 1.025 | 1.028 | 1.030 | 1.032 | 1.033 | 1.033 | 1.032 | 1.033 | 1.028 |  |  |  |  |
| 60/57 | 1.025 | 1.030 | 1.027 | 1.026 | 1.024 | 1.024 | 1.024 | 1.024 | 1.028 | 1.029 | 1.029 | 1.032 | 1.027 | 1.030 | 1.028 |  |  |  |  |
| 63/60 | 1.023 | 1.026 | 1.024 | 1.021 | 1.022 | 1.019 | 1.019 | 1.021 | 1.023 | 1.025 | 1.025 | 1.024 | 1.026 | 1.025 | 1.025 |  |  |  |  |
| 66/63 | 1.023 | 1.023 | 1.023 | 1.021 | 1.019 | 1.019 | 1.019 | 1.020 | 1.025 | 1.025 | 1.025 | 1.025 | 1.023 | 1.022 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 69/66 | 1.019 | 1.021 | 1.020 | 1.017 | 1.016 | 1.017 | 1.016 | 1.021 | 1.020 | 1.020 | 1.020 | 1.022 | 1.020 | 1.019 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 72/69 | 1.018 | 1.016 | 1.018 | 1.016 | 1.016 | 1.015 | 1.017 | 1.015 | 1.020 | 1.019 | 1.019 | 1.019 | 1.019 | 1.018 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 75/72 | 1.015 | 1.016 | 1.015 | 1.014 | 1.012 | 1.012 | 1.013 | 1.015 | 1.019 | 1.018 | 1.016 | 1.016 | 1.017 | 1.015 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 78/75 | 1.014 | 1.014 | 1.012 | 1.013 | 1.012 | 1.011 | 1.012 | 1.015 | 1.017 | 1.016 | 1.015 | 1.016 | 1.016 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 81/78 | 1.013 | 1.013 | 1.011 | 1.012 | 1.011 | 1.010 | 1.012 | 1.015 | 1.015 | 1.016 | 1.015 | 1.015 | 1.013 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 84/81 | 1.011 | 1.011 | 1.013 | 1.010 | 1.010 | 1.009 | 1.011 | 1.013 | 1.015 | 1.014 | 1.013 | 1.012 | 1.013 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $87 / 84$ | 1.012 | 1.010 | 1.008 | 1.010 | 1.009 | 1.008 | 1.009 | 1.012 | 1.014 | 1.013 | 1.010 | 1.012 | 1.010 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 90/87 | 1.008 | 1.009 | 1.010 | 1.009 | 1.008 | 1.008 | 1.011 | 1.012 | 1.013 | 1.012 | 1.011 | 1.010 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 93/90 | 1.009 | 1.009 | 1.008 | 1.008 | 1.007 | 1.008 | 1.012 | 1.011 | 1.011 | 1.012 | 1.010 | 1.010 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 96/93 | 1.008 | 1.009 | 1.006 | 1.007 | 1.007 | 1.007 | 1.008 | 1.011 | 1.011 | 1.008 | 1.010 | 1.010 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Source: WCIRB acident year experience calls

## Actuarial Committee

## Quarterly Paid Medical Loss Development Factors *

Through March 31, 2017

| Age in | Accident Year |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Months | 1998 | 1999 | $\underline{2000}$ | $\underline{2001}$ | 2002 | $\underline{2003}$ | $\underline{2004}$ | $\underline{2005}$ | 2006 | $\underline{2007}$ | 2008 | 2009 | 2010 | 2011 | $\underline{2012}$ | $\underline{2013}$ | 2014 | 2015 | $\underline{2016}$ |
| 6/3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 5.308 | 5.615 | 6.579 | 6.101 | 6.048 | 5.854 | 5.989 | 6.284 | 5.604 | 5.720 | 5.897 |
| 9/6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 2.348 | 2.381 | 2.348 | 2.375 | 2.361 | 2.327 | 2.398 | 2.498 | 2.428 | 2.287 | 2.326 |
| 12/9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.716 | 1.765 | 1.731 | 1.723 | 1.756 | 1.746 | 1.763 | 1.736 | 1.750 | 1.705 | 1.752 |
| 15/12 | 1.453 | 1.490 | 1.514 | 1.547 | 1.554 | 1.510 | 1.437 | 1.423 | 1.429 | 1.444 | 1.413 | 1.429 | 1.445 | 1.472 | 1.446 | 1.443 | 1.460 | 1.454 | 1.479 |
| 18/15 | 1.241 | 1.267 | 1.286 | 1.310 | 1.330 | 1.295 | 1.243 | 1.230 | 1.227 | 1.259 | 1.243 | 1.259 | 1.268 | 1.282 | 1.284 | 1.263 | 1.265 | 1.278 |  |
| 21/18 | 1.164 | 1.168 | 1.192 | 1.219 | 1.211 | 1.179 | 1.153 | 1.151 | 1.163 | 1.173 | 1.170 | 1.178 | 1.182 | 1.187 | 1.192 | 1.193 | 1.192 | 1.189 |  |
| 24/21 | 1.132 | 1.124 | 1.149 | 1.159 | 1.154 | 1.125 | 1.115 | 1.118 | 1.127 | 1.133 | 1.132 | 1.137 | 1.144 | 1.153 | 1.154 | 1.148 | 1.146 | 1.146 |  |
| 27124 | 1.096 | 1.108 | 1.121 | 1.128 | 1.123 | 1.093 | 1.090 | 1.093 | 1.106 | 1.107 | 1.110 | 1.112 | 1.119 | 1.120 | 1.123 | 1.122 | 1.122 | 1.124 |  |
| 30/27 | 1.077 | 1.088 | 1.101 | 1.108 | 1.103 | 1.077 | 1.084 | 1.087 | 1.097 | 1.100 | 1.100 | 1.106 | 1.107 | 1.111 | 1.109 | 1.111 | 1.111 |  |  |
| 33/30 | 1.065 | 1.072 | 1.086 | 1.089 | 1.077 | 1.063 | 1.071 | 1.065 | 1.081 | 1.083 | 1.086 | 1.092 | 1.094 | 1.093 | 1.094 | 1.090 | 1.089 |  |  |
| 36/33 | 1.055 | 1.066 | 1.069 | 1.076 | 1.061 | 1.055 | 1.062 | 1.062 | 1.071 | 1.072 | 1.072 | 1.077 | 1.083 | 1.082 | 1.078 | 1.080 | 1.076 |  |  |
| 39/36 | 1.051 | 1.059 | 1.060 | 1.061 | 1.049 | 1.044 | 1.053 | 1.056 | 1.057 | 1.059 | 1.061 | 1.066 | 1.071 | 1.066 | 1.069 | 1.065 | 1.064 |  |  |
| 42/39 | 1.044 | 1.049 | 1.055 | 1.054 | 1.041 | 1.044 | 1.049 | 1.054 | 1.055 | 1.058 | 1.059 | 1.061 | 1.068 | 1.063 | 1.062 | 1.057 |  |  |  |
| 45/42 | 1.039 | 1.045 | 1.047 | 1.044 | 1.036 | 1.037 | 1.040 | 1.047 | 1.048 | 1.049 | 1.054 | 1.053 | 1.056 | 1.056 | 1.053 | 1.051 |  |  |  |
| 48/45 | 1.035 | 1.039 | 1.044 | 1.037 | 1.032 | 1.035 | 1.037 | 1.043 | 1.043 | 1.046 | 1.047 | 1.050 | 1.051 | 1.046 | 1.045 | 1.046 |  |  |  |
| 51/48 | 1.030 | 1.035 | 1.037 | 1.034 | 1.031 | 1.030 | 1.033 | 1.037 | 1.036 | 1.036 | 1.039 | 1.041 | 1.043 | 1.040 | 1.039 | 1.038 |  |  |  |
| 54/51 | 1.031 | 1.036 | 1.032 | 1.027 | 1.030 | 1.029 | 1.034 | 1.034 | 1.035 | 1.035 | 1.036 | 1.042 | 1.038 | 1.035 | 1.035 |  |  |  |  |
| 57/54 | 1.026 | 1.030 | 1.027 | 1.024 | 1.024 | 1.024 | 1.029 | 1.031 | 1.034 | 1.031 | 1.033 | 1.038 | 1.034 | 1.034 | 1.031 |  |  |  |  |
| 60/57 | 1.026 | 1.028 | 1.026 | 1.021 | 1.023 | 1.026 | 1.028 | 1.029 | 1.028 | 1.032 | 1.032 | 1.035 | 1.030 | 1.030 | 1.030 |  |  |  |  |
| 63/60 | 1.023 | 1.025 | 1.022 | 1.019 | 1.019 | 1.020 | 1.024 | 1.024 | 1.024 | 1.024 | 1.027 | 1.027 | 1.026 | 1.026 | 1.025 |  |  |  |  |
| 66/63 | 1.026 | 1.021 | 1.020 | 1.020 | 1.018 | 1.021 | 1.023 | 1.024 | 1.026 | 1.026 | 1.029 | 1.029 | 1.024 | 1.027 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 69/66 | 1.021 | 1.022 | 1.019 | 1.018 | 1.016 | 1.019 | 1.021 | 1.023 | 1.023 | 1.021 | 1.024 | 1.024 | 1.022 | 1.020 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 72/69 | 1.022 | 1.018 | 1.016 | 1.017 | 1.018 | 1.016 | 1.021 | 1.021 | 1.022 | 1.022 | 1.023 | 1.021 | 1.020 | 1.019 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 75/72 | 1.017 | 1.016 | 1.014 | 1.015 | 1.015 | 1.014 | 1.018 | 1.020 | 1.019 | 1.019 | 1.018 | 1.018 | 1.018 | 1.015 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 78/75 | 1.018 | 1.015 | 1.014 | 1.015 | 1.016 | 1.015 | 1.016 | 1.018 | 1.017 | 1.022 | 1.019 | 1.018 | 1.017 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 81/78 | 1.015 | 1.014 | 1.013 | 1.014 | 1.013 | 1.014 | 1.018 | 1.018 | 1.015 | 1.019 | 1.018 | 1.015 | 1.015 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 84/81 | 1.013 | 1.012 | 1.013 | 1.012 | 1.012 | 1.013 | 1.016 | 1.016 | 1.015 | 1.018 | 1.015 | 1.015 | 1.015 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $87 / 84$ | 1.013 | 1.011 | 1.010 | 1.012 | 1.012 | 1.012 | 1.014 | 1.013 | 1.015 | 1.017 | 1.013 | 1.013 | 1.012 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 90/87 | 1.013 | 1.012 | 1.011 | 1.013 | 1.012 | 1.013 | 1.015 | 1.013 | 1.015 | 1.013 | 1.013 | 1.012 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 93/90 | 1.011 | 1.010 | 1.011 | 1.012 | 1.011 | 1.013 | 1.013 | 1.012 | 1.014 | 1.014 | 1.013 | 1.011 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 96/93 | 1.010 | 1.010 | 1.008 | 1.010 | 1.010 | 1.009 | 1.013 | 1.015 | 1.016 | 1.011 | 1.012 | 1.010 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Source: WCIRB acident year experience calls

* Paid medical loss development factors include the paid cost of medical cost containment programs for accident years 2011 and prior.

Reported Indemnity Claim Count Development


Notes
All figures in each accident year contain information from the same combination of insurers, all of whom submitted complete data for all evaluations for that accident year. Therefore, each accident year may contain a different mix of insurers (ranging from $75 \%$ to $100 \%$ of the total California workers' compensation insured market measured using 2016 earned premium levels).

Quarterly Reported Indemnity Claim Count Development Factors

| Accident | Development |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Year | 3-6 | 6-9 | 9-12 | 12-15 | 15-18 | 18-21 | 21-24 | 24-27 | 27-30 | 30-33 | 33-36 | 36-39 | 39-42 | 42-45 | 45-48 |
| 2008 | 2.539 | 1.649 | 1.338 | 1.094 | 1.025 | 1.015 | 1.010 | 1.009 | 1.007 | 1.004 | 1.003 | 1.003 | 1.002 | 1.003 | 1.002 |
| 2009 | 2.668 | 1.680 | 1.381 | 1.109 | 1.036 | 1.021 | 1.012 | 1.009 | 1.007 | 1.007 | 1.004 | 1.004 | 1.003 | 1.003 | 1.002 |
| 2010 | 2.667 | 1.711 | 1.402 | 1.126 | 1.039 | 1.023 | 1.016 | 1.012 | 1.008 | 1.006 | 1.005 | 1.004 | 1.004 | 1.003 | 1.001 |
| 2011 | 2.666 | 1.729 | 1.416 | 1.129 | 1.042 | 1.028 | 1.019 | 1.010 | 1.011 | 1.006 | 1.004 | 1.005 | 1.003 | 1.003 | 1.002 |
| 2012 | 2.710 | 1.744 | 1.419 | 1.125 | 1.053 | 1.029 | 1.019 | 1.014 | 1.009 | 1.007 | 1.004 | 1.005 | 1.004 | 1.003 | 1.003 |
| 2013 | 2.819 | 1.744 | 1.425 | 1.138 | 1.044 | 1.028 | 1.016 | 1.011 | 1.010 | 1.006 | 1.005 | 1.004 | 1.003 | 1.002 | 1.002 |
| 2014 | 2.754 | 1.732 | 1.429 | 1.136 | 1.048 | 1.026 | 1.018 | 1.013 | 1.010 | 1.005 | 1.004 | 1.004 |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 2.829 | 1.740 | 1.419 | 1.140 | 1.048 | 1.026 | 1.017 | 1.014 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 2.757 | 1.705 | 1.421 | 1.148 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Reported Indemnity Claim Settlement Ratios

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months): |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Year | $\underline{3}$ | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | 39 | 51 | 63 | 75 | 87 | $\underline{99}$ | 111 | 123 | $\underline{135}$ | 147 | 159 | 171 | 183 | $\underline{195}$ |
| 1992 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 99.1\% |
| 1993 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 98.8\% | 98.9\% |
| 1994 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 98.4\% | 98.6\% | 98.8\% |
| 1995 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 97.8\% | 98.2\% | 98.4\% | 98.5\% |
| 1996 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 97.3\% | 97.7\% | 98.0\% | 98.2\% | 98.4\% |
| 1997 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 96.7\% | 97.2\% | 97.6\% | 97.8\% | 98.1\% | 98.2\% |
| 1998 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 95.5\% | 96.3\% | 96.8\% | 97.2\% | 97.5\% | 97.8\% | 98.1\% |
| 1999 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 94.3\% | 95.3\% | 96.0\% | 96.5\% | 97.0\% | 97.3\% | 97.7\% | 97.9\% |
| 2000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 92.1\% | 93.6\% | 94.8\% | 95.5\% | 96.2\% | 96.6\% | 97.2\% | 97.6\% | 97.8\% |
| 2001 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 88.4\% | 90.8\% | 92.5\% | 93.7\% | 94.6\% | 95.4\% | 96.1\% | 96.6\% | 97.0\% | 97.4\% |
| 2002 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 85.3\% | 88.7\% | 91.1\% | 92.6\% | 94.0\% | 94.9\% | 95.9\% | 96.5\% | 97.0\% | 97.4\% |  |
| 2003 |  |  |  |  |  | 80.4\% | 85.5\% | 88.7\% | 90.8\% | 92.6\% | 94.0\% | 95.3\% | 95.9\% | 96.5\% | 97.1\% |  |  |
| 2004 |  |  |  |  | 74.5\% | 81.5\% | 85.6\% | 88.5\% | 90.7\% | 92.5\% | 94.3\% | 95.4\% | 96.1\% | 96.8\% |  |  |  |
| 2005 |  |  |  | 66.3\% | 76.4\% | 82.1\% | 86.1\% | 89.0\% | 91.2\% | 93.3\% | 94.7\% | 95.7\% | 96.5\% |  |  |  |  |
| 2006 |  |  | 54.0\% | 67.6\% | 76.4\% | 82.4\% | 86.2\% | 89.1\% | 91.8\% | 93.5\% | 94.7\% | 95.8\% |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2007 |  | 35.0\% | 53.1\% | 66.3\% | 75.4\% | 81.2\% | 85.5\% | 89.4\% | 91.8\% | 93.6\% | 95.0\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2008 | 5.7\% | 34.7\% | 51.5\% | 64.6\% | 73.9\% | 80.6\% | 85.9\% | 89.5\% | 92.1\% | 94.0\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2009 | 5.8\% | 33.4\% | 49.7\% | 62.9\% | 72.9\% | 80.5\% | 85.7\% | 89.6\% | 92.2\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2010 | 5.7\% | 33.7\% | 50.3\% | 63.7\% | 74.8\% | 82.0\% | 87.2\% | 90.8\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2011 | 7.2\% | 34.1\% | 50.8\% | 65.3\% | 76.0\% | 83.3\% | 88.2\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2012 | 7.2\% | 34.1\% | 51.8\% | 66.7\% | 77.4\% | 84.5\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 8.6\% | 33.4\% | 52.9\% | 68.1\% | 79.1\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 6.6\% | 33.9\% | 54.0\% | 69.5\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 7.5\% | 34.6\% | 55.8\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 7.3\% | 36.6\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2017 | 7.4\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Notes | gures i <br> dent ye <br> red ma | each ac <br> r. Ther et meas | dent ye re, eac red using | contain acciden 2016 e | informatio year may ned prem | from th contain ium leve | same different ). | mbinatio mix of ins | of insur urers (ran | rs, all of ging from | whom sub $75 \%$ to | mitted co 00\% of th | mplete da e total | ta for all lifornia w | valuation orkers' co | s for that mpensat |  |

IV-A-50
WCIRB California®

Estimated Ultimate Indemnity Claim Settlement Ratios

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months): |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Year | $\underline{3}$ | 15 | $\underline{27}$ | 39 | 51 | 63 | 75 | 87 | $\underline{99}$ | 111 | 123 | $\underline{135}$ | 147 | $\underline{159}$ | 171 | 183 | $\underline{195}$ |
| 1992 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 99.0\% |
| 1993 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 98.6\% | 98.8\% |
| 1994 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 98.1\% | 98.4\% | 98.6\% |
| 1995 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 97.4\% | 97.8\% | 98.1\% | 98.3\% |
| 1996 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 97.0\% | 97.5\% | 97.8\% | 98.0\% | 98.3\% |
| 1997 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 96.4\% | 96.9\% | 97.3\% | 97.6\% | 97.8\% | 98.1\% |
| 1998 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 95.3\% | 96.0\% | 96.6\% | 97.0\% | 97.3\% | 97.6\% | 97.9\% |
| 1999 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 94.1\% | 95.1\% | 95.8\% | 96.3\% | 96.8\% | 97.1\% | 97.6\% | 97.8\% |
| 2000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 92.0\% | 93.4\% | 94.5\% | 95.3\% | 95.9\% | 96.4\% | 97.0\% | 97.4\% | 97.6\% |
| 2001 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 88.4\% | 90.7\% | 92.4\% | 93.5\% | 94.5\% | 95.2\% | 96.0\% | 96.5\% | 96.9\% | 97.3\% |
| 2002 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 85.4\% | 88.8\% | 91.1\% | 92.6\% | 93.8\% | 94.8\% | 95.8\% | 96.4\% | 96.9\% | 97.3\% |  |
| 2003 |  |  |  |  |  | 80.8\% | 85.7\% | 88.9\% | 90.9\% | 92.5\% | 93.9\% | 95.1\% | 95.8\% | 96.4\% | 96.9\% |  |  |
| 2004 |  |  |  |  | 74.8\% | 81.7\% | 85.7\% | 88.6\% | 90.7\% | 92.5\% | 94.2\% | 95.2\% | 96.0\% | 96.7\% |  |  |  |
| 2005 |  |  |  | 66.1\% | 76.2\% | 82.0\% | 85.9\% | 88.8\% | 91.0\% | 93.2\% | 94.5\% | 95.5\% | 96.3\% |  |  |  |  |
| 2006 |  |  | 53.3\% | 67.1\% | 76.0\% | 82.1\% | 85.9\% | 88.9\% | 91.6\% | 93.3\% | 94.6\% | 95.7\% |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2007 |  | 32.9\% | 51.8\% | 65.4\% | 74.8\% | 80.8\% | 85.2\% | 89.1\% | 91.5\% | 93.4\% | 94.9\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2008 | 0.8\% | 31.5\% | 49.5\% | 63.2\% | 73.0\% | 79.9\% | 85.4\% | 89.1\% | 91.8\% | 93.8\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2009 | 0.7\% | 29.5\% | 47.5\% | 61.5\% | 71.8\% | 79.8\% | 85.1\% | 89.2\% | 92.0\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2010 | 0.7\% | 29.7\% | 48.2\% | 62.3\% | 73.9\% | 81.5\% | 86.9\% | 90.4\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2011 | 0.8\% | 29.5\% | 48.3\% | 63.7\% | 74.9\% | 82.6\% | 87.7\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2012 | 0.8\% | 29.0\% | 49.3\% | 65.1\% | 76.3\% | 83.8\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2013 | 0.9\% | 28.9\% | 50.4\% | 66.5\% | 78.0\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2014 | 0.7\% | 29.1\% | 51.5\% | 67.8\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 0.8\% | 29.7\% | 53.1\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 0.8\% | 31.4\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2017 | 0.8\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Notes All figures in each accident year contain information from the same combination of insurers, all of whom submitted complete data for all evaluations for that accident year. Therefore, each accident year may contain a different mix of insurers (ranging from $75 \%$ to $100 \%$ of the total California workers' compensation insured market measured using 2016 earned premium levels).

## Quarterly Ultimate Settlement Ratios

| Accident | Evaluated as of (in months): |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Year | $\underline{3}$ | $\underline{6}$ | $\underline{9}$ | 12 | 15 | 18 | $\underline{21}$ | $\underline{24}$ | $\underline{27}$ | 30 | 33 | $\underline{36}$ | 39 | 42 | 45 | $\underline{48}$ |
| 2008 | 0.8\% | 5.5\% | 13.3\% | 23.0\% | 31.5\% | 37.6\% | 42.0\% | 45.9\% | 49.5\% | 53.2\% | 56.7\% | 60.2\% | 63.2\% | 65.9\% | 68.5\% | 70.9\% |
| 2009 | 0.7\% | 4.8\% | 12.3\% | 21.4\% | 29.6\% | 35.6\% | 39.9\% | 43.9\% | 47.5\% | 51.2\% | 54.9\% | 58.4\% | 61.4\% | 64.5\% | 67.0\% | 69.5\% |
| 2010 | 0.7\% | 4.8\% | 11.9\% | 21.0\% | 29.6\% | 35.5\% | 39.9\% | 44.2\% | 48.0\% | 51.9\% | 55.5\% | 59.0\% | 62.1\% | 65.4\% | 68.4\% | 71.2\% |
| 2011 | 0.8\% | 5.2\% | 12.0\% | 21.1\% | 29.5\% | 35.4\% | 40.0\% | 44.3\% | 48.2\% | 52.4\% | 56.3\% | 60.1\% | 63.4\% | 66.5\% | 69.5\% | 72.2\% |
| 2012 | 0.8\% | 4.9\% | 11.9\% | 20.8\% | 28.9\% | 35.4\% | 40.3\% | 45.0\% | 49.2\% | 53.4\% | 57.7\% | 61.5\% | 64.9\% | 68.1\% | 71.0\% | 73.8\% |
| 2013 | 0.9\% | 5.0\% | 11.5\% | 20.4\% | 28.9\% | 35.3\% | 40.7\% | 45.6\% | 50.2\% | 54.7\% | 58.7\% | 62.7\% | 66.3\% | 69.6\% | 72.6\% | 75.3\% |
| 2014 | 0.7\% | 4.6\% | 11.5\% | 20.4\% | 29.2\% | 35.9\% | 41.7\% | 46.7\% | 51.5\% | 56.0\% | 60.3\% | 64.2\% | 67.7\% |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 0.8\% | 4.7\% | 11.8\% | 20.6\% | 29.7\% | 37.0\% | 42.7\% | 47.9\% | 53.1\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 0.8\% | 5.0\% | 12.1\% | 21.6\% | 31.4\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2017 | 0.8\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Accident |  |  |  |  |  |  | uarterly | mental | ange |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Year | 3-6 | 6-9 | 9-12 | 12-15 | 15-18 | 18-21 | 21-24 | 24-27 | 27-30 | 30-33 | 33-36 | 36-39 | 39-42 | 42-45 | 45-48 |  |
| 2008 | 4.6\% | 7.8\% | 9.7\% | 8.5\% | 6.2\% | 4.4\% | 3.9\% | 3.6\% | 3.7\% | 3.5\% | 3.5\% | 2.9\% | 2.8\% | 2.6\% | 2.4\% |  |
| 2009 | 4.1\% | 7.5\% | 9.1\% | 8.2\% | 6.0\% | 4.3\% | 4.0\% | 3.6\% | 3.7\% | 3.7\% | 3.5\% | 3.0\% | 3.0\% | 2.5\% | 2.5\% |  |
| 2010 | 4.1\% | 7.1\% | 9.1\% | 8.6\% | 5.9\% | 4.3\% | 4.3\% | 3.9\% | 3.9\% | 3.6\% | 3.4\% | 3.1\% | 3.3\% | 3.0\% | 2.8\% |  |
| 2011 | 4.3\% | 6.8\% | 9.2\% | 8.3\% | 6.0\% | 4.5\% | 4.3\% | 3.9\% | 4.2\% | 3.9\% | 3.9\% | 3.3\% | 3.0\% | 3.0\% | 2.7\% |  |
| 2012 | 4.1\% | 7.0\% | 8.9\% | 8.1\% | 6.5\% | 4.9\% | 4.8\% | 4.2\% | 4.2\% | 4.2\% | 3.8\% | 3.4\% | 3.2\% | 2.9\% | 2.8\% |  |
| 2013 | 4.0\% | 6.5\% | 8.9\% | 8.5\% | 6.4\% | 5.4\% | 4.9\% | 4.6\% | 4.5\% | 4.1\% | 4.0\% | 3.6\% | 3.3\% | 3.0\% | 2.7\% |  |
| 2014 | 3.9\% | 6.8\% | 8.9\% | 8.8\% | 6.8\% | 5.7\% | 5.1\% | 4.7\% | 4.5\% | 4.3\% | 3.9\% | 3.5\% |  |  |  |  |
| 2015 | 3.8\% | 7.1\% | 8.9\% | 9.1\% | 7.3\% | 5.7\% | 5.2\% | 5.2\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2016 | 4.2\% | 7.1\% | 9.5\% | 9.8\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

## California Workers' Compensation Estimated Indemnity Claim Frequency by Accident Year


${ }^{[1]}$ The 2014-2015 estimate is based on partial year unit statistical data. The 2015-2016 and 2016-2017 estimates are based on comparison of claim counts based on WCIRB accident year experience as of March 31, 2017 relative to the estimated change in statewide employment. Prior years are based on unit statistical data.

Actuarial Committee
Meeting Agenda for June 16, 2017

## Item AC17-06-02

1/1/2018 Regulatory Filing - Experience Rating Plan Values

An analysis of the indicated policy year 2018 experience rating off-balance factor and the factors used to generate proposed policy year 2018 expected loss rates will be presented at the meeting.


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ "Combined" method applies the current claim settlement adjustment method to the unit statistical data for all injury types combined. The "Injury Type" method applies the current claim settlement method to each injury type and combines the adjusted losses used to calculate development. The "Partial Adjustment by Injury Type" method applies the current claim settlement method to Permanent Disability claims only and combines the adjusted losses with the reported (unadjusted) Temporary-Only and Medical-Only losses to calculate development.

[^1]:    ${ }^{1}$ "Combined" method applies the current claim settlement adjustment method to the unit statistical data for all injury types combined. The "Injury Type" method applies the current claim settlement method to each injury type and combines the adjusted losses used to calculate development. The "Partial Adjustment by Injury Type" method applies the current claim settlement method to Permanent Disability claims only and combines the adjusted losses with the reported (unadjusted) Temporary-Only and Medical-Only losses to calculate development.

[^2]:    * Shown for informational purposes only
    ** Paid medical for accident years 2011 and subsequent exclude the paid cost of medical cost containment programs (MCCP). Paid medical for accident years 2010 and prior include paid MCCP costs.

[^3]:    (d) The ULT/387Inc tail factor was calculated based on an inverse power curve fit to a six-year average of the 111-to-123 through 339 -to- 351 factors and extrapolated to 80 development years.

[^4]:    These factors are adjusted for the following impacts: (i) reduction of historical outstanding medical losses paid prior to January 1,2013 by the estimated $4.2 \%$ cost savings due to applicable SB 863 provisions; (ii) adjustment to historical outstanding medical losses paid prior to January 1,2014 by an estimated $2.1 \%$ decrease in costs, and losses paid prior to January 1, 2015 by an estimated $1.7 \%$ decrease in costs due to RBRVS.
    

[^5]:    * On-level medical to industry average filed pure premium ratios (see Exhibit 7.3)
    ** The $1 / 1 / 2019$ medical to industry average filed pure premium ratio was calculated based on separate frequency and severity trends applied to the 2015 and 2016 years.

[^6]:    Source: WCIRB acident year experience calls

