

# **Governing Committee**

# **Meeting Minutes**

DateTimeLocationStaff ContactApril 19, 20239:30 AMMicrosoft Teams WebinarKristen Marsh

1901 Harrison Street, 17th Floor • Oakland, CA 94612 • 415.777.0777 • Fax 415.778.7007 • www.wcirb.com • wcirb@wcirb.com

Released: May 12, 2023

#### **Insurer Members**

Everest National Insurance Company
Federal Insurance Company
Hartford Accident and Indemnity Company
Pacific Compensation Insurance Company
Preferred Employers Insurance Company
State Compensation Insurance Fund
Travelers Property Casualty Company of America
Zenith Insurance Company

#### **Public Members**

Lynne Davidson Diana Rich Jeremy Smith Mitch Steiger (did not attend)

# California Department of Insurance

Yvonne Hauscarriague\*
Brentley Yim

# **WCIRB**

Bill Mudge David Bellusci Andrea Coleman Roger Cottman Kristen Marsh Eric Riley

# **Public Members' Staff**

Mark Priven

## Counsel

Dan Brown, Eversheds Sutherland (US) LLP

\* Attended in person

# Represented by

David Sandler
Mary Beth Pittinger
Matthew Massaro
John Carey
John Bennett
Kenneth Van Laar
Eric Belk
Paul Ramont

### Representing

Insured Employers Insured Employers Organized Labor Organized Labor

#### Notice

The information in these Minutes was developed by the Workers' Compensation Insurance Rating Bureau of California (WCIRB) for the purpose of assisting the WCIRB Governing Committee. The WCIRB cannot make any guarantees if this information is used for any other purpose and the WCIRB shall not be liable for any damages, of any kind, whether direct, indirect, incidental, punitive or consequential, arising from the use of or reliance upon this information for any other purpose.

Released: May 12, 2023

© 2023 Workers' Compensation Insurance Rating Bureau of California. All rights reserved.

No part of this work may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including, without limitation, photocopying and recording, or by any information storage or retrieval system without the prior written permission of the Workers' Compensation Insurance Rating Bureau of California (WCIRB), unless such copying is expressly permitted in this copyright notice or by federal copyright law. No copyright is claimed in the text of statutes and regulations quoted within this work.

Each WCIRB member company, including any registered third party entities, (Company) is authorized to reproduce any part of this work solely for the following purposes in connection with the transaction of workers' compensation insurance: (1) as necessary in connection with Company's required filings with the California Department of Insurance; (2) to incorporate portions of this work, as necessary, into Company manuals distributed at no charge only to Company employees; and (3) to the extent reasonably necessary for the training of Company personnel. Each Company and all agents and brokers licensed to transact workers' compensation insurance in the state of California are authorized to physically reproduce any part of this work for issuance to a prospective or current policyholder upon request at no charge solely for the purpose of transacting workers' compensation insurance and for no other purpose. This reproduction right does not include the right to make any part of this work available on any website or any form of social media.

Workers' Compensation Insurance Rating Bureau of California, WCIRB, WCIRB California, WCIRB Connect, WCIRB Inquiry, WCIRB CompEssentials, X-Mod Direct, eSCAD, Comprehensive Risk Summary, X-Mods and More, Annual Business Comparative and the WCIRB California logo (WCIRB Marks) are registered trademarks or service marks of the WCIRB. WCIRB Marks may not be displayed or used in any manner without the WCIRB's prior written permission. Any permitted copying of this work must maintain any and all trademarks and/or service marks on all copies.

To seek permission to use any of the WCIRB Marks or any copyrighted material, please contact the WCIRB at customerservice@wcirb.com.

The meeting of the Governing Committee was called to order at 9:30 AM by Bill Mudge, WCIRB President and CEO. Following confirmation of a quorum and a reminder of the applicable antitrust restrictions, Mr. Mudge congratulated Everest National Insurance Company and Travelers Property Casualty Company of America on their re-election to the Committee as insurer members and Mitch Steiger and Diana Rich on their reappointment as Public Members of the Committee.

Released: May 12, 2023

\* \* \* \* \* \*

#### Item I

## **Confirmation of Governing Committee Chairperson**

Mr. Mudge advised the Committee that the first order of business was election of a new Chair of the Governing Committee. A motion was made, seconded and unanimously passed to elect Paul Ramont of Zenith Insurance Company to serve as the Committee's chair for a second two-year term.

#### Item II

#### **Approval of the Minutes**

The Minutes of the Governing Committee meeting held on February 8, 2023 were distributed to Committee members in advance of the meeting for review. As there was no discussion of or corrections to the Minutes, a motion was made, seconded and unanimously passed to adopt the Minutes as written.

#### Item III

## Additions to the Agenda

The Chair asked the Committee members and staff if there were any items to be added to the Agenda. Hearing none, the Chair accepted the Agenda as published.

#### Item IV

## **Ratification of Actions of WCIRB Committees**

The Minutes of the Actuarial Committee meetings held on December 6, 2022, December 8, 2022 and February 14, 2023 were provided to Committee members in advance of the meeting for review. As there were no questions or discussion regarding the information, a motion was made, seconded and unanimously passed to ratify the actions of the Actuarial Committee.

#### Item V-A

## September 1, 2023 Regulatory Filing (Oral Report)

WCIRB Senior Vice President and Chief Legal Officer Kristen Marsh reminded the Committee that, on February 27, 2023, the WCIRB submitted the September 1, 2023 Regulatory Filing to the California Department of Insurance (CDI). Ms. Marsh informed the Committee that the CDI is holding a public hearing on the Regulatory Filing on April 24, 2023. Upon receipt of the Decision on the Regulatory Filing, the WCIRB will begin publishing September 2023 experience modifications and update the California Workers' Compensation Uniform Statistical Reporting Plan—1995, Miscellaneous Regulations for the Recording or Reporting of Data—1995, and California Workers' Compensation Experience Rating Plan—1995 to reflect the changes approved by the Commissioner effective September 1, 2023.

#### Item V-B

## September 1, 2023 Pure Premium Rate Filing

WCIRB Executive Vice President and Deputy Chief Actuary Sean Cooper advised the Committee that the Actuarial Committee completed its review of the December 31, 2022 experience at the April 13, 2023 meeting. Mr. Cooper provided the Committee a summary of the Actuarial Committee's review and recommended methodologies with respect to the indicated September 1, 2023 pure premium rate level. The Actuarial Committee Agenda for the April 13, 2023 meeting was included in the Agenda.

Released: May 12, 2023

Mr. Cooper advised the Committee that the Actuarial Committee's recommended methodologies were generally consistent with those used in the September 1, 2022 Pure Premium Rate Filing. The Actuarial Committee's recommended methodologies, when applied to the statewide experience as of December 31, 2022, excluding COVID-19 claims, indicated a 0.3% increase to the statewide average approved September 1, 2022 advisory pure premium rate level.

Mr. Cooper began by noting that the Actuarial Committee's recommendations for the September 1, 2023 Pure Premium Rate Filing generally: (1) exclude the 2020 accident year experience and (2) base projections regarding loss and allocated loss adjustment expenses on non-COVID-19 claims experience. Mr. Cooper also noted that COVID-19 claims are not expected to have as large of an impact on policies incepting on or after September 1, 2023. As a result, the Committee was advised that the Actuarial Committee recommendation does not include a separate provision for the projected cost of COVID-19 claims.

Mr. Cooper summarized the key elements of the Actuarial Committee's review of December 31, 2022 experience and the following factors that resulted in an indicated net increase of 0.3% compared to the indicated 6.9% net increase, excluding COVID-19, in the September 1, 2022 filing: decreased loss development (-1.0%); updated wage growth forecasts (+0.5%); updated frequency trend (-1.5%); accident year 2022 loss emergence, with an extra year of trend (-2.0%); updated loss adjustment expense provisions (-2.0%); and an updated experience rating off-balance factor (-0.6%).

Throughout the presentation, Mark Priven, the consulting actuary to the Public Members of the Governing Committee, was asked to detail how his recommended methodologies differ from those recommended by the Actuarial Committee. Mr. Priven indicated that his recommended methodologies differ primarily based on his use of an average of incurred and paid loss development patterns to develop both indemnity and medical losses, lower frequency projections, and lower severity trends for both indemnity and medical. Mr. Priven noted that his indicated September 1, 2023 average pure premium rate level is an indicated 7.3% decrease to the statewide average approved September 1, 2022 advisory pure premium rate level, which is nearly 8% lower than the indication based on the recommendations of the Actuarial Committee.

Mr. Cooper also presented a summary of the recent COVID-19 claims experience, noting that COVID-19 claims represent a declining share of indemnity claim counts and of estimated ultimate incurred losses and loss adjustment expenses. Mr. Cooper advised the Committee that based on the modest number of COVID-19 claims filed over the last 12 months and declining COVID-19 claim severity, the Actuarial Committee did not recommend a separate provision to reflect expected COVID-19 claims in the September 1, 2023 advisory pure premium rates.

At the end of the presentation and discussion, the meeting was recessed to allow the Public Members to consult with Mr. Priven privately.

Following the break, a motion was made and seconded to make a September 1, 2023 pure premium rate filing reflecting the methodology recommended by the consulting actuary to the Public Members of the Committee. The motion failed by a vote of three in favor and eight against with one member absent.

Following the failed motion, another motion was made and seconded to make a September 1, 2023 pure premium rate filing reflecting the methodology recommended by the Actuarial Committee. The motion was passed with eight in favor, three opposed and one member absent.

Released: May 12, 2023

## Item VII

## **Next Meeting Date**

The Chair noted that the next meeting is scheduled for September 27, 2023.

## Item VIII

## Adjournment

There being no further business to come before the Committee, the meeting was adjourned at 10:45 AM.

\* \* \* \* \* \*

Note to Committee Members: These Minutes, as written, have not been approved. Please refer to the Minutes of the meeting scheduled for September 27, 2023 for approval and/or modification.